# Hiddur vs. κάλλος: Chanukah's Competing Concepts of Beauty

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

# Two minds regarding Beauty?

# 1. Shemuel I 16:6-7

ויהי בבואם וירא את אליאב ויאמר אך נגד ד' משיחו: ויאמר יקוק אל שמואל אל תבט אל מראהו ואל גבה קומתו כי מאסתיהו כי לא אשר יראה האדם כי האדם יראה לעינים וד' יראה ללבב:

When they came, he saw Eliav and said, 'Gd's anointed one is before Him!' And Gd said to Shemuel, 'Do not look at his appearance and height, for I have rejected him. It is not as Man sees it; Man sees to the eyes, but Gd sees to the heart.'

#### 2. Mishlei 31:30

שקר החן והבל היפי אשה יראת יקוק היא תתהלל:

Charm is false and beauty is empty; a woman who is in awe of Gd is to be praised.

#### 3. Talmud, Bava Batra 58a

הכל בפני שרה כקוף בפני אדם שרה בפני אדם חוה בפני אדם חוה בפני אדם חוה בפני אדם אדם בפני שכינה כקוף בפני אדם אדם אדם הכל בפני שרה בפני אדם חוה כקוף בפני אדם חוה כקוף בפני אדם חוה People compared to Sarah are as a monkey compared to a person. Sarah compared to Chavah is as a monkey compared to a person. Adam before the Shechinah is as a monkey compared to a person.

#### Hiddur vs. κάλλος

# 4. Talmud, Menachot 28b

שפודים של ברזל היו וחיפום בבעץ העשירו עשאום של כסף חזרו והעשירו עשאום של זהב

The branches of their menorah were iron rods, and the Chashmonaim coated them with tin. When they became wealthier, they made the branches of silver. When they became still wealthier, they made the branches of gold.

# 5. Masechet Sofrim 20

ואסור להדליק בנר ישן, ואם אין לו אלא ישן, מלבנו באור יפה יפה ומותר.

One may not light an old lamp; one who only has an old lamp may whiten it well in fire, and that is permitted.

# 6. Talmud, Shabbat 21a

מצות חנוכה נר איש וביתו והמהדרין נר לכל אחד ואחד והמהדרין מן המהדרין בית שמאי אומרים יום ראשון מדליק שמנה מכאן ואילך פוחת והולך ובית הלל אומרים יום ראשון מדליק אחת מכאן ואילך מוסיף והולך

The mitzvah of Chanukah is for each family to light one lamp. Those who beautify light one lamp for each individual. According to Beit Shammai, those who beautify still more light eight lamps on the first day, and then reduce by one per day. According to Beit Hillel, they light one lamp on the first day, and then increase by one per day.

# 7. Tosafot Shabbat 21b והמהדרין

והמהדרין מן המהדרין – נראה לר"י דב"ש וב"ה לא קיימי אלא אנר איש וביתו שכן יש יותר הידור דאיכא היכרא כשמוסיף והולך או מחסר שהוא כנגד ימים הנכנסים או היוצאים אבל אם עושה נר לכל אחד אפי' יוסיף מכאן ואילך ליכא היכרא שיסברו שכך יש בני אדם ררית

It appears to Rabbeinu Yitzchak that Beit Shammai and Beit Hillel (candles-per-night) refer only to the candle-per-household approach, so that this would provide greater beauty...

# 8. Rashi Shabbat 21b והמהדרין

והמהדרין – אחר המצות – עושין נר אחד בכל לילה לכל אחד ואחד מבני הבית.

Those who pursue mitzvot use one lamp each night for each member of the household.

# 9. Jowett translation of Phaedrus 247C-D

There abides the very being with which true knowledge is concerned: a reality which is colorless, formless, intangible, visible only to mind, the pilot of the soul ... she beholds justice and temperance and gains knowledge absolute, not that which is found, in varying forms in one or other of those regions of becoming which we men call real, but real knowledge really present where true being is.

# 10. Jowett translation of Phaedrus 248C-D

[T]he soul which has seen most of truth shall be placed in the seed from which a philosopher or lover of beauty and follower of the Muses will spring; that which has seen truth in the second degree shall be some righteous king or warrior chief; the soul which is of the third rank shall be a politician, or business manager or trader; the fourth shall be a lover of gymnastic toils, or a physician; the fifth shall lead the life of a prophet or seer; to the sixth the character of a poet or some other imitative artist will be assigned; to the seventh the life of an artisan or husbandman; to the eighth that of a sophist or demagogue; to the ninth that of a tyrant; – all these lives are states of probation, in which he who does righteously improves, and he who does unrighteously deteriorates, his lot.

# 11. Jowett translation of Phaedrus 249D-251A

When he sees any earthly beauty is transported with the recollection of the true beauty; he would like to fly away but he cannot; he is like a bird fluttering and looking upward and careless of the world below; and he is therefore thought to be mad. And I have shown this of all inspirations to be the noblest and highest and the offspring of the highest; that it is recognized to be such by him who has or shares in it; and that he who loves the beautiful is called a lover because he partakes of it. For, as has been already said, every soul of man has in the way of nature beheld the true being; this was the condition of her passing into the form of man. But all souls do not easily recall the things of the other world; they may have seen them for a short time only, or they may have been unfortunate in their earthly lot, and, having had their hearts turned to unrighteousness through some corrupting influence, they may have lost the memory of the holy things which once they saw. Only a few retain an adequate remembrance of them; and they, when they behold here any image of that other world, are rapt with amazement; but they are ignorant of what this rapture means, because they do not clearly perceive it for what it is. For there is no radiance in our earthly copies of justice or temperance or those other things which are precious to souls: they are seen through a glass dimly; and there are few who, going to the images, behold in them the realities, and these do it only with difficulty.

12. Nehamas translation of Plato's *Symposium*, 211D Only in the contemplation of beauty is human life worth living.