

Shul Building as Mitzvah and Communal Imperative

1. Tosefta Bava Metzia 11:23

כופין בני העיר זה את זה לבנות להן בית הכנסת ולקנות להן ספר תורה ונביאים

The people of a city may force each other to build a beit haknesset and to purchase a Torah scroll and Prophets

2. Talmud Yerushalmi, Moed Katan 3:1

כל המעכב את הרבים לעשו' דבר מצוה צריך נידוי

One who prevents the community from performing a mitzvah requires ex-communication.

3. Rambam, Mishneh Torah, Hilchot Tefillah 11:1

כל מקום שיש בו עשרה מישראל צריך להכין לו בית שיכנסו בו לתפלה בכל עת תפלה ומקום זה נקרא בית הכנסת, וכופין בני העיר זה את זה לבנות להם בה"כ ולקנות להם ספר תורה נביאים וכתובים.

Wherever there are ten Jews, they must prepare a house into which they will enter for prayer at all times of prayer. This is called a *beit haknesset*, and the people of the town may force each other to build a beit haknesset and to purchase a Torah scroll, Prophets and Writings.

4. Rambam, Mishneh Torah, Hilchot Shecheinim 6:1

כופין בני העיר זה את זה לעשות חומה דלתים ובריח לעיר ולבנות להן בית הכנסת ולקנות ס"ת ונביאים וכתובים כדי שיקרא בהן כל מי שירצה לקרות מן הצבור.

The people of a city may force each other to build a wall, doors and a bolt for the city, and to build a beit haknesset, and to purchase a Torah scroll, Prophets and Writings, from which anyone from the community who wishes to read will be able to read.

History of the Large Shul vs. the Small Shul

5. Talmud, Succah 51b

רבי יהודה אומר: מי שלא ראה דיופלוסטון של אלכסנדריא של מצרים לא ראה בכבודן של ישראל. אמרו: כמין בסילקי גדולה היתה, סטיו לפנים מסטיו, פעמים שהיו בה כפלים כיוצאי מצרים, והיו בה שבעים ואחת קתדראות של זהב כנגד שבעים ואחד של סנהדרי גדולה, כל אחת ואחת אינה פחותה מעשרים ואחד רבוא ככרי זהב. ובימה של עץ באמצעיתה, וחזן הכנסת עומד עליה והסודרין בידו. וכיון שהגיע לענות אמן - הלה מניף בסודר, וכל העם עונין אמן. ולא היו יושבין מעורבין, אלא זהבין בפני עצמן, וכספין בפני עצמן, ונפחין בפני עצמן, וטרסיים בפני עצמן, וגרדיים בפני עצמן. וכשעני נכנס שם היה מכיר בעלי אומנתו ונפנה לשם, ומשם פרנסתו ופרנסת אנשי ביתו.

Rabbi Yehudah said: One who never saw the Dyoplostion of Alexandria of Egypt has never seen the glory of Israel. They said: It was like a big basilica, a platform within a platform, and sometimes there were double the number who left Egypt in it. It had 71 gold thrones, parallel to the 71 judges on the High Sanhedrin, and each was made of no less than 21,000 gold kikar.

There was a wood platform in the center, on which the chazan of the kneset would stand, holding scarves. When the time came to respond Amen, he waved the scarf and the nation would respond Amen.

They did not sit in a mix; the goldsmiths sat apart, the silversmiths sat apart, the blacksmiths sat apart, the copper smelters sat apart, and the weavers sat apart. When a pauper entered, he recognized the practitioners of his craft and turned to them, from there he found his support and the support of his household.

6. Rama Choshen Mishpat 149:31

בית שהיה בה בית הכנסת בביתו מימים רבים אסור לשנותו (מהרי"ק שורש קיג)

The community may not alter the status of a house which has hosted a beit haknesset for a long time.

7. Rashi to Shir haShirim 1:13

הקדוש ב"ה נתרצה לישראל על מעשה העגל ומצא להם כפרה על עונם ואמר התנדבו למשכן ויבא זהב המשכן ויכפר על זהב העגל:

Gd was appeased by Israel for the creation of the Calf, and He found atonement for their sin. He told them, 'Give to the Mishkan, and the gold of the Mishkan will come atone for the gold of the Calf.'

8. Ramban to Shemot 25:2

ואמר ואתם תהיו לי ממלכת כהנים וגוי קדוש (שם ו), והנה הם קדושים ראויים שיהיה בהם מקדש להשרות שכינתו ביניהם. ולכן צוה תחלה על דבר המשכן שיהיה לו בית בתוכם מקודש לשמו, ושם ידבר עם משה ויצוה את בני ישראל.

Gd said, 'You shall be, for me, a kingdom of priests and a holy nation.' They are holy, and it is appropriate to have a *mikdash* among them, for Gd to manifest His Shechinah among them. Therefore Gd first instructed them regarding the Mishkan, so that He would have a house among them, dedicated to His Name, and there He would speak with Moshe and instruct the Jewish people.

Multiple smaller shuls serve many needs: Practical: Geography, Functionality

9. R' Moshe Feinstein, Igrot Moshe Orach Chaim 2:46

הוא רק עצת היצר שהוא כדי לבטל בתי כנסיות של שומרי תורה ולהפכם במשך הזמן לקאנסערוואטיוון ורעפארמער, וגם תיכף כיון שיהיה גדול יותר מדי ירצו להעמיד מייקרעפאן לשמוע התפללות מהחזן וקה"ת ודרשת הרב שהוא חלול שבת וכדומה עוד הרבה איסורין ולכן צריך להשתדל בכל הכחות ולבטל זה.

וגם בעצם הדין אף אם היתה הכוונה לשם שמים כדי שיהיה ברוב עם, נמי אסור לבטל ביהכ"נ. דהא המג"א הביא בסימן קנ"ד סוף ס"ק כ"ג בשם הריב"ש שהמעכב לבנות ביהכ"נ אפילו יש ביהכ"נ אחרת בעיר מונע הרבים לעשות מצוה, אף שיכולים להתפלל בביהכ"נ האחד ויהיה עוד במעלה ברוב עם ומ"מ אסור ונחשב מונע הרבים לעשות מצוה שהוא מחייבי נידוי שמנה הרמב"ם פ"ו מת"ת הי"ד כמפורש בריב"ש סוף סימן רנ"ג. והטעם פשוט משום דיש מעלה בעוד ביהכ"נ לאלו שרחוקים מביהכ"נ הראשון שלפעמים יקשה להם לילך לביהכ"נ וכשיהיה עוד ביהכ"נ שקרוב להם ילכו לביהכ"נ ויתפללו בצבור וישמעו קדיש וקדושה וזה עדיף ממעלת ברוב עם וגם בלא זה לאפשי קדושה עדיף.

This is only the counsel of the yetzer hara, to nullify batei knessiyot of observant people and convert them, over time, to Conservative and Reform use. Also, immediately, it will be too large and they will wish to establish a microphone to hear the prayers from the chazan and kria haTorah and the rabbi's speech, involving desecration of Shabbat, and many similar prohibitions. Therefore, one must work with all force to oppose this.

Also, in terms of the essential law, even if they intended altruistically to amass a great nation, they still would not be permitted to nullify a beit haknesset. The Magen Avraham cited the Rivash that one who prevents construction of a beit haknesset prevents the masses from fulfilling a mitzvah, even if there is another beit haknesset and even if they can pray in the one beit haknesset and have the advantage of a great nation. It is still prohibited, and considered "preventing the masses from fulfilling a mitzvah," which is one of the actions that warrants ex-communication, as listed in the Rambam and explicit in the Rivash.

The reason is simply that there is an advantage in having another beit haknesset for those who live at a distance from the first beit haknesset, such that attending this beit haknesset would be difficult for them, and with another beit haknesset closer to them they would attend this one and pray with a community and hear kaddish and kedushah, and this is greater than the advantage of having a great nation. Further, even without this, it is better to increase sanctity.

Multiple smaller shuls serve many needs: Halachic: Kedushah, Kavvanah

10. R' Dovid ben Shlomo ibn Abi Zimra, Responsa of Radvaz 3:472

לא יתפלל אדם לא במקום שטורד מחשבתו ולא בזמן שמבטל את כוונתו ומעתה היחיד או הרבים שיש להם איבה או שנאה או כעס או מריבה עם הצבור אין תפלתם רצויה ואסור להם להתפלל שם שמחשבתו טרודה ולא יוכל לכוין בתפלתם וכ"ש אם מכעיסין אותו על פניו תמיד וכ"ש אם הכעס הוא עם מנהיגי הקהל ואי לאו דמיסתפינא הוה אמינא דטב ליה להתפלל ביחיד מלהתפלל בחברת בני אדם שאין דעתו נוחה מהם. עוד יש טעם אחר דאין ראוי לאדם שיתפלל אלא במקום שלבו חפץ. כי היכי דאמרינן אין אדם לומד תורה אלא במקום שלבו חפץ וטעמו של דבר כי בהביט האדם אל מי שדעתו נוחה בו נפשו מתעוררת אל הכוונה השלימה ודעתו מתרחבת ולבו שמה ונחה עליו אז רוח ה' כענין שאמרו בנבואה:

One may not pray in a place which will distract him, or at a time when he will be distracted. Therefore, an individual or group who experience open or concealed enmity, or anger, or a quarrel with the community will not be able to pray in an acceptable way, and they are not permitted to pray there, for their thoughts are distracted and they cannot focus in their prayers. This is certainly true if people overtly antagonize him, constantly. This is all the more true if the anger is with the leaders of the community.

Were I not afraid to say it, I would say that it would be better to pray privately than to pray with a group of people with whom his mind is not at peace.

There is also another reason: One should not pray other than in a place his heart desires, just as we say that one can learn Torah only where his heart desires. When a person looks at someone with whom he is at peace, his spirit is aroused into complete focus and his mind expands and his heart is joyous and the spirit of Gd then rests upon him, as we state regarding prophecy.

Multiple smaller shuls serve many needs: Institutional: Free-riding, Joining, Connection

11. Rodney Stark and Roger Finke, *Acts of Faith: Explaining the human side of Religion*, pg. 148

Indeed, religious organizations are especially vulnerable to free-riding, as Mary Douglas (1986) recognized, because some of the most important features of religion are collective goods. They exist only to the extent that some set of individuals pool their resources to provide the physical setting within which religious activities can occur and engage in the collective activities themselves – religious rituals such as worship services, weddings, and funerals are collective “goods.” The norms of religious groups, especially of lower-tension religious groups, are such that it is difficult to justify withholding these collective goods from anyone. This, of course, encourages a substantial amount of free-riding.

12. The Barna Group, *How Faith Varies by Church Size*, <http://www.barna.org/barna-update/article/12-faithspirituality/289-how-faith-varies-by-church-size>

Despite the substantial attention focused on Protestant mega-churches, such congregations draw about 9% of adults who frequent a Protestant church. In contrast, 41% of adults attending a Protestant church associate with a congregation of 100 or fewer adults. An additional 23% can be found at churches of 101 to 200 adults, 18% associate with bodies of 201 to 499 adults, and 9% can be found in churches of 500 to 999 adults.

13. The Barna Group, cited by Thom S. Ranier, *Surprising Insights from the Unchurched*, cited at <http://churchrelevance.com/qa-top-reasons-for-church-attendance/>

Top 9 Reasons that Church-Attendees Choose a Church

58% - Doctrine/Theology	53% - People Caring for Each Other	52% - Preaching
45% - Friendliness	45% - Children’s Programs	43% - Helping the Poor
36% - Denomination	35% - Like the Pastor	26% - Sunday School

14. *Dunbar’s Number*, http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dunbar%27s_number

Primatologists have noted that, due to their highly social nature, non-human primates have to maintain personal contact with the other members of their social group, usually through grooming. Such social groups function as protective cliques within the physical groups in which the primates live. The number of social group members a primate can track appears to be limited by the volume of the neocortex region of their brain. This suggests that there is a species-specific index of the social group size, computable from the species' mean neocortex volume.

In a 1992 article, Dunbar used the correlation observed for non-human primates to predict a social group size for humans. Using a regression equation on data for 38 primate genera, Dunbar predicted a human "mean group size" of 148 (casually rounded to 150), a result he considered exploratory due to the large error measure (a 95% confidence interval of 100 to 230).

Dunbar then compared this prediction with observable group sizes for humans...Dunbar's surveys of village and tribe sizes also appeared to approximate this predicted value, including 150 as the estimated size of a neolithic farming village; 150 as the splitting point of Hutterite settlements; 200 as the upper bound on the number of academics in a discipline's sub-specialization; 150 as the basic unit size of professional armies in Roman antiquity and in modern times since the 16th century; and notions of appropriate company size.

Dunbar has argued that 150 would be the mean group size only for communities with a very high incentive to remain together. For a group of this size to remain cohesive, Dunbar speculated that as much as 42% of the group's time would have to be devoted to social grooming. Correspondingly, only groups under intense survival pressure, such as subsistence villages, nomadic tribes, and historical military groupings, have, on average, achieved the 150-member mark. Moreover, Dunbar noted that such groups are almost always physically close: "... we might expect the upper limit on group size to depend on the degree of social dispersal. In dispersed societies, individuals will meet less often and will thus be less familiar with each, so group sizes should be smaller in consequence." Thus, the 150-member group would occur only because of absolute necessity — i.e., due to intense environmental and economic pressures.

15. Malcolm Gladwell, *The Tipping Point*

<http://www.nextreformation.com/wp-admin/general/tipping.htm>

Gore is the company that makes the water-resistant Gore-Tex fabric, as well as Glide dental floss, special Insulating coatings for computer cables, and a variety of sophisticated specialty cartridges, filter bags, and tubes for the automobile, semiconductor, pharmaceutical, and medical industries.

At Gore there are no titles. If you ask people who work there for their card, it will just say their name and underneath it the word "associate," regardless of how much money they make, or how much responsibility they have or how long they have been at the company. People don't have bosses, they have sponsors - no organization charts, no budgets, no elaborate strategic plans...

Gore is, in short, a very unusual company with a clear and well articulated philosophy. It is a big established company attempting to behave like a small entrepreneurial start-up. By all accounts, that attempt has been wildly successful. Whenever business experts make lists of the best American companies to work for, or whenever consultants give speeches on the best-managed American companies, Gore is on the list. It has a rate of employee turnover that is about a third the industry average. It has been profitable for thirty-five consecutive years and has growth rates and an innovative, high-profit product line that is the envy of the industry. Gore has managed to create a small-company ethos so infectious and sticky, that it has survived their growth into a billion-dollar company- with thousands of employees. And how did they do that? By (among other things) adhering to the rule of 150.

Wilbert "Bill" Gore - the late founder of the company - was no more influenced, of course, by the ideas of Robin Dunbar than the Hutterites were. Like them, he seems to have stumbled on the principle by trial and error. "We found again and again that things get clumsy at a hundred and fifty" he told an interviewer some years ago, so 150 employees per plant became the company goal. In the electronics division of the company, that means that no plant was built larger than 50,000 square feet, since there was almost no way to put many more than 150 people in a building that size. "People used to ask me, how do you do your long-term planning," Hen said. "And I'd say, that's easy, we put a hundred and fifty parking spaces in the lot, and when people start parking on the grass, we know it's time to build a new plant."

We have reason to avoid splits: Spiritual: Unity

16. R' Moshe Sofer, Responsa of Chatam Sofer 5:Choshen Mishpat 12:3

אוי לנו, שכך עלתה בימינו כינוס לצדיקי' הנאה להם והנאה לעולם. אבל מה נעש' שחטאתינו גרמו שא"א להכניסם, ע"כ יתפרדו.
Woe is us, that in our day such has happened! Gathering is good for tzaddikim, and good for the world! But what can we do, when our sins have created a situation in which we cannot gather them, and so they must separate.

We have reason to avoid splits: Halachic: Marit Ayin, Lo Titgodidu, Halachic strife, B'Rov am

17. Talmud, Yevamot 14a

אמר אביי: כי אמרינן לא תתגודדו - כגון שתי בתי דינים בעיר אחת, הללו מורים כדברי ב"ש והללו מורים כדברי ב"ה, אבל שתי בתי דינים בשתי עיירות - לית לן בה.

Abbaye said: We say 'Lo titgodidu' in a situation like that of two courts in one city, these ruling with Beit Shammai and these ruling with Beit Hillel. If there are two courts in two cities, though, then this does not apply.

18. Rambam, Mishneh Torah, Hilchot Avodah Zarah 12:14

ובכלל אזהרה זה שלא יהיו שני בתי דינין בעיר אחת זה נוהג כמנהג זה וזה נוהג כמנהג אחר, שדבר זה גורם למחלוקות גדולות שנאמר לא תתגודדו לא תעשו אגודות אגודות.

This law includes that there should not be two courts in one city, this following one practice and this following another practice, for this causes great divisions. As it is written, "Lo titgodidu' – Do not form multiple *agudot*."

19. Semachot 2:8

כל הפורש מדרכי ציבור אין מתעסקין עמו לכל דבר. אחיהם וקרוביהם לובשים לבנים ומתעטפין לבנים ואוכלין ושותין ושמחין שאבדו שונאיו של מקום, שנאמר הלוא משנאיך ה' אשנא ובתקומיך אתקוטט, תכלית שנאה שנאתים לאויבים היו לי.

We do not deal with one who leaves the paths of the community, at all. His brothers and relatives wear white and cloak themselves in white and eat and drink and celebrate that the enemies of Gd have been destroyed, as it is written, 'I will hate Your enemies, Gd, and I will fight with those who rise against You. I have hated them with the height of hatred; they have become my enemies.'

20. Rambam, Mishneh Torah, Hilchot Teshuvah 3:11

הפורש מדרכי צבור ואף על פי שלא עבר עבירות אלא נבדל מעדת ישראל ואינו עושה מצות בכללן ולא נכנס בצרתן ולא מתענה בתעניתן אלא הולך בדרכו כאחד מגויי הארץ וכאילו אינו מהן אין לו חלק לעולם הבא
'One who leaves the path of the community' – Even if he does not violate any sin, but he is only separate from the community of Israel and he does not perform mitzvot among them and he does not enter in their trouble and he does not fast for their fasts, but he goes his own way like one of the nations, as though he is not from them. Such a person has no share in the next world.

21. Kesef Mishneh Mishneh Torah, Hilchot Terumot 1:11

והמנהג הפשוט בכל א"י כדברי רבינו ומימינו לא שמענו פוצה פה לחלוק על זה. ועתה קם חכם אחד ונראה לו שהוא מתחסד בעשותו הפך המנהג הפשוט ומעשר פירות שגדלו בקרקע העכו"ם ונגמרה מלאכתן ביד עכו"ם וגם מירחן עכו"ם. והולך ומפתה אחרים שיקבלו עליהם לעשות כדבריו. ונראה פשוט בעיני שראוי למנעם מזה משום לא תתגודדו ועוד שמאחר שבכל אלו המדינות קבלו עליהם לעשות כדברי רבינו מלבד מה שנוגע בכבוד הראשונים שנהגו כן והרי ריב"א לא מלאו לבו לסמוך על סברתו לבטל המנהג ומי הוא זה ואיזהו אשר מלאו לבו לעשות כן...לכן יש לגזור עליהם שלא ינהגו כן ואם יסרבו יכופו אותם כההיא דשמואל דא"ל אכול משחא ואי לא כתיבנא עלך זקן ממרא.

The practice that has spread throughout Israel is like the words of our master, and we never heard anyone open a mouth to disagree. Now one scholar has arisen and it appears to him that he is being pious by doing the opposite of the practice that has spread... and he goes and seduces others to accept his practice for themselves.

It appears clear in my eyes that it would be good to prevent people from this, under the law of 'Lo titgodidu.' Further, in all of these lands they have accepted to practice according to the view of our master, aside from the honor of earlier generations who practiced this way, and the Riva did not have the hubris to depend upon his own view and nullify the practice. כן לעשות כן...מי הוא זה ואיזהו אשר מלאו לבו לעשות כן.

Therefore, it would be appropriate to decree upon them not to practice this. Should they refuse, we should compel them, as in the case (Yerushalmi Avodah Zarah 2:8) in which Shemuel declared, "Eat the oil, and if you will not then we will publish that you are a rebellious elder!"

22. Shulchan Aruch Orach Chaim 298:14

היו יושבים בבה"מ והביאו להם אור, אחד מברך לכולם.

If they are sitting in the beit hamidrash when someone brings a flame, one should recite the berachah for all of them.

23. Mishneh Berurah 134:10

אפי' אם מתחלה היה עומד מבחוץ מצוה ליכנס לביהכ"נ לראות כשמוציאין ומכניסין הס"ת משום ברב עם הדרת מלך:

Even if one was standing outside, it is a mitzvah for him to enter the beit haknesset to see when they bring out and bring in the sefer torah, because of the principle of, "The glory of the king is in a great nation."

24. R' Moshe Feinstein, Igrot Moshe 2:46

מסתבר שאף הרא"מ שהביא המג"א שפליג וסובר דאם ביהכ"נ האחד מכילה אותם אסורים ליפרד הוא רק מטעם שכיון שעד עתה מקיימים ברוב עם אין למנוע מעלה זו בשביל מעלות האחרות שיהיה בשני בתי כנסיות אף שהם עדיפי

It would be logical to suggest that even the Re"em, whom the Magen Avraham cited, who disagreed and felt that they may not separate so long as a single shul can contain them, said so only because they had a large nation until then. He felt that one should not prevent this advantage for the sake of the other advantages that would come with having two batei knessiyot, even though those other advantages are greater.

25. Shulchan Aruch Orach Chaim 90:18

בית המדרש קבוע קדוש יותר מבהכ"נ, ומצוה להתפלל בו יותר מב"ה, והוא שיתפלל ב'.

הגה: וי"א דאפי' בלא י' עדיף להתפלל בבה"מ הקבוע לו; ודוקא מי שתורתו אומנתו ואינו מתבטל בלאו הכי (הרי"י פ"ק דברכות). ואפילו הכי לא ירגיל עצמו לעשות כן, שלא ילמדו עמי הארץ ממנו ויתבטלו מב"ה

Mechaber: A fixed beit hamidrash is of greater sanctity than a beit haknesset, and prayer there is a greater mitzvah than prayer in a beit haknesset, so long as one prays with ten.

Rama: Some say that even without ten it is better to pray in one's fixed beit hamidrash, if one's Torah is his trade and he never ceases to study other than for this. Even in such a case, though, one should not accustom himself to do this, lest ignorant people learn from him and cease attending the beit haknesset.

We have reason to avoid splits: Institutional: Danger to old institution, Communal Property

26. R' Yitzchak ben Sheshet Perfet, Responsa of Rivash 253

גם מה שאמרת, אם באו יחידים לעשות להם מדרש לתפלה, וקמו אנשים למנוע; אם נתן לשמוע? ודאי משתקין אותו בנזיפה, שמעכבין את הרבים מלעשות מצוה, ואין עון גדול מזה. וכבר מנה הרמב"ם ז"ל זה, באותן כ"ד דברי' שב"ד נזקקי' לנדות העובר; ואיתא בירושלמי דמוע"ק: מעכב רבים מלעשות מצוה, צריך נדוי. ואם נותנין טעם לדבריהם, מפני ישוב הבה"כ, שלא תחרב, אז הקהל מעיינין בדבר, ועושין תקנה לקיים את שתיהן

Also, regarding your comment about individuals who have come to establish a study hall for prayer, and others have arisen to prevent it, and the question of whether one should listen [to the latter group]: Certainly, we silence them harshly, for they prevent the masses from fulfilling a mitzvah and there is no greater sin than this. The Rambam already counted this among the twenty-four actions for which Beit Din ex-communicates a trespasser, and the Yerushalmi says that one who prevents the masses from fulfilling a mitzvah should be ex-communicated.

And if they explain their words on the grounds of the establishment of the beit haknesset, to prevent it from being ruined, then the community should examine the matter and create enactments to maintain both.

27. R' Avraham Gombiner, Magen Avraham 154:23

הקהל יכולים לגזור שלא יתפללו י' חוץ לבה"כ מפני מראית העין מפני האומות שיסברו שהם רבים וגם מפני היחידים שאין נותנים המסים ומתפללים ב' במקום אחר

The community may decree that no minyan pray outside the shul, because of appearances – lest the nations think that they are many. Also, because of the individuals themselves who do not pay the taxes and pray elsewhere.

28. R' Eliyahu Mizrahi, Responsa of Re"em 53

בנדון דידן נמי שנחלקו הקהל לב' כתות כל אחת מתפללת לעצמה והכת האחת מהן היא רוב הקהל וגם שלא היו הם הנפרדים אבל הם עומדים על הכנסת הראשון שבררו אותו כל הקהל טרם החלוק במקום שנודרו שם כל ההקדשות שנתבטלה בעונותינו הרבים מגזרת המלכות וגם כל עניי הקהל אשר עקר כל ההקדשות שלהם לא נעשו אלא בעבורם הם עמהם וגם הפרוד שנפרדו מהם מעוט הקהל שלא כדין עשו מה שעשו שהרי היה להם להמשך אחר רוב דיעות הקהל כפי מה שגזרה תורתנו הקדושה אחרי רבים להטות ואפילו אם היו המועטים יותר עשירים ויותר חכמים מהמרובים כדאוכחנ' לעיל, הנה מכל אלו הפנים שורת הדין נותנת שיתנו כל ההקדשות בידי הכת הגדולה שיעשו בהם כרצונם אם... אבל היכא דנחלקו הקהל לשתי כנסיות מפני שאין המקום מכיל את כלם או מחמת שום סבה אחרת לא מפני חלוק דיעותיהם והיה החלק האחד יותר מהחלק השני ונתרצו כלם לחלק כל ההקדשות שלהם רק שנסתפקו באופן החלוק אם יהיה לחצאים מאחר שכל חלק מהם הוא כנסת לעצמו או על פי מספר הגברים או שורת הדין נותנה שיהיה החלוק לפי מספר הגברים מכיון דאית להו לכלהו הנאה וריוח בהנהו הקדשות

In our case, too, the community is split into two groups and each prays on its own, and:

- One group includes the majority of the community and they were not the ones who broke away but rather they remain in the original kneset chosen by the community before the division,
- Which is the site of all of the hekdeshot that have now been nullified due to our great sins by royal decree, and
- All of the community's paupers, for whom have the hekdeshot were originally dedicated, are with them, and
- The secession itself by the minority of the community was improper, for they should have followed the communal majority, as the Torah decrees, "Incline after the majority," even if the minority are the wealthy or the wise.

For all of these reasons, the law is that they should give the hekdeshot to the larger group to do with as they will... But where the community split into two groups because the space was insufficient or for some other reason and not internal disagreement, and one portion was larger than the other, and they agreed to divide up the hekdeshot and only disputed as to how to go about it – whether in half because each is an independent kneset, or based on the number of people – then the law is that they should divide it based upon the number of people, since all of them have a right to benefit and profit from these hekdeshot.

29. Talmud, Nedarim 46b

אמר ליה רב יוסף, הרי בית הכנסת, דכמי שאין בו כדי חלוקה דמי

Rav Yosef said: A beit haknesset has the status of an entity which is insufficient for splitting...

30. R' Yitzchak Elchanan Spektor, Be"er Yitzchak Orach Chaim 24

מוכח מהש"ס הנ"ל בנדרים דקאמרי והא בהכ"נ דכמו שאין בה דין חלוקה דמי, ואמאי לא אמרו בקצרה הרי בהכ"נ דאין בה דין חלוקה, אלא ע"כ מוכח כסברת הט"ז הנ"ל דבאמת בהכ"נ מקרי יש בה חלוקה דזה יכול להסתלק מחלקו לצד זה וזה יסתלק לצד זה אלא דכיון דאין דרך לחלק כן לכן אין יכול לכופף לחבירו לחלק, והוי כמו נשתתפו לכ"ז שיהי' הבהכ"נ קיים ולא מצי לחלק שלא מרצון חבירו דהוי כמו שהתנו בפירושו,

It is clear from that passage in which they say, "A beit haknesset has the status of an entity which is insufficient for splitting." Why do they not say more briefly, "A beit haknesset cannot be split?" Rather, it is clear that we follow the view of the Taz that a beit haknesset actually can be split, for one could leave his portion to one side and one could leave his portion to the other side, but since such splitting is not normal, one cannot force the other to split. They are like people who joined for as long as the beit haknesset exists, and each cannot split without the desire of the other. It's as though they had an explicit agreement to this effect.

How might we maintain larger shuls and yet encourage people to stay?

31. Scott L. Feld, Bernard Grofman, *Toward a Sociometric Theory of Representation: Representing Individuals Enmeshed in a Social Network*

<http://www.socsci.uci.edu/~bgrofman/R35%20Grofman%20and%20Feld.%201988.Toward%20a%20sociometric%20theory%20of%20rep....pdf>

Specifically, we suggest that sociometric representation requires that, for each citizen, there should be at least one individual representative who is in a position to receive information from that citizen via informal interpersonal channels. This means that there should be a short chain of personal relationships that leads from each citizen to some member of the legislature.

32. Eui Hang Shin and Hyung Park, *An Analysis of Causes of Schisms in Ethnic Churches, Sociological Analysis 49:3 (1988) pg. 240-241*

It was hypothesized that the status competition among members of a congregation would be conducive to formation of factions within the church and strife between the factions will lead to schisms. As indicated in Table 5, strife between factions within the congregation were cited as the primary cause of the schisms in 13 of the total 34 cases. Even in the remaining 21 cases the factional struggle was at least indirectly behind such disputed issues as denominational affiliation, formal affiliation with a larger church system, church building purchase, and others. The factional conflicts had been brewing for some period of time before the formal eruption which might have been precipitated by any of the formal issues...

Unlike nonreligious voluntary associations in the immigrant community, the congregation of a church consists of members with divergent backgrounds directly reflecting the variance in the total Korean immigrant population. Hence, it is inevitable that cliques and factions will be formed within a congregation on the basis of shared interests and backgrounds.

33. Talmud, Megilah 26a

אמר רבי יהודה: מעשה בבית הכנסת של טורסיים שהיה בירושלים שמכרוה לרבי אליעזר,

R' Yehudah said: Once, the beit haknesset of the Tursiyyim in Yerushalayim was sold to R' Eliezer...

34. Balswick & Layne, *Studying Social Organization in the Local Church: A Sociometric Approach, Review of Religious Research 14:2 (1973), pg. 106-107*

In a previous study (Balswick and Faulkner, 1971) the formation of ministerial cliques was found to be based on theological beliefs. For our sample of congregational members we found that, although there are theological differences among the members, neither cluster formation nor clique formation within clusterings reflect these differences. An examination of the four clusterings will show that there are no consistent groupings of self-defined fundamentalists, conservatives, moderates or liberals. Theological belief is not a factor in clique formation, nor do clique members differ theologically from marginals and isolates. However, another factor, sex, does seem to account for most of the cliques within clusterings. The Conjugal Clustering, for instance, has two major cliques, one consisting of all males and the other consisting of all females. Except for the Christian Education Clustering, similar cliques are discernible within the other clusterings.