**Job, Week 63: Chapter 42: Who Won?**

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

* + - 1. **Carol Newsom, The Book of Job: A Contest of Moral Imaginations, pg. 30**

And even though G-d rebukes the friends (42:8-9), the narrative conclusion in 42:10-17 seems a wink of the polyphonic author behind G-d’s back, validating the friends’ claims, since the story ends just as they said it would.

**42:1-6 Job responds to Gd**

* + - 1. **Rashi to 42:3**

אשר העלים וכסה עצתו ונפלאותיו של הקב"ה בבלי דעת...

He concealed and hid Divine counsel and wonders, due to ignorance…

* + - 1. **Rashi to 38:2**

ואיוב ענהו "מי זה מעלים עצה" אילו הייתי יודע עצתך לא הייתי מרבה בדברים, והקב"ה השיבו והלא אברהם לא היה יודע ועמד בעשר!

Job replied, “Who is this who conceals counsel” – Had I known Your counsel, I would not have increased my words. To which Gd replied, “Avraham did not know, and he withstood ten [tests]!”

* + - 1. **Dust and ash?**
* I regret my words, sitting here in shame-filled dust and ash
* I would like to be converted to dust and ash, due to my hubris (Rashi)
* I regret my words, because I am dust and ash (Ibn Ezra)
* I don’t mind having sat in dust and ash, as it earned me this revelation (Metzudat David)

**42:7-9 Gd addresses the visitors**

* + - 1. **Ibn Ezra to 42:7**

שהודה ואמר ונחמתי

For he admitted, and said, “I regret it.”

* + - 1. **Rashi, based on Talmud, Bava Batra 16b**

הוא לא פשע בי כי אם על אשר אמר "תם ורשע הוא מכלה,"... ואם הוסיף לדבר מפני קושי יסורין אשר כבדו וחזקו עליו דבר. אבל אתם פשעתם על אשר הרשעתם אותו... והתחזקתם אותו בחזקת רשע ולבסוף הייתם משותקים ומנוצחים לפניו, והיה לכם לנחמו כאשר עשה אליהוא. ולא די לאיוב בצרתו ויסוריו, כי גם הוספתם על חטאתיכם פשע להקניטו.

He did not sin against Me other than by saying, “He destroys complete and wicked”… And if he added words, he spoke because of the harsh suffering which weighed on him and overpowered him. But you sinned when you declared him wicked… And you strengthened him in his wickedness, and in the end you were silenced and defeated before him, and you should have comforted him as Elihu did. And not only did Job experience pain and suffering, but you added iniquity to your sin by angering him.

* + - 1. **The target of anger** 19:11; 32:2-3; 42:7
      2. **Seven and seven** Bamidbar 23:1; Job 1:5; Chronicles I 15:26; Chronicles II 29:20-25
      3. **Rabbi Yosef Soloveitchik, Kol Dodi Dofek** <http://www.daat.ac.il/daat/vl/koldodidofek/koldodidofek01.pdf>
      4. **Talmud, Bava Kama 92a**

א"ל רבא לרבה בר מרי: מנא הא מילתא דאמור רבנן 'כל המבקש רחמים על חבירו והוא צריך לאותו דבר הוא נענה תחילה'? א"ל דכתיב "וד' שב את שבות איוב בהתפללו בעד רעהו."...

Rava asked Rabbah bar Mari: What is the basis for the sages’ saying, “All who pray for mercy for others, while needing the same thing, will be answered [for their own needs] first”? He replied with Job 42:10…

**42:10-17 Job is restored**

* + - 1. **Ibn Ezra to 42:10**

שבות איוב - שהיה נשבה ביד השטן הוציאו מרשותו:

“The captivity of Job” – which was held by the Satan; He now removed it from him.

* + - 1. **Rashi to 42:14**

ימימה - צחה ומלובנה כיום: קציעה - ריחה נודף ערב ומבושם כקציעה של בשם: קרן הפוך - על שם הקרן שנותנין בו כחול ובורית שנאמר "ותקרעי בפוך עיניך" (ירמי' ד:ל)

*Yamimah* – pure and white, like day. *Ketziah* – her fragrance wafted, sweet and spiced, like the *ketziah* spice. *Keren haPuch* – for the horn in which they place alcohol dye and borit, as in Jeremiah 4:30.

* + - 1. **Talmud, Bava Batra 16b**

'ימימה' שהיתה דומה ליום, 'קציעה' שהיה ריחה נודף כקציעה, 'קרן הפוך' אמרי דבי רבי שילא שדומה לקרנא דקרש. מחייכו עלה במערבא: קרנא דקרש לקותא היא! אלא אמר רב חסדא: ככורכמא דרישקא במיניה, שנאמר "כי תקרעי בפוך (ירמי' ד:ל)."

*Yamimah* for she resembled the day, *Ketziah* for her fragrance wafted like *ketziah*, *Keren haPuch* as they said in the yeshiva of Rabbi Shila, that she resembled the horn of the *keresh* [animal]. They laughed at this in Israel; the horn of the *keresh* is considered ugly! Rather, Rav Chisda said: Like garden saffron, as in Jeremiah 4:30.

* + - 1. **When Iyov Left Egypt**  http://www.yutorah.org/lectures/lecture.cfm/855411
      2. **Carol Newsom, The Book of Job: A Contest of Moral Imaginations, pg. 257-258**

When the prose tale was taken on its own, the renewal it depicted was a triumphant expression of its confidence in the possibility of a moral and material wholeness in life. By being interrupted, however, and reappearing after the divine speeches, the end of the prose tale loses the monologic quality it possessed… the divine speeches encourage another reading of it as a posttragic epilogue to the whole book, one in which the goodness of life in all its fragility is embraced…

Not only the ostrich but several of the animals are said to laugh… Theirs is a defiant laughter, heedless of danger. They lack the capacity for tragedy. Their limits in the world are not tragic ones. But can the tragic Job be said to laugh? That depends on how one construes the enigmatic information – strangely gratuitous information – about Job’s naming of his daughters with the names of nature’s beauty (“dove”), of sensuous beauty (“cinnamon”) and of erotic beauty (“horn of eye shadow”) and endowing them with his own substance as an inheritance. Such playful names are a form of laughter – not heedless or anarchic laughter but human and therefore tragic laughter.

* + - 1. **Two interesting additional books** Rabbi Shimon Schwab, Rabbi Moshe Eisenmann