The Jew at War, Week 5: Women and the Military

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com



Hmmm....

1. Proclamation of Israeli Rabbis, 1953

http://www.chareidi.org/archives5765/MSH65features.htm

Since we have already stated our position, daas Torah, regarding the draft of girls, which is an accessory to one of the three cardinal sins... and since the government stands to institute a law obligating Jewish daughters by force to present themselves for the draft of civil national service outside the framework of the military, we therefore publicly state our position and halachic ruling that this prohibition against the mobilization of women refers also to Sherut Leumi [civil national service] in its full severity.

2. Judges 4:8-9 (modified JPS translation)

And Barak said to her: If you will go with me then I will go; if you will not go with me, I will not go. And she said: I will surely go with you, but your glory will not come from the path you travel. Gd will sell Sisera into the hands of a woman.

Do I trust the people who are running the army?

3. Song of Songs 2:7

I have made you swear, daughters of Jerusalem... lest you awaken and lest you arouse the love when you desire it.

Talmud, Ketuvot 111a

What is the purpose of these three oaths? That the Jews should not ascend as a wall, that the Jews should not rebel against the nations, and that the nations should not overly oppress the Jews.

5. Talmud Yerushalmi, Chagigah 1:7

The sages entered one place and did not find teachers or students. They instructed, "Bring us the city guardians!" The people brought the city sentries. They said to them, "These are the city guardians?! These are only the destroyers of the city!" The people replied, "Who are the city guardians?" They said to them, "The teachers and students."

- 6. Rabbi Elchanan Wasserman, Open Letter to the leadership of Poalei Agudat Yisrael, 1934 It is known to all that the leadership of this organization [Histadrut] has set a goal of uprooting the Torah from its root with a mighty hand, and educating and raising a new nation of Israel in place of the old nation of Israel... It is clear that one may not join with them in any sort of union. Even living in their neighbourhood is prohibited; woe to the wicked and woe to his neighbour!
- 7. Kipa, The Chief Rabbi of the IDF has ruled: Soldiers will eat foreign produce, not heter mechirah http://www.kipa.co.il/now/58779.html, Sept. 18 2014

About a month ago, Chief Rabbi of the IDF Rafi Peretz announced his intention of changing IDF policy, and that the army would acquire foreign fruits and vegetables in the coming *shemitah* year, out of consideration for *charedim* serving in the army. The Ministry of Agriculture expressed outrage at the decision, which would cause a meaningful loss for farmers and the State... In addition to the meaningful budgetary hit, one must add the reality that the Religious Zionist community, ideologically, prefers to use the *heter mechirah*...

The Ministry of Defence responded, "The information is not correct. We are speaking of one contract of 30 million shekel for the first half of the shemitah year, and the majority will be vegetables sourced from Israeli farmers...."

Is the battlefield a place for Jewish women?

8. Talmud, Kiddushin 2b

It is the manner of a man to wage war; it is not the manner of a woman to wage war.

9. Rabbi Tzvi Yehudah Kook on Talmud, Yevamot 65b (footnote 124 to שיחות הרב צבי יהודה, פר' כי תצא)
It is not that she is prohibited by statute of Torah and commandment, but by her nature and normal conduct.

- 10. Charlotte Krolokke and Anne S. Sorensen, *Gender Communication Theories and Analyses*In itself diverse and chaotic, third-wave feminism is consequently not one, but many. The common denominator is the will to redefine feminism... The primary principles... are defined as the right (a) to define one's own identity and to expect society to respect it, and (b) to make decisions regarding one's own body... that individuals should be given the freedom to construct their own gender identities as they see fit, and that neither the medical establishment nor cultural institutions at large should intervene. Finally, they resist essentialist notions of identity in particular.
- 11. Eetta Prince-Gibson, *Religious Leaders Attack IDF on the Gender Battlefield*, Jerusalem Post Service http://www.jweekly.com/article/full/15267/religious-leaders-attack-idf-on-the-gender-battlefield/

Moreover, said Rabbi Eliezer Sadan, head of the pre-military yeshiva in Eli, placing women in combat units violates their nature. "Women have wonderful qualities. It is their nature to nurture and to produce life. The army is ugly and powerful, and war is painful. We must protect women from the army. In the War of Independence, we had no choice and women had to serve. Today, thank G-d, we have a choice, so we must not teach women to kill. It will damage their souls." [Naomi] Chazan, a Meretz member, responded angrily: "Who are you to decide that? Let every woman decide what her nature is!"

Is the battlefield safe for interaction between genders?

12. H. Patricia Hynes, Military Sexual Abuse: A Greater Menace Than Combat, Truthout http://truth-out.org/news/item/6299:military-sexual-abuse-a-greater-menace-than-combat

Women in the military are raped and sexually assaulted at significantly higher rates than in civilian society. A 2003 study of women seeking health care through the VA from the period of the Vietnam war through the first Gulf War found that nearly 1 in 3 women was raped while serving - almost twice the rate of rape in US society - and that 8 in 10 women had been sexually harassed during their military service. Rates were consistent through all periods and wars studied. Of those who reported having been raped, 37 percent were raped at least twice and 14 percent were gang-raped.

What's often overlooked in these statistics is that the reported prevalence of rape in the military is based on a period of 2-6 years in military service, whereas the sexual assault of women in civilian society (nearly 1 in 5) is based on lifetime prevalence - signifying an *even more concentrated culture* of sexual assault and a higher threat for active-duty military women from fellow soldiers...

In the spring of 2011, the Air Force released results from a survey of sexual assault conducted by Gallup of nearly 20,000 male and female "airmen" (sic). Nearly 1 in 5 women reported being sexually assaulted while in the service, with most of the perpetrators being men in the Air Force.

13. Erin Solaro, An Unabashed Feminist Writes About Women in the Military http://www.pbs.org/pov/regardingwar/conversations/women-and-war/introductions-an-unabashed-feminist-writes-about-women-in-the-military.php

I am an overt and unabashed feminist: I believe women have the same civic and human worth men do. Part of that worth is the right — and the responsibility — to bear arms in the common defense (of which military service is only one part). We — women — live here too, and we are equal in all things, not just the good things of civilization. The military is also an important part of society: at its best, it is the honorable profession of arms. It is utterly imperative that women be part of it. It is our military, our society, our world, and the outcome of this odd, utterly real, botched-beyond-belief war we are fighting with radical fundamentalist Islam is important to us... Then there is the simple fact that if women are marginalized in the military and defense and foreign policy, so are our needs, our experiences and perspectives. That women, like men, are individuals neither changes the fact that there are specifically female needs, experiences, and perspectives nor the reality that when half the population is systematically excluded from and marginalized in an institution — any institution — that institution is necessarily warped. And that is a bad thing: for society, the institution and for women in general.