Introduction to Jewish Bioethics #2: Abortion / Cosmetic Surgery

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com



YESHIVA UNIVERSITY TORAH MITZION BEIT MIDRASH

Abortion, continued

1. Rabbi Eliezer Waldenberg (20th century Israel), Tzitz Eliezer 9:51:3

Or, perhaps when Tosafot says one may kill [the fetus], he means one is not liable at all under the law of murder, but Tosafot agrees that it is prohibited as wounding, and therefore one may not kill it without another human need.

- 2. Rabbi Moshe Feinstein (20th century USA), Igrot Moshe Choshen Mishpat 2:69:2 Killing a fetus is prohibited until the doctors have great reason, close to certainty, that the mother will die. Since the permission is due to the fetus's status as a pursuer, it must be near-certain that he is a pursuer.
- 3. Rabbi Eliezer Waldenberg (20th century Israel), Tzitz Eliezer 13:102
 It is clear and obvious as law that a Jew is not killed for [aborting] a fetus. Aside from one view, the authorities rule that there is a prohibition, but many authorities believe that this prohibition is rabbinic, or it is under "building the world."
 But there is no concern for destroying a life, and therefore Maharit 1:97-99 permits arrangement for a Jewish woman to abort a fetus where it is needed for the mother's health, even without it being a matter of saving the mother's life...
 And in such a case, and beyond this, Rabbi Yaakov Emden permitted, writing, "And even with a legitimate fetus, there is room to be lenient for great need, so long as it has not been uprooted [for birth], even without a need to save the mother's life, but only to save her from her evil, which causes her great pain." We see clearly that this permission of Rabbi Yaakov Emden is even when it is not a matter of saving the mother's life, and it is only to save her from great pain from the child, and that in general there is room to be lenient for great need.

If so, ask yourself: Is there any need, pain or ache greater than in our case, which will cause the mother in birthing such a creation, whose whole existence is suffering and pain, and whose death is certain in a matter of years, and whose parents watch and deteriorate without any power to save? (And certainly, it would not change or reduce anything if the child would be taken to a special institution without access for the parents until his death.) And added to this are the suffering and pain of the child himself... And suffering and emotional pain in great measure are greater and more painful than physical pain...

- 4. Rabbi Yitzchak Zilberstein (21st century Israel), Assia 8:209
 Rabbi Yitzchak Zev Soloveitchik, the Brisker Rav, told a doctor that 'saving a life' is not specifically the case of someone who is now dangerously ill and will die. Even where the fast will affect him years later when the disease will recur, and so fasting [now] will cause him to die early, this is 'saving a life' and he is required to eat.
- 5. Rabbi Dr. Avraham Sofer Abraham (21st century Israel), Nishmat Avraham Choshen Mishpat 425:1:12 The [non-observant] head of a psychiatric department told me that he never recommends abortion for such a woman, for she can be treated with pills, and in the great majority of cases the force of depression and irrationality after birth can be prevented. And so a leading psychiatrist has told me. Based on this, it appears that there is no permission to conduct abortion for a woman like this. And Rabbi Shlomo Zalman Auerbach and Rabbi Yehoshua Neuwirth agreed with me.
- 6. Rabbi Eliezer Melamed (21st century Israel), Pninei Halachah, הפסקת הריוך #13 (http://ph.yhb.org.il/08-12-09/) But it is clear that where there is emotional illness which cannot be treated with medicine, and it is caused by the pregnancy then since emotional illness is generally considered a threat to life, she may abort her fetus to protect her life.
- 7. Rabbi Shemuel Wosner (21st century Israel), Shevet haLevi 7:208

Were we to permit abortion for this, Gd forbid... we would be assisting sinners to be lenient in killing fetuses, for there is no cause to think this possibly life-saving. Calming her spirit and depression would be a mitzvah.

8. Rabbi Aharon Lichtenstein (20th-21st century Israel), *Abortion: A Halakhic Perspective*, Tradition 25:4 (1991) But it is worth making clear, certainly to those who, in seeking a humane approach, are liable to adopt slavishly an overly liberal attitude in this area, that from the perspective of the fetus and those concerned with its welfare, liberality in this direction comes at the expense of humanity, insofar as the caution of the Halakha is tied to its intimate concern for the values of kindness and mercy. It is not only the honor of G-d which obligates us, regardless of the cost, to avoid what is prohibited and to obey the commands of the Holy One Blessed be He that are expressed in this Halakha. It is also the honor of man in Halakha, the humane and ethical element which insists on the preservation of human dignity and concern for human welfare, that rises up in indignation against the torrent of abortions. If the Halakha's course is sometimes onerous for certain families or for those responsible for them-and this fact should neither be denied nor ignored-let us remember, paraphrasing the famous words of Byron, that Halakha loved not the parents less, but the child more.

Cosmetic Surgery

9. A longer discussion https://www.yutorah.org/lectures/lecture.cfm/874183

10. Deuteronomy 4:15

And you shall guard your lives greatly...

11. Numbers 6:14

And [the nazir] shall bring his offering before G-d: An unblemished lamb in its first year as a burnt offering, and an unblemished ewe in its first year as a *chatat*, and an unblemished ram as a *shelamim*.

12. Exodus 21:19

...Only, he shall give [payment for] his rest, and he shall heal him.

13. Deuteronomy 24:15

Pay him that day, and the sun shall not set [first], for he is a pauper, and he puts his life on the line for this [payment]; lest he call out to G-d regarding you, and it will be your sin.

14. Rabbi J. David Bleich (21st century USA), Contemporary Halakhic Problems, Volume 1 Page 122

Although every therapy is fraught with danger, the hazards of treatment are specifically sanctioned when incurred in conjunction with a therapeutic protocol. Accordingly, the practice of the healing arts may be permitted even if designed simply for the alleviation of pain.

15. Genesis 1:28

And Gd blessed them, and Gd said to them: Bear fruit and multiply and fill the land and conquer it, and reign over the fish of the sea and the birds of the heavens and all of the beasts that roam the earth.

16. Rabbi Yehudah Loeb (Maharal) (16th century Poland, Moravia, Prague), Be'er haGolah 2:10 Just as Nature operates at Divine decree, and Nature functioned during the six days of Creation as is appropriate for Nature, the same applies to the actions of a person, with his brain which is above Nature and with his deeds which are not of Nature...

17. Rabbi Joseph B. Soloveitchik (20th century USA), Halakhic Man (Kaplan translation, pp. 100-101)

The Scriptural portion of the creation narrative is a legal portion, in which are to be found basic, everlasting halakhic principles... If the Torah then chose to relate to man the tale of creation, we may clearly derive one law from this manner of procedure – viz, that man is obligated to engage in creation and the renewal of the cosmos.

18. Proverbs 31:30

Charm is false, and beauty is vapour.

19. Genesis 29:17

And Rachel was of beautiful features and beautiful appearance.

20. Genesis 1:27

And Gd created the man in His image, in the image designed by Gd He created him, male and female He created them.

21. Leviticus 19:14

You shall not curse the deaf, and you shall not place a stumbling block before the blind...

22. Rabbi Moshe Feinstein (20th century USA), Igrot Moshe Choshen Mishpat 2:66

It appears that there is room to permit this woman to beautify herself, even though it occurs via wounding, since the wounding is not performed in a manner of victory or humiliation, but - just the opposite! - for her benefit.

23. Rabbi Eliezer Waldenberg (20th century Israel), Tzitz Eliezer 11:41:9

It is ridiculous to propose to permit these surgeries...via midrashic texts which praise women's beauty...Any woman who has awe of G-d in her heart will not be drawn after these plastic surgeries for mere beauty...