Logotherapy and Judaism



R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

1. Robert G. Blair, Helping Older Adolescents, etc. J. of Mental Health Counseling 26:4 (Oct. 2004)

In searching for a unique meaning behind depression, clients commonly obtain answers that are more personal and helpful than answers that I could provide as a MHC. For example, in a lock-down residential setting, working with one 17-year-old with symptoms of depression, we discussed his pain as well as other problems he was experiencing. To assess the severity of his depression, the Beck Depression Inventory (BDI) was used. On a weekly basis, over a 3-week period, this adolescent scored an average of 40 on the BDI, indicating severe depression (Beck, Steer, & Brown, 1996; Burns, 1980). Reviewing his scores on the BDI and verbalizing his various problems, he further recognized the enormous weight of his depression. Following this 3-week period, after we had developed rapport, I assisted him in reframing the meaning of his depression by asking him to think about its possible meaning, and then asking: "Let's assume that your depression is purposeful, that it's trying to convey a message to you, telling you that some change needs to be made in your life. Your job is to figure out what that change is, and then to make it." After taking sufficient time to think, he responded that he had always wanted to read philosophy but had never taken the time to do so. We discussed some of the titles he wanted to read, and when the book Atlas Shrugged (Rand, 1996) was mentioned, he became excited and decided that was the book he would read. He purchased and read the book. Within a 2-week period, and with no additional interventions, his score on the BDI dropped to 10, indicating a normal mood range (Beck et al., 1996; Burns, 1980). Over the next 2 weeks, further weekly assessment was sustained and my client continued to score an average of 10 on the BDI. According to Beck et al., the magnitude of this pre-post change, dropping from an average of 40 to an average of 10, indicates a reliable, clinically significant change. As a MHC, reading philosophy never would have occurred to me as a possible meaning behind depression; yet trusting my client and his ability to discover for himself, allowed for the rapid reduction of his depressive symptoms.

2. Internet Addiction: A Logotherapeutic Approach, Journal of Addictions and Offender Counseling 33 (Apr. 2012) [Internet Addiction], particularly when it is related to social networking programs such as Facebook, Myspace, or Second Life, is indicative of the existential concept of escaping from the self, rather than reliance on self. Individuals feel the need to escape the self for different reasons. It (the self) may have become burdensome, empty, a source of embarrassment, or repulsive. Addictive behaviors are the pathological result of this dissatisfaction with or rejection of the self... The Internet has changed societal norms and traditions in profound ways, and these changes have happened at an unprecedented rate. The sheer amount of information and entertainment available to individuals has led to an increased need for instant gratification and the desire to have more sensory input in order to stay interested and stimulated in life, but not to face the existential vacuum. These are all actions that signal desperate attempts fill the emptiness of IA...

3. John H. Morgan, Geriatric Logotherapy, Psychological Thought 5:2 (2012)

Another example of geriatric logotherapy is the case of Dr. Watson, a retired philosophy professor living alone in his home as a widower with two adult children living far away. Dr. Watson is in his late 80s, was once a nationally recognized scholar, author of several books, but these days finds reading increasingly difficult owing to glaucoma and writing virtually impossible due to arthritis in both hands. Reduced to sitting on his expansive front porch when weather permits and before the fireplace otherwise, Dr. Watson has sunk into a debilitating depression resulting in a consistent failure to eat regularly or to converse over the phone with friends and family. A concerned son precipitated the contact with a logotherapist who made an initial home visit, finding the above situation. Dr. Watson had essentially "given up," as he put it, because of an inability to read or write, his life's work and passion. When the therapist encouraged the professor to "tell me about your life's work," Dr. Watson commenced slowly and deliberately rattling off his educational background, teaching appointments, books written, conferences attended, all with little passion and near expressionless. However, when the therapist asked about specific colleagues mentioned in the monotone narrative, he noticed that the patient became somewhat animated, enthusiastic, even excited to relate story after story involving colleagues, happy stories, fun stories, all leading to an extremely productive journey through time and people of importance. Subsequent sessions centered upon the same topics with the results that Dr. Watson began calling old friends, inviting other retired colleagues in town to come for morning coffee and chat. The door of happy memories had been opened and entered and Dr. Watson's life took on renewed vitality.

The Core Concepts of Logotherapy

4. Dr. Viktor Frankl, Man's Search for Meaning

[Life's tasks] form man's destiny, which is different and unique for each individual. No man and no destiny can be compared with any other man or any other destiny. No situation repeats itself, and each situation calls for a different response.

5. Dr. Viktor Frankl, The Doctor and the Soul

Certainly man is free, but he is not floating freely in airless space. He is always surrounded by a host of restrictions. These restrictions, however, are the jumping-off points for his freedom. Freedom presupposes restrictions, is contingent upon restrictions... The ground upon which a man walks is always being transcended in the process of walking, and serves as ground only to the extent that it is transcended, that it provides a springboard. If we wanted to define man, we would have to call him that entity which has freed itself from whatever has determined it (determined it as biological-psychological-sociological type); that entity, in other words, that transcends all these determinants either by conquering them and shaping them, or by deliberately submitting to them.

6. Rabbi Reuven Bulka, An Analysis of the Viability of Frankl's Logotherapeutic System as a Secular Theory, pp. 5-6 Freedom, to Frankl, demands no special proof. It belongs "to the immediate data of his experience." Freud once said: Try and subject a number of very strongly differentiated human beings to the same amount of starvation. With the increase of the imperative need for food, all individual differences will be blotted out, and, in their place, we shall see the uniform expression of the one unsatisfied instinct.

The concentration camps, in Frankl's view, proved Freud wrong. The camps proved that man cannot be reduced to a function of heredity and environment, for at the same time that some inmates degenerated into the innate camp bestiality, others exhibited the virtues of saintliness. A third variable, found only in the spiritual animal, man, is the decisive factor in human behaviour, choice or decision. "Man ultimately decides for himself."

7. Rabbi Reuven Bulka, *An Analysis of the Viability of Frankl's Logotherapeutic System as a Secular Theory*, pg. 10 To conceive of man as one who wills, as one who is "pulled by meaning", is to conceive of a world filled with objective meaning. Frankl stands in rigid opposition to the homunculist, nothing-but picture of man; man portrayed as biologysociology-psychology; the subject, man, being reduced to object; as well as the subjectivization of all values; the reduction of meaning to mere self-expression. Man, like the decrepit arc, needs a pulling tension... Man oscillates between the subjective 'I am' and the objective 'I ought', and insofar as he strives for the ought he transcends his self and actualizes his responsibleness.

8. Dr. Viktor Frankl, *Psychotherapy and Existentialism*

The spiritual crisis of retirement constitutes, so to speak, a permanent unemployment neurosis. But there is also a temporary, periodical one, the Sunday neurosis: a depression which afflicts people who become conscious of the lack of content in their lives - the existential vacuum - when the rush of the busy week stops on Sunday and the void within them suddenly becomes manifest.

9. R' Reuven Bulka, An Analysis of the Viability of Frankl's Logotherapeutic System as a Secular Theory, pg. 11-12 Frankl offers no proof that objective values exist. That these values are objective follows necessarily from Frankl's view of man. The human model, the properly functioning man, is directed towards meaning. If meaning were subjective, the dynamics of transcendence would be destroyed and existence would falter. Therefore, meaning must be objective... Frankl does categorize three species of values contained in life. They are 1) creative values, or what man gives to life; 2) experiential values, or what man takes from the world in terms of his experience; and 3) attitudinal values, or the stand man takes toward an unchangeable aspect of his existence.

10. Dr. Viktor Frankl, The Doctor and the Soul

[T]he job at which one works is not what counts, but rather the manner in which one does the work. It does not lie with the occupation, but always with us, whether those elements of the personal and the specific which constitute the uniqueness of our existence are expressed in the work and thus make life meaningful.

11. Dr. Viktor Frankl, *The Doctor and the Soul*

We must never be content with what has already been achieved. Life never ceases to put new questions to us, never permits us to come to rest.

12. Rabbi Reuven Bulka, *An Analysis of the Viability of Frankl's Logotherapeutic System as a Secular Theory*, pg. 11 There is, according to Frankl, no general, all-encompassing meaning of life. It is comparable to the question posed to a chess player, 'What is the best move?' There is no best move just as there is no universal meaning. Instead, meaning is detected in man's confrontation with his unique situation. Every man is unique, all situations are unique, hence all confrontations are unique. Each confrontation carries its own particular meaning; man detects the objective meaning in the subjectiveness of his situation.

13. Dr. Viktor Frankl, The Concept of Man in Logotherapy, Journal of Existentialism 6 (1965)

It goes without saying that meaning and purpose in life are no matter of prescription. It is not the job of a doctor to give meaning to the patient's life. But it may well be his task through an existential analysis to enable the patient to find meaning in life. And in my opinion meaning is something to be found rather than to be given.

Dr. Frankl on Logotherapy and Religion

14. Dr. Viktor Frankl, Man's Search for Meaning

Instead of the many pages of my manuscript, I found in a pocket of the newly acquired coat a single page torn out of a Hebrew prayer book, which contained the main Jewish prayer, Shema Yisrael. How should I have interpreted such a "coincidence" other than as a challenge to live my thoughts instead of merely putting them on paper?

15. Dr. Viktor Frankl, Man's Search for Meaning

One day, a few days after the liberation, I walked through the country past flowering meadows, for miles and miles, toward the market town near the camp. Larks rose to the sky and I could hear their joyous song. There was no one to be seen for miles around; there was nothing but the wide earth and sky and the larks' jubilation and the freedom of space. I stopped, looked around, and up to the sky - and then I went down on my knees. At that moment there was very little I knew of myself or of the world - I had but one sentence in mind - always the same: 'I called to the Lord from my narrow prison and He answered me in the freedom of space.' How long I knelt there and repeated this sentence memory can no longer recall. But I know that on that day, in that hour, my new life started. Step for step I progressed, until I again became a human being.

16. Dr. V. Frankl in R' Reuven Bulka, *Denominational Implications of the Religious Nature of Logotherapy*, pp. 126-127 [A]s I see it religion tries to give answers by offering man various answers, in terms of myths and symbols, and it offers man a choice. By and large he is born into such a language. Remember what I say about languages, a system of symbols. Here I begin to pray, to put on in the morning my Tefilin, where I cannot find rational answers but have to commit myself, have to make my selection — I believe in this G-d, in this incomprehensible Deity. I am approaching Him by way of prayer, by way of rituals even, putting on the Tefilin, and in the evening reading the Psalms. This is my language when I address myself to G-d, and I abhor and would negate the right of anyone to say, "Viktor, why do you speak to Deity in this language? Why have you made it your habit, since the first day in concentration camp, to read in the Psalms each day? Why don't you accept the sacraments? Why don't you make confession to George (Vlahos) as a priest?"

17. Dr. Viktor Frankl, The Will to Meaning: Foundations and Applications of Logotherapy

"If I don't do it—who will do it? And if I don't do it right now-when should I do it? But if I do it for my sake only—what am I?" If I don't do it..." This seems to me to refer to the uniqueness of my own self. "If I don't do it right now..." refers to the uniqueness of the passing moment which gives me an opportunity to fulfill a meaning. "And if I do it for my own sake only..." what here comes in is no more nor less than the self-transcendent quality of human existence. The question, "What am I if I do it for my own sake only" — requires the answer: In no event a truly human being. For it is a characteristic constituent of human existence that it transcends itself, that it reaches out for something other than itself.

18. Dr. Viktor Frankl, Three Lectures on Logotherapy

[T]he meaning of Shabbat may well consist in reaching beyond work. There are creative values, there are experiential values, there are attitudinal values. This means we may find the meaning in our lives through a deed we are doing, through a work we are creating, through an achievement and accomplishment, through creativity, six days. But also through our experience. Not through what we give to the world but what we receive from the world; what we take in.

19. Dr. Viktor Frankl, in R' Reuven Bulka, *Denominational Implications of the Religious Nature of Logotherapy*, pg. 123 You are pushing forward things, you are, as you say yourself, completing the logotherapeutic system by taking in the Talmudic wisdom. True, this is a frailty, a shortcoming of logotherapy. It "stops short", you are used to repeating. But, on the other hand, in another dimension, in the horizontal, this is an asset of logotherapy, because I can reach the atheistic patient, the agnostic patient as well, possibly finally opening up a door to the other dimension; while you, who are adding, complementing the logotherapeutic view, get a hearing a priori, by and large, only from the devout orthodox Jewish religious man. So what is at first view a frailty might be an asset in practical use.

20. Rabbi Abraham Amsel, Judaism and Psychology

[W]hereas Dr. Frankl seems to feel that man can find this meaning in many varied avenues of life, Judaism's view is that a truly meaningful life, one that produces the contentment and peace of mind which is real and unadulterated, can be achieved only through the apotheosizing of faith and trust in G-d, through rendering all other joys and satisfactions subservient to the one true joy of serving the Almighty.

A Tree with Jewish Roots

21. Talmud, Berachot 58a

תנו רבנן: הרואה אוכלוסי ישראל אומר ברוך חכם הרזים שאין דעתם דומה זה לזה ואין פרצופיהן דומים זה לזה. Our sages taught: One who sees Jewish crowds says, "Blessed is the Wise One of secrets," for their intellects do not resemble each other and their forms do not resemble each other.

22. Talmud, Shabbat 156a

האי מאן דבמאדים יהי גבר אשיד דמא. אמר רב אשי: אי אומנא אי גנבא, אי טבחא אי מוהלא. אמר רבה אנא במאדים הואי! אמר אביי מר נמי עניש וקטיל.

One who is born under Mars will be a shedder of blood. Rav Ashi said: A blood-letter or thief, a butcher or *mohel*. Rabbah said: I was born under Mars! Abbaye said: The master also punishes and executes.

23. Talmud, Niddah 16b

ונוטל טפה ומעמידה לפני הקב"ה ואומר לפניו רבש"ע טפה זו מה תהא עליה גבור או חלש חכם או טיפש עשיר או עני, ואילו רשע או צדיק לא קאמר...

He takes the drop and stands it before Gd and says, "Gd, what shall be with this drop? Powerful or weak, wise or foolish, wealthy or poor?" But he does not say "Wicked or righteous"...

24. Rambam, Mishneh Torah, Hilchot Teshuvah 5:1-3

רשות לכל אדם נתונה אם רצה להטות עצמו לדרך טובה ולהיות צדיק הרשות בידו, ואם רצה להטות עצמו לדרך רעה ולהיות רשע הרשות בידו... ודבר זה עיקר גדול הוא והוא עמוד התורה והמצוה שנאמר "ראה נתתי לפניך היום את החיים," וכתיב "ראה אנכי נותן לפניכם היום," כלומר שהרשות בידכם, וכל שיחפוץ האדם לעשות ממעשה בני האדם עושה בין טובים בין רעים... Each person is given permission to incline himself to a good path and be righteous, or to incline himself to a bad path and be wicked... And this is great principle, a pillar of Torah and mitzvot, as Devarim 30:15 says, "See, I have placed before You today life" and Devarim 11:26 says, "See, I place before you today," meaning permission is in your hand, and one can do as he chooses within the field of human endeavour, whether good or bad...

25. Rabbi Yitzchak of Volozhin, citing his father in the preface to Nefesh haChaim

והיה רגיל להוכיח אותי על שראה שאיני משתתף בצערא דאחרינא. וכה היה דברו אלי תמיד שזה כל האדם לא לעצמו נברא רק להועיל לאחריני ככל אשר ימצא בכחו לעשות My father always used to rebuke me, as he saw that I would not experience the pain of others. This is what he always told me: "This is a person's entire purpose. A person is not created for himself. A person is created only to benefit others, with whatever power is in his possession."

26. Rabbi Samson Raphael Hirsch, Commentary to Devarim 1:17

המשפט מעצב אורח חיים אנושיים ונותן להם את הצורה שהבורא נתכוון לה בשעת הבריאה, שהרי לא נברא האדם אלא כדי שיגשים בהירות את רצון ד' Divine justice shapes human existence and gives it the form the Creator intended at the time of Creation, for a person

is created only in order to freely make real the Divine desire.

27. Rabbi Yosef Dov Soloveitchik, *The Emergence of Ethical Man* pg. 5 G-d takes man-animal into His confidence, addresses him and reveals to him His moral will.

28. Mishnah Ketuvot 5:5

רבן שמעון בן גמליאל אומר אף המדיר את אשתו מלעשות מלאכה יוציא ויתן כתובתה שהבטלה מביאה לידי שיעמום: Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel said: One who vows that his wife may not work must divorce her and pay her ketubah, for idleness leads to *shiamum*.

29. Avot d'Rabbi Natan II 21

אהוב את המלאכה חייב אדם להיות אוהב את המלאכה ועוסק במלאכה... היה רבי אליעזר אומר גדולה היא מלאכה שכשם שנצטוו ישראל על השבת כך נצטוו על המלאכה שנאמר ששת ימים תעבוד ועשית כל מלאכתך... ועוד היה רבי אומר גדולה היא מלאכה שאפילו לאדם חצר או גינה חרבים ילך ויעסוק בהם כדי שיהא עסוק במלאכה...

"Love work" – One is obligated to love work and involve himself in work... R' Eliezer used to say: Work is great, for just as Israel was instructed regarding Shabbat, so they are instructed regarding work, as it says, "Six days you shall work, and perform all of your tasks." ... Rebbe also said: Work is great, for even one who has a ruined yard or garden should involve himself with them, to be busy...

30. Rabbi Avraham Yitzchak haKohen Kook, Orot haTeshuvah 5:6* שלמותם של החיים, כדי שיהיה האדם בלתי-חוטא, וביטול עצם טבעיותם של החיים, כדי שיהיה האדם בלתי-חוטא, זהו עצמו החטא היותר גדול

The perfection of life is specifically with its revelation in its basic nature... Nullification of the basic nature of one's life, in order to be without sin, is itself the greatest sin.

31. Talmud, Eruvin 13b

כל המחזר על הגדולה גדולה בורחת ממנו וכל הבורח מן הגדולה גדולה מחזרת אחריו Anyone who pursues power, power flees from him. And anyone who flees from power, power pursues him.

32. Midrash, Kohelet Rabbah 3:10

אין ארבעה ליה תרתי מאה בעי דיעבדון ארבעה מאה ומאן דאית ליה תרתי מאה בעי דיעבדון ארבעה One does not leave this world with half of his desires fulfilled. If he has 100, he wants to produce 200. If he has 200, he wants to produce 400. 33. Rabbi Naftali Zvi Yehudah Berlin (Netziv) (19th century Russia) to Numbers 24:6 כל גן יש בו מין א' שהוא העיקר, אלא שסביביו נזרע עוד הרבה מינים מעט מעט. כך כל איש ישראל מלא מצוות ד' אבל כל א' יש לו מצוה א' ביחוד להיות נזהר בה ביותר כדאיתא במכילתא פ' בשלח רנ"א כל העושה מצוה א' באמנה זוכה וכו' ובירושלמי קידושין סוף פ' א' על המאמר כל העושה מצוה א' מטיבין לו וכו' ומפרש בירושלמי שעושה מצוה א' בזהירות יתירה.

Each garden has one central variety, and small quantities of other varieties are planted around it. So, too, each Jew is filled with the mitzvot of Gd, but each has one special mitzvah in which he is extra careful...

34. Rabbi Avraham Yitzchak haKohen Kook (20th century Israel), אל חכי שופר

אל נמוד כל קנין רק לפי מדתנו. נדע כי כל אחד הנהו רק פרט, חלק אחד, אחוז מקהלינו, ומה יוכל על הכלל לדון, הלא מעט... כל איש לחפץ לבבו ילך ויצליח, ומתנובות כפימו עמם ירוממו. כל אחד במקצעו רוח חיים יפיח, בבנותו לו בית, הריסות עמנו יקוממו.

We will not measure every acquisition by our personal measure. We will know that each individual is only a unit, one portion, a share of our community, and how could the whole judge but little?... Each person toward his heart's desire will travel and succeed, and from the fruit of their hands, their nation will be elevated. Each in his trade will breathe the breath of life; when he builds for himself a home, the ruin of our people will be rebuilt.