



# When Succot was Postponed

Ezer Diena, [ediena@torontotorah.com](mailto:ediena@torontotorah.com)



This event is dedicated in memory of Ben Lax ז"ל, דב בן מרדכי ז"ל, by his loving family

This shiur is dedicated by:

- Abraham Freilich in honour of Rabbi Sammy Bergman and his wonderful family and in appreciation for what the Kollel has done for the people of Toronto
  - Judith Todd-Habot and Juda Habot. Keep up the great programming. Much appreciated!
- Esther and Bob Libman in honour of Rabbi Torczyner for his amazing teaching and commitment to our Torah learning. Yasher koach.
- Carla and Jules Sulzbach to express their appreciation for the amazing teaching of Rabbi Mordechai Torczyner
- Caren and Rabbi Mordechai Torczyner in honour of Jeanette Adams, and the Sgan and Avreichim of our Beit Midrash

For another “postponed” Succot, see Melachim Aleph 12, especially verses 32-33.

When you get bored with “Tishrei” in a day...

## 1. Beit Yosef, Orach Chaim 670

...למה קבעו שמנה ימים דכיון דשמן שבפך היה בו כדי להדליק לילה אחת ונמצא שלא נעשה הנס אלא בשבעה לילות.

Why did they establish [Chanukah for] eight days – since the oil in the jug was enough to light for one night, it turns out that the miracle only happened for seven nights!

## 2. Aruch Hashulchan, Orach Chaim 670:5

ועוד טעם לזה מבואר בספר חשמונאי לפי שע"י הגזרות בטלו אז מלהקריב בחג הסוכות העבר ובשמיני עצרת ולכן לזכרון זה עשו שמנה ימים חנוכה וממילא כשהראו להם מן השמים הנס של הדלקה הראו שהסכימו על ידם לעשות שמנה ימים.

Another reason for this is explained in the book of Chashmonai, that due to the decrees, they were unable to bring sacrifices on the previous Succot and Shemini Atzeret, and therefore, as a remembrance for this, they established 8 days of Chanukah, and when the miracle of the lighting was shown to them from Heaven, it showed that [G-d] agreed with their decision to make it 8 days.

## 3. Table 1 from The Connection Between Succos and Chanukah, Chaya Diena

Chanukah	חנוכה	Succos	סוכות
8 Days long, full Hallel		8 Days long, full Hallel	
Menorah must be placed no higher than 20 Amos		Sechach must be placed no higher than 20 Amos	
Menorah being lit for 8 days was one of the miracles of Chanukah		Menorahs were lit at the Simchas Beis Hashoevah to celebrate	
We strive to do the Mitzvah “Mehadrin Min Hamehadrin”		We must take a “Pri Eitz Hadar”	
According to Beis Shammai, we decrease the number of candles we light each day		The Gemara explains that Beis Shammai follows the “Parei Hachag”, the Parim (bulls) brought as Korbanos on Sukkos, which decrease in number each day	
Bikkurim may be brought until Chanukah		Bikkurim may be brought and the Parsha of Bikkurim may be read until Succos	

Looking at Aruch Hashulchan’s likely source

## 4. Selections from Makkabim Bet (NETS translation)

**1:8-9:** ...We prayed to the Lord and were heard, and we offered sacrifice and grain offering, and we lit the lamps and set out the loaves. And now see that you keep the days of the feast of tent pitching in the month of Chuseleu.

**1:18:** Since we intend to celebrate the purification of the temple on the twenty-fifth of Chuseleu, we thought it necessary to notify you in order that you also may celebrate it, as the feast of tent-pitching and of the fire, given when Neemias, who built both the temple and the altar and offered sacrifices.

**10:6-8:** They celebrated it for eight days with rejoicing, in the manner of coverters, remembering how not long before,

during the feast of tents, they had been inhabiting the mountains and caves like wild animals. Therefore, carrying ivy-wreathed wands and beautiful branches and also fronds of palm, they offered hymns of thanksgiving to him who had given success to the purifying of his own holy place. They decreed by public ordinance and by vote that the whole nation of the Judeans should observe these days every year.

What can we learn from this, and is there a deeper connection to Succot?

### 5. Talmud Bavli, Shabbat 21b (modified Davidson Edition translation)

מאי חנוכה? דתנו רבנן: בכ"ה בכסליו יומי דחנוכה תמניא אינון דלא למספד בהון ודלא להתענות בהון. שפשינכנסו יוניים להיכל טמאו כל השמנים שבהיכל. וכשגברה מלכות בית חשמונאי ונצחום, בדקו ולא מצאו אלא פד אחד של שמן שהיה מונח בחותמו של פה גדול, ולא היה בו אלא להדליק יום אחד. נעשה בו גס והדליקו ממנו שמונה ימים. לשנה אחרת קבעום ופעשאוים ימים טובים בהלל והודאה.

What is Hanukkah? The Sages taught: On the twenty-fifth of Kislev, the days of Hanukkah are eight. One may not eulogize on them and one may not fast on them. When the Greeks entered the Sanctuary they defiled all the oils that were in the Sanctuary by touching them. And when the Hasmonean monarchy overcame them and emerged victorious over them, they searched and found only one cruse of oil that was placed with the seal of the High Priest, and there was sufficient oil there to light the candelabrum for only one day. A miracle occurred and they lit the candelabrum from it eight days. The next year the Sages instituted those days and made them holidays with recitation of hallel and special thanksgiving in prayer and blessings.

### 6. Talmud Bavli, Succah 11b (Davidson Edition translation)

דתניא (ויקרא כג, מג) כי בסוכות הושבתי את בני ישראל ענני כבוד היו דברי ר' אליעזר ר"ע אומר סוכות ממש עשו להם

As it is taught in a baraita that the verse states: "I made the children of Israel to reside in sukkot"; these booths were clouds of glory, this is the statement of Rabbi Eliezer. Rabbi Akiva says: They established for themselves actual sukkot.

### 7. Rashi to Succah 11b

ענני כבוד היו - סוכות שאמר הכתוב שהושיבם במדבר: סוכות ממש - מפני החמה בשעת חנייתן היו עושים סכות:

These were the clouds of glory – the booths that the verse said that He housed them in in the desert. Literal booths – because of the sun, they would build booths wherever they camped.

### 8. Yirmiyahu 2:2 (Alhatorah translation)

הלך וקראת באזני ירושלים לאמר כה אמר יי' זכרתי לך תסוד נעורייך אהבת כלולתיך לכתף אחרי במדבר בארץ לא זרועה:

Go, and cry in the ears of Jerusalem, saying: Thus saith the Lord: I remember for thee the affection of thy youth, The love of thine espousals; How thou wentest after Me in the wilderness, In a land that was not sown.

### 9. Tur, Orach Chaim 625

ואע"פ שיצאנו ממצרים בחדש ניסן לא צונו לעשות סוכה באותו הזמן לפי שהוא ימות הקיץ ודרך כל אדם לעשות סוכה לצל ולא היתה ניכרת עשייתנו בהם שהם במצות הבורא יחברך ולכן צוה אותנו שנעשה בחדש השביעי שהוא זמן הגשמים ודרך כל אדם לצאת מסוכתו ולישב בביתו... And even though we left Egypt in the month of Nissan, He did not command us to make a succah at that time, since those are the days of summer, and it is the way of all people to make a succah for shade, and it would not be recognizable that the making of them is due to the commandment of the Creator, may He be blessed. Therefore, he commanded us to make them in the 7<sup>th</sup> month, which is the time of rain [winter], and the way of every person it to leave their succah and sit in their house...

### 10. Tosfot to Succah 2a, s.v. ki avid

...אמאי אמר (תענית דף ב.) גשמים סימן קללה בחג והלא יכול לקבוע הנסרים במסמרים שלא ירדו גשמים בסוכה... מ"מ בסככה שעיקר הסוכה על שם הסכך לא מיתכשרה עד דעביד לה עראי

...why does it then say that rain is a bad omen on Succot? He can hammer the boards in with nails so that rain cannot fall in the succah? ...Nevertheless, for the schach, since the main part of the succah [is] the schach, it is not kosher until it is made in a temporary fashion.