Zionism, A-Zionism and Anti-Zionism, Week 1 R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com



1. Israel's Scroll of Independence

The State of Israel will be open to Jewish immigration and the ingathering of the exiles, working toward development of the land for the benefit of all of its inhabitants. It will be founded upon the principles of freedom, justice and peace, by the light of the visions of the prophets of Israel. It will maintain full, equal social and political rights for all her citizens, without distinction based on religion, race or sex. It will guarantee freedom of religion, conscience, language, education and culture. It will guard the sacred places of all religions....

Religious Zionism

2. Rabbi Yitzhak Reines (19th century Lithuania), Or Chadash al Zion, pg. ללו

It was already envisioned regarding us from the start that the result of the pursuits and oppressions Israel would bear in its exile would be an improvement in its moral state. We now see that these pursuits have awakened and continue to awaken the Zionist ideal, at the least <u>distancing the nation from assimilation</u>, returning to the moral good. Thus there is no doubt that this Zionist movement is that which they prophesied from the start.

3. Deuteronomy 11:17-18

...And Gd will close the heavens and there will be no rain, and the land will not give its produce, and you will quickly be lost from upon the good land Gd is giving you. And you shall place these words upon your hearts and souls ...

4. Midrash, Sifri Devarim 43

"And you will quickly be lost... and you shall place these words" – Even though I exile you from the land, be marked by your mitzvot, so that when you return they will not be new for you.

5. Talmud, Sotah 14a

Rabbi Simlai taught: Why did our master Moses desire to enter the Land of Israel? Did he need to eat from her fruit or sate himself with her bounty? Rather, this is what Moses said: Israel was commanded numerous commandments, which can be fulfilled only in the Land of Israel. I shall enter the land, so that I will be able to fulfill all of them."

6. Rabbi Moses Nachmanides (Ramban, 13th century Spain), Extra Mitzvat Aseh 4

Mitzvah 4 is that we are instructed to settle the land which Gd gave to our ancestors, to Abraham, Isaac and Jacob, and that we shall not leave it in the hands of any other nation, or for desolation. This is the meaning of the verse, "You shall settle the land and live in it, for to you I have given the land to settle. You shall take estates in the land..."

Quasi-Religious Zionism

7. Rabbi Yehudah HaLevi (11th-12th century Spain), Zion Halo Tishali

My heart is to Bethel, and for Peniel it greatly yearns,

And for Machanaim and all of the rendezvous of your pure ones,

There the Shechinah resides for you,

And your Creator opened your gates opposite the gates of Heaven,

And the glory of Gd alone was your luminary,

And the Sun, Moon and stars were not your luminaries.

8. Deuteronomy 11:12

This is the land which Hashem your Gd seeks; perpetually, the eyes of Hashem your Gd are upon her, from the start of the year to the end of the year.

9. Psalms 132:14

Here I will dwell, for I have desired her!

10. Talmud, Ketuvot 110b

One should always live in the Land of Israel, even in a city which is mostly of idolaters, rather than live outside of the Land of Israel even in a city which is mostly of Jews, for anyone who lives in the Land of Israel is as though he has a relationship with Gd, and anyone who lives outside of the Land of Israel is as though he has no relationship with Gd, as it says, "To give you the land of Canaan, to be your Gd."

11. Rabbi Ed Snitkoff, https://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/gush-emunim/

The national trauma following the 1973 Yom Kippur War equaled the ecstasy that followed the Six Day War. At this time, the members of the young religious faction left their burned out tanks and bunkers with renewed determination that the secular, strategic settlement plan was not to be depended on any longer. This crisis led to a meeting in Kibbutz Kfar Etzion in 1974, the outcome of which was the founding of Gush Emunim. Gush Emunim's platform defined the movement's mission in the following way: "To bring about a major spiritual reawakening in the Jewish people for the sake of the full realization of the Zionist vision, in the knowledge that this vision's source and goal in the Jewish heritage and in Judaism's roots are the total redemption of both the Jewish people and the whole world."

12. Deuteronomy 30:3

And Hashem, your Gd, will restore your captivity and have mercy upon you, and gather you from all of the nations where Gd has scattered you.

Cultural Zionism

13. Ahad ha'Am, The Jewish State and the Jewish Problem (The Zionist Idea)

Judaism can, for the present, content itself with little. It does not need an independent State, but only the creation in its native land of conditions favorable to its development: a good-sized settlement of Jews working without hindrance in every branch of civilization, from agriculture and handicrafts to science and literature. This Jewish settlement, which will be a gradual growth, will become in course of time the center of the nation, wherein its spirit will find pure expression and develop in all its aspects to the highest degree of perfection of which it is capable.

14. Psalms 137:4

How could we sing the song of Gd on foreign soil?

15. Rabbi Avraham Yitzchak haKohen Kook (20th century Israel), *Orot*, Eretz Yisrael 3

Independent Jewish creativity, in thought and in the strength of life and in activity, cannot happen for the Jew other than in the Land of Israel.

16. Rabbi Yisrael Moshe Chazan (19th century Rome), Krach shel Romi 1

Logic dictates this; otherwise, from whence would sweet tunes and sounds remain to us? The songs of David and the Levites from the platform are forgotten from us, as expressed in, 'How could we sing the song of Gd upon foreign soil?' Wherever Israel was exiled, they learned the tunes of those lands in which they dwelled. In Israel and Arab lands the tunes of prayers and kaddish and kedushot were entirely of Arab tunes, in Turkey they were Turkish, in Rome they were Roman – who can contradict that which is perceived?!

Political Zionism

17. Theodor Herzl, A Solution to the Jewish Question (The Jew in the Modern World)

We are one people – One People. We have honestly striven everywhere to merge ourselves in the social life of surrounding communities, and to preserve only the faith of our fathers. It has not been permitted to us. In vain are we loyal patriots, in some places our loyalty running to extremes; in vain do we make the same sacrifices of life and property as our fellow citizens... In countries where we have lived for centuries we are still cried down as strangers... Let the sovereignty be granted us over a portion of the globe large enough to satisfy the requirements of the nation – the rest we shall manage for ourselves.

18. Zecharyah 8:4-5

So declares Gd: Elderly men and women will yet sit in the streets of Jerusalem, a man with his staff in his hand due to great age. And the streets of the city will be filled with boys and girls, playing in her streets.

19. Nachman Syrkin, *The Jewish Problem and the Socialist Jewish State* (The Zionist Idea)

For a Jewish state to come to be, it must, from the very beginning, avoid all the ills of modern life. To evoke the sympathetic interest of modern man its guidelines must be justice, rational planning, and social solidarity. Once a Jewish state has been realized on such scientific social principles, the time will come for modern technology to flourish within it. The Jewish state can come about only if it is socialist; only by fusing with socialism can Zionism become the ideal of the whole Jewish people – of the proletariat, the middle class, and the intelligentsia. All Jews will be involved in the success of Zionism, and none will be indifferent. The messianic hope, which was always the greatest dream of exiled Jewry, will be transformed into political action. The Jewish people, presently living in misery, will gain lofty content.

20. Isaiah 2:2-4

At the end of days the mountain of the House of Gd will be established atop the mountains and more elevated than the hills, and all of the nations will stream there. Many nations will go and say, "Let us go and ascend to the mountain of Gd, the house of the Gd of Jacob, and He will teach us His ways and we will walk in His paths," for from Zion shall emerge Torah and the word of Gd from Jerusalem. And he will judge between nations and rebuke many nations, and they will pound their swords into plowshares and their spears into pruning hooks; a nation will not raise a sword against another nation, and no longer will they learn war.

21. Rabbi David Kimchi (Radak, 12th-13th century France), Commenary to Michah 4:3

If there will be war or complaints between nations, they will come before Mashiach for justice, for he will be master of all nations, and he will teach them, telling the one who is crooked, "Straighten out that which has been made perverse for your plaintiff." Therefore there will be no war between nations, for he will make peace between them and they will not need weapons.

Nationalism

22.R' A. Lichtenstein (20th-21st c. US, Israel) Diaspora Religious Zionism: Some Current Reflections, pp. 22-23 In the course of my initial visit to Israel, during the summer of 1962, I went to visit mori verabbi, Rav Y. Hutner zt"l, who, prior to his aliya, often spent the summer at Pension Reich in Jerusalem. After reproaching me gently for having left my wife in the United States (אוא כתובה האסטו געשריבען), he began to question me regarding my impressions – particularly, about what had struck my notice especially. As, at that stage, I had focused upon the Torah world in Israel, I noted a number of phenomena which had struck me favorably, as compared to the American scene: widespread popular talmud Torah, the interaction of the Torah and general communities in the implementation of Hoshen Mishpat etc. Every reply was rebutted with the comment that its subject could have been found in Eastern Europe as well, and so was neither endemic nor unique to Eretz Israel. When he sensed that I had exhausted my material, he pressed on, inquiring as to what indeed was special about my visit, and, when it

became clear that I could, at best, only respond feebly, the Rosh Yeshiva opened with a volley of sources and dicta – the description of Eretz Israel as ארץ אשר ד' אלקיך דורש אותה (a land that Hashem your G-d cares for), or as that to which Moshe and Aharon had been barred access, which was now open to us... all trumpeting forth the sacral, metaphysical, and historical uniqueness of the land and all causing me to realize, in a flash, that I had missed the boat entirely. As he railed on, as perhaps only he could, against tourists he had met on the plane, acting and talking as if they were en route to vacation in California, the sense of failure cut deeper and deeper. I walked out into the Beit Hakerem evening air like a beaten dog. But I knew I had been beaten justly; and today, almost forty-five years later, I remain deeply grateful to the Rosh Yeshiva for opening my eyes and for opening my heart.

23. Rabbi Aharon Lichtenstein, Explanation of why he was attracted to Yeshivat Har Etzion https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tDvaOZAN7OE

It is of course, first and foremost, an institution of Torah learning at a high level, located in the foothills of Hebron on the one side, Jerusalem on the other, and the very thought that here one stands, engaged in the intensive study of Torah, within the very context that the avot, the patriarchs, followed on the one hand, or, that led of old to Jerusalem on the other, is a source to me of continuing inspiration.