Zionism, A-Zionism and Anti-Zionism, Week 3 R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com



Two sources I should have included last time

1. Fear of false messiahs: Kings I 22:5-6

And Yehoshaphat said to the King of Israel, "Seek now, today, the word of Gd." And the King of Israel gathered the prophets, about 400 men, and he said to them, "Shall I go to Ramot Gilad to war, or refrain?" And they said, "Ascend, and Gd will give it into the hands of the king."

2. The challenge of observance: Leviticus 20:22
Guard all My laws...and the land will not vomit you out, as it vomited out the nation which preceded you.

A Divine Agenda (continued)

3. Neturei Karta, Why Orthodox Jews are Opposed to a Zionist State www.nkusa.org/AboutUs/Zionism/opposition.cfm

Whoever calls this the salvation of Israel shows that he denies the essence of the People of Israel, and substitutes another nature, a worldly materialistic nature, and therefore sets before them, a worldly materialistic "salvation," and the means of achieving this "salvation" is also worldly and materialistic i.e. to organize a land and army.

4. Rabbi Eliezer Waldenberg (20th century Israel), Tzitz Eliezer 7:48:12

The oath against ascending en masse means that we shall not go up at once by force, as Rashi explained on the Talmud. If so, that only applied before we received the great mandate [from the UN], for then a great ascent could have been viewed, by the many monarchs who reigned over us, as ascending by force, en masse. In truth, there were laws prohibiting that, under threat of execution. We remember well the tragic events which occurred under the Mandate to the sparks saved from the fire, when they appeared to be ascending en masse.

From the time Gd remembered us, though, to give us a name and a sovereign portion in His holy land, and Gd implanted in the hearts of the United Nations, like Cyrus in his time, to return the stolen part of our land, and the gates of the land were opened wide day and night, and would not be closed before any Jew, without restriction and without limit, and all would be accepted with open arms and soul-felt joy, so the oath against ascent en masse is no longer at all relevant; its strength is gone, since no one will see this as ascending in force...

If so, the mitzvah of Aliyah is renewed, also as a general obligation upon the entire house of Israel, and upon every group of Jews in any of the exiles, to arise and gather itself and come settle in the land of our desire.

5. Midrash, Bereishit Rabbah 74:15

[King David said:] I sent Yoav to Aram Naharayim and Aram Tzovah. He met the Edomites and they took out their letter [citing Deuteronomy 2, which states that we are not to seek to conquer Edom]. But did they not break the boundary first, as recorded in Judges 3, "And he gathered the Amonites, etc." And he met the Moabites and sought to attack them, and they took out their letter, "Do not besiege Moav." But did they not break the boundary first, as recorded in Numbers 22, "And [the king of Moav] sent messengers to Bilam: Now, go curse, etc."!

Anti-Zionism 1: We are not allowed to return

6. Rabbi Samson Raphael Hirsch (19th century Germany), Horeb paragraph 608

Not in order to shine as a nation among nations do we raise our prayers and hopes for a reunion in our land, but in order to find a soil for the better fulfillment of our spiritual vocation in that reunion and in that land which was promised, and given, and again promised for our observance of the Torah. But this very vocation obliges us, until G-d shall call us back to the Holy Land, to live and to work as patriots wherever He has placed us... It obliges us, further, to allow our longing for the far-off land to express itself only in mourning, in wishing and hoping; and only through the honest fulfillment of all Jewish duties to await the realization of this hope. But it forbids us to strive for the reunion or possession of the land by any but spiritual means.

Anti-Zionism 2: Danger

7. Jeremiah 7:4-5

Do not trust the false words, which say, "It is the sanctuary of Gd, the sanctuary of Gd, the sanctuary of Gd!" But only improve your ways and deeds, performing justice between parties...

Anti-Zionism 3: Disapproval of Admiration of the State

8. Deuteronomy 8:11-17

Guard yourself, lest you forget Hashem, your Gd, failing to guard His commands, statutes and laws, which I command you today. Lest you eat and become full, and build good houses and dwell, and your cattle and sheep multiply, and silver and gold increase for you, and all you possess increases, and your heart will became haughty and you will forget Hashem your Gd who took you out of Egypt, from the house of slaves. Who brought you through this vast and frightening wilderness, snakes and venomous snakes and scorpions and waterless thirst – who brought water from a stone for you. Who fed you manna in the wilderness, as your ancestors did not know, to make you suffer and to test you, to benefit you in the end. And you will say in your hearts, "My strength, and the might of my hand, created all of this wealth for me."

9. Deuteronomy 32:15

And *Yeshurun* became fat and kicked; you became fat, you became thick, you became covered. And he rejected the Gd who had created him...

10. Kings II 15:3-4

And [Uziah] did that which was righteous in Gd's eyes, according to all that his father, Amatziah, did. Only, the altars [of idolatry] were not removed; the nation still slaughtered and burned incense on the altars.

11. Chronicles II 26:6-10 (adapted from Koren Jerusalem Bible)

And he went forth and warred against the Plishtim, and broke down the wall of Gat, and the wall of Yavne, and the wall of Ashdod, and built cities about Ashdod, and among the Plishtim. And G-d helped him against the Plishtim, and against the 'Arvim who dwelt in Gur-ba'al, and the Me'unim. And the 'Ammonim rendered tribute to Uziah, and his name spread abroad to the entrance of Mitzrayim; for he strengthened himself exceedingly. Moreover Uziah built towers in Jerusalem, at the corner gate, and at the valley gate, and at the angle of the wall, and fortified them. And he built towers in the desert, and dug many wells: for he had much cattle, both in the lowland, and in the plains: he had farmers, and vinedressers in the mountains, and in the Karmel: for he loved the soil.

12. Chronicles II 26:15-21 (adapted from the Koren Jerusalem Bible)

And in Jerusalem he made engines, invented by skillful men, to be on the towers and upon the bulwarks, to shoot arrows and great stones. And his name spread far abroad; for he was marvelously helped, till he was strong. But when he was strong, his heart was lifted up to his destruction: for he transgressed against the Lord his G-d, and went into the temple of the Lord to burn incense upon the altar of incense. And 'Azaryahu the priest went in after him and with him eighty priests of the Lord, who were men of valour: and they withstood Uziah the king, and said to him, It is not for thee, Uziah, to burn incense to the Lord, but for the priests the sons of Aharon, who are consecrated to burn incense: go out of the sanctuary; for thou hast trespassed; for it shall not be for thy honour from the Lord G-d. Then Uziah was angry, and had a censer in his hand to burn incense: and while he was angry with the priests, the tzara'at broke out on his forehead before the priests in the house of the Lord, beside the incense altar. And 'Azaryahu the chief priest, and all the priests, looked upon him, and, behold, he was diseased in his forehead, and they thrust him out quickly from there; and he himself hastened to go out, because the Lord had smitten him. And Uziah the king was afflicted with tzara'at to the day of his death, and dwelt in the house of separation, being diseased; for he was cut off from the house of the Lord: and Yotam his son was over the king's house, judging the people of the land.

13. Maccabees I 14:39-49 (sefaria.org)

The people therefore sang the acts of Simon, and unto what glory he thought to bring his nation, made him their governor and chief priest, because he had done all these things, and for the justice and faith which he kept to his nation, and for that he sought by all means to exalt his people. For in his time things prospered in his hands...

King Demetrius also confirmed him in the high priesthood according to those things, And made him one of his friends, and honoured him with great honour. For he had heard say, that the Romans had called the Jews their friends and confederates and brethren; and that they had entertained the ambassadors of Simon honourably; Also that the Jews and priests were well pleased that Simon should be their governor and high priest for ever, until there should arise a faithful prophet; Moreover that he should be their captain, and should take charge of the sanctuary, to set them over their works, and over the country, and over the armour, and over the fortresses, that, I say, he should take charge of the sanctuary; Beside this, that he should be obeyed of every man, and that all the writings in the country should be made in his name, and that he should be clothed in purple, and wear gold: Also that it should be lawful for none of the people or priests to break any of these things, or to gainsay his words, or to gather an assembly in the country without him, or to be clothed in purple, or wear a buckle of gold; And whosoever should do otherwise, or break any of these things, he should be punished.

14. Rabbi Moses Nachmanides (13th century Spain), Commentary to Genesis 49:10

In my opinion, the kings from other tribes who reigned after David violated the wishes of their ancestors, switching the lots of tribes... When the northern kingdom continued to coronate king after king from other tribes without returning to the monarchy of Judah, they violated the command...

This was the reason for the punishment of the Hasmoneans who reigned in the Second Temple. They were pious servants of G-d, and without them the Torah and commandments would have been forgotten from Israel, but they received a great punishment, as the four pious sons of the elder Chashmonai who reigned in succession, with all of their might and success, fell by the sword of their enemies... And it is also possible that their sin in reigning was because they were kohanim. They were commanded (Bamidbar 18:7), "Guard your priesthood for all matters of the altar, from the House to the curtain, and serve; I will give you your priesthood as a gift of service," and they should not have reigned, only to serve the service of Gd.

15.The 1967 Slogan: כל הכבוד לצה"ל

16. Rabbi Yoel Teitelbaum (20th century Romania, USA), VaYoel Moshe, *The Three Oaths*This has been the way of the Zionists from the beginning. Regarding all of their impropriety in the Holy Land they say it is a product of love of the land. Regarding any who disagree with their nullification of religion in the Holy Land they cry out that he is a hater of Zion and a hater of the land.

17. Rabbi Yoel Teitelbaum, cited in Rabbi Yitzchak Weiss, Minchat Yitzchak 10:10

And certainly, those who praise the miracles of the wicked. Even if their intent is to praise the Creator, they contradict and deny Divine power to perform open, true miracles, saying explicitly that [biblical miracles are the same as the Six Day War], and so were the miracles of the Exodus from Egypt. They deny the miracles of Gd; this is entirely heretical... And I have seen another stumbling block in that ruling [to recite Hallel on the anniversary of the Six Day War] – for if, Gd forbid, that would accepted, people of little faith could easily come to contradict entirely one of the principles of faith, the arrival of Mashiach speedily in our days...

18. Times of Israel Staff, Head of Satmar Hasidic sect castigates followers for admiring Israel, IDF June 9, '18 "According to the rumors I heard, [people] are excitedly talking about the news of [the Israelis'] accomplishments, how smart they are, how they succeed politically and militarily, and about their heads of government," Teitelbaum told the crowd in an address in Yiddish on Sunday, according to a Hebrew translation from the Kann public

broadcaster. "We must yell gevalt, gevalt! To where have we come?" he declared. "We have no part in Zionism. We have no part in their wars. We have no part in the State of Israel."

Anti-Zionism 4: Fear of Destruction of Jewish Life in Israel

19. Henrietta Szold, Recent Jewish Progress in Palestine (1914)

By making it possible for the inhabitants of Jerusalem to gain a livelihood in a dignified way through the work of their own hands Bezalel is helping to undermine the evil influence of the Chalucka. It is developing a new sense of independence in the old settlement.

20. Eliezer ben Yehuda, HaChalukah v'Toldoteha

However, there were other authors as well, who also spoke negatively regarding the *chalukah* – not because of its sin against the Enlightenment, but because they saw in it the origin of every ruinous trait they identified in the Jewish residents of this land, saying that it caused the Jewish residents of Eretz Yisrael to be weak, to listen to falsehood, to be idle all day and to not desire any labour...

21. Daphne Barak-Erez, Civil Rights and Privatization in Israel

The first alternative, arguing for the application of civil rights to privatized enterprises, rests on a growing willingness to disregard the public-private distinction and abandon the traditional view limiting civil rights to citizen-government relationships... These developments have started to have an impact on Israeli law as well, as exemplified mainly in the decisions and academic writings of Justice Aharon Barak. In the famous *Kastenbaum* case (discussed below) Justice Barak considered the possibility of applying civil rights to a local burial society which denied rights to relatives of a deceased person, according to the theory extending the application of civil rights to private bodies.

22. Haaretz, Saying yes to buses in Israel on Shabbat, Feb 22 '12

The Tel Aviv city council's request for approval for public transportation on Shabbat is correct and courageous. Residents of greater Tel Aviv deserve this basic service. The argument that providing public transportation on the Sabbath and holidays would harm the religious status quo is an exaggeration and unfair.

Curbs on traffic on Shabbat, particularly on public transportation, are dictated by the Orthodox. Ultra-Orthodox neighborhoods are blocked off entirely on the Sabbath and Jewish holidays, and the demand by Haredi leaders and residents to respect that right is attentively obeyed. It would be logical if the rights of everyone else to travel as freely as possible on Shabbat were protected in the same way. But reality is different.

23. Rabbi Avigdor Neventzahl, Letter of February '17, available at https://rotter.name/kolot/think/14098.php I have come to strengthen the hands of Rabbi Shemuel Rabinovitch, Rav haKotel haMaaravi, who stands in the breach to guard our sacred camp, who has fought over the years against those who would breach the wall of holiness, who seek to desecrate the Western Wall with practices which are against the Torah and Jewish tradition, and he stands in this like a reinforced wall and he does not capitulate to their requests, all with great understanding and wisdom and commitment to Gd and to His Torah.

24. Leviticus 19:17

You shall not hate your brother in your heart; educate your friend, and do not bear sin for him.

25. Deuteronomy 17:18-19

And he shall write for himself this *Mishneh haTorah* on a scroll, before the priests and Levites. And it shall be with him, and he shall read it all his life, so that he will learn to revere Hashem, his Gd, to guard all of the words of this Torah and all of these laws, to practice then.

26. Jerusalem Talmud, Chagigah 1:7

The sages entered one place and did not find teachers or students. They instructed, "Bring us the city guardians [neturei karta]!" The people brought the city sentries. They said to them, "These are the city guardians?! These are only the destroyers of the city!" The people replied, "Who are the city guardians?" They said to them, "The teachers and students."

Anti-Zionism 5: Cooperation with Perpetrators of Wrongdoing

27. Samuel II 13:3

And Amnon had a friend named Yonadav ben Shimah, brother of David; and Yonadav was a very smart man.

28. Chronicles II 20:35-37

They partnered to make boats to travel to Tarsus; they made the boats in Etzion Gever. Eliezer, son of Dodavahu of Mareishah prophesied upon Yehoshaphat, "When you joined with Achaziah, Gd destroyed your deeds." The ships were smashed, and they were not able to travel to Tarsus.

29. Mishnah, Pirkei Avot 1:7

Distance yourself from a bad neighbour; do not join with a wicked person...

30.CPA of Ontario, CPA Code of Professional Conduct, Section 406

- 406.1 A member or firm engaged in the practice of public accounting who is associated in such practice with a non-member shall be responsible to CPA Ontario for any failure of such non-member, in respect of all areas of practice of the member or firm, to abide by the CPA Code...
- 406.2 A member or firm engaged in a practice of public accounting to which another business or practice is related, or engaged in such related business or practice, shall be responsible to CPA Ontario for any failure of a non-member who is associated with such related business or practice and who is under the member's or firm's management or supervision or with whom the member or firm shares proprietary or other interest in such related business or practice to comply with the CPA Code...
- 31. Rabbi Elchanan Wasserman, Open Letter to the leadership of Poalei Agudat Yisrael, 1934

It is known to all that the heads of this organization [Histadrut] has set a goal of uprooting the Torah from its root with a mighty hand, and educating and raising a new nation of Israel in place of the old nation of Israel... It is clear that one may not join with them in any sort of union. Even living in their neighbourhood is prohibited; woe to the wicked and woe to his neighbour!

32. Statement of Neturei Karta on Elections, 1951 http://www.nkusa.org/Historical_Documents/torahOpinion.cfm Regarding the elections to the government in the Land of Israel, we have determined in accordance with Judaism to publicly declare and to publicize Torah opinion, that according to Law, it is forbidden for any Jew whose forefathers stood at Mt. Sinai to Gd forbid participate in the elections to the knesset of the heretics, and no power in the world shall permit this in any way whatsoever.

Hope for the Future

33. Rabbi Abraham Isaac Kook (20th century Israel), Orot haTechiyah 9 (Naor translation)

If at a certain time there should be found an arousal, whereby people will speak only of the spirit of the nation and will attempt to negate the spirit of Gd... What should the righteous of the generation do? To rebel against the spirit of the nation, even verbally, and to reject its assets, this is something impossible: The spirit of the Lord and the spirit of Israel are one. Rather, the righteous must work hard to reveal the light and the holiness in the national spirit...