A Painful Lesson in Empathy

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com



The Evolution of the Visitors

1. lob 2:11-13

And three of Job's friends heard all of this evil that had befallen him, and each came from his place – Eliphaz of Teiman, Bildad of Shuach, and Tzofar of Naamah. And they gathered together, to come comfort and console him. And they raised their eyes from afar and did not recognize him; and they raised their voices and cried, and each tore his garment, and they threw dirt upon their heads, heavenward. And they sat with him on the ground for seven days and seven nights, and none spoke a word to him, for they saw that the pain was great.

2. Job 4:2 - Eliphaz

If I would experiment with a word to you, would you be exhausted? But who could refrain from words?

3. Job 5:17 - Eliphaz

Fortunate is the man whom Gd rebukes; do not reject the rebuke of Shakkai!

4. Job 8:18-19 - Bildad

If He will swallow it from its place, and deny it, saying, "I have not seen you," this will be the joy of its ways, and from other dirt it will sprout.

5. Job 8:5 - Bildad

If you will put your hope in Gd, and to Shakkai you will plead.

6. Job 11:2-3 - Tzophar

Should many words not be answered? Should a man of lips be declared right? Your lies silence the masses; you mock, and no one puts you to shame.

7. Job 15:2 - Eliphaz

Should the wise respond with wind, filling his belly with the east wind?

8. Job 18:4 - Bildad

You, who tears his soul in rage, should the land be abandoned because of you, and should the Rock leave His place?

9. Amos Chacham, Daat Mikra to Job 2:11

These three maintained their loyalty and came to comfort him, and they became, unknowingly, tools of the Satan.

Job's Response

10. Job 6:15 - Job

My brothers betrayed me like a wadi; like a channel passing through wadis.

11. Job 12:2-3 - Job

True, you are the many – and with you, wisdom dies. I have a heart like yours, too; I am no lesser than you; and who does not possess words like yours?

12. Job 13:3-5 - Job

But I will speak to Gd, and I would wish to rebuke Gd. But you are crafters of lies; all of you are non-healers. I wish you would be silent! And this would be wisdom, for you.

13. Job 16:4-5 - Job

I could speak like you, too. If you were in my place, I would join with you with words, and I would shake my head upon you. I would strengthen you with my mouth, and the movement of my lips would spare you.

14. Job 19:2-3, 19:13-14, 19:21, 19:23-24 - Job

²How long will you make me grieve, and depress me with words? ³Ten times you have shamed me; you are not ashamed to treat me as a stranger... ¹³He has distanced my brothers from me; those who know me have only become estranged from me. ¹⁴My neighbours ceased, and those who knew me forgot me... ²¹Show me favour, show me favour, you, my friends, for the Hand of Gd has struck me... ²³Would that my words would be recorded, would that they would be engraved in a book. ²⁴With an iron pen and lead, forever they would be chiseled in the stone.

15. Job 20:2-3 - Tzophar

Therefore my thoughts make me respond, and because of my feelings within. I hear the rebuke which shames me, and a spirit from my understanding makes me respond.

16. Job 22:5-7 - Eliphaz

Is your evil not great? There is no end to your sin! For you take security from your brothers for nothing, and you strip the clothes of those who are bare. You do not give water to the tired, and you withhold bread from the hungry...

17. Job 25:4 - Bildad

Can a man be found righteous with Gd? And how can one born of woman be found meritorious?

18. Job 42:7-8

And after Gd said these words to Job, and Gd said to Eliphaz of Teiman: My anger rages against you, and against your two friends, for you did not speak of Me properly, like My servant Job. And now, take for yourselves seven bulls and seven rams, and go to My servant Job, and bring for yourselves a burnt offering, and Job My servant will pray for you, for him I will favour, so as not to act with *nevalah* upon you. For you did not speak of Me properly, like My servant Job.

19. Rashi to 42:7, based on Talmud, Bava Batra 16b

He did not sin against Me other than by saying, "He destroys complete and wicked"... And if he added words, he spoke because of the harsh suffering which weighed on him and overpowered him. But you sinned when you declared him wicked... And you strengthened him in his wickedness, and in the end you were silenced and defeated before him, and you should have comforted him as Elihu did. And not only did Job experience pain and suffering, but you added iniquity to your sin by angering him.

20. Talmud, Bava Metzia 58b

"And you shall not abuse each other (Vayikra 25:17)" – This is verbal abuse. How? If he had repented, he should not say to him, "Remember your first deeds." If he was descended from people who had converted, he should not say to him, "Remember your parents' deeds." If he had converted, and he had now come to learn Torah, he should not say to him, "The mouth that ate non-kosher will now learn the Torah spoken by the mouth of Gd!" If he is suffering, if he is ill, or he buries his children, one should not say to him as his friends said to Job, "Your reverence is your confidence [or: foolishness], your hope and the end of your path. Remember: Who is innocent and is destroyed?"

Empathy

21. Cameron, Inzlicht and Cunningham, Empathy is Actually a Choice, New York Times, 7/10/15

[W]e believe that empathy is a choice that we make whether to extend ourselves to others. The "limits" to our empathy are merely apparent, and can change, sometimes drastically, depending on what we want to feel. Two decades ago, the psychologist Daniel Batson and colleagues conducted a study that showed that if people expected their empathy to cost them significant money or time, they would avoid situations that they believed would trigger it. More recently, one of us, Daryl Cameron, along with the psychologist Keith Payne, conducted an experiment to see if similar motivational factors could explain why we seem more empathetic to single victims than to large numbers of them.

Participants in this study read about either one or eight child refugees from the Darfur region of Sudan. Half of the participants were led to expect that they would be asked to make a donation to the refugee or refugees, whereas the other half were not. When there was no financial cost involved in feeling empathy, people felt more empathy for the eight children than for the one child, reversing the usual bias. If insensitivity to mass suffering stemmed from an intrinsic limit to empathy, such financial factors shouldn't have made a difference.

22. Rabbi Shlomo Kluger (grandson of the more famous Rabbi Shlomo Kluger), Siach Shlomo

אכן שוד ושבר אם יקרו ויאתיו על איש ועל בני אדם יחד... אז אין להאיש ההוא אף כי פגעי הזמן נחתו בו יתר מבזולתו להרגיע את רוחו לבל יצר לו בצרת אחרים... באמרו כי מקבל הוא על עצמו באהבה, זאת היא מדה מגונה ודרך מכוערה דאין לקבל באהבה מכאוב, צער וצרת אחרים, והעושה ככה חולה על ראשו קללת חכמנו ז"ל, "ת"ר בזמן שישראל שרויין בצער ופירש אחד מהם באים שני מלאכי השרת ומניחים ידיהם על ראשו, 'פלוני זה שפירש מן הצבור אל יראה בנחמת הצבור"...

But if harm comes upon a person and upon others... then that person, who may even suffer more than others, may not calm himself and avoid feeling the pain of others... saying that he accepts it upon himself with love. This is a repugnant trait and an ugly path; one may not accept with love the ailment, pain and trouble of others! One who does so is subject to the curse of our sages, "When Israel is in pain and one of them separates from the community, two ministering *malachim* place their hands on his head and say, 'So-and-so who separated from the community shall not see the comfort of the community.'"

23. Talmud, Bava Batra 16b

"איוב לא בדעת ידבר ודבריו לא בהשכל" אמר רבא, מכאן שאין אדם נתפס בשעת צערו.

"Job does not speak wisely, and his words are not with insight." Rava said: From here we learn that a person is not held responsible for his time of pain.

24. Talmud, Bava Kama 38a

רב שמואל בר יהודה שכיבא ליה ברתא אמרו ליה רבנן לעולא קום ניזל נינחמיה אמר להו מאי אית לי גבי נחמתא דבבלאי דגידופא הוא דאמרי מאי אפשר למיעבד הא אפשר למיעבד עבדי

Rav Shemuel bar Yehudah's daughter passed away. The sages said to Ulla: Let us go and comfort him! Ulla replied: What would be my business with Babylonian comfort, which is blasphemous! They say, "What can you do?" implying that if they could do something [to change it], they would.

25. Shemot 2:11, with Rashi

ַנְיּגְדַּל מֹשֶׁה וַיֵּצֵא אֶל־אֶחָיו וַיַּרְא בְּסִבְלֹתָם וַיַּרְא אִישׁ מִצְרִי מַכֶּה אִישׁ־עִבְרִי מֵאֶחָיו: רש"י: נתן עיניו ולבו להיות מיצר עליהם:

And Moshe matured and went out to his brethren, and he saw their suffering, and he saw an Egyptian man beating a Hebrew man, from his brethren.

Rashi: He turned his eyes and heart to be pained for them.

26. Shemot 2:25, with Rashi

וַיַּרָא אֱלֹקִים אֶת־בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל וַיַּדַע אֱלֹקִים: רש"י: נתן עליהם לב ולא העלים עיניו:

And Gd saw the Children of Israel, and Gd knew.

Rashi: He turned His heart and did not hide His eyes.

27. Rabbi Yitzchak of Volozhin, citing his father in the preface to Nefesh haChaim

והיה רגיל להוכיח אותי על שראה שאיני משתתף בצערא דאחרינא. וכה היה דברו אלי תמיד שזה כל האדם לא לעצמו נברא רק להועיל לאחריני ככל אשר ימצא בכחו לעשות

My father always used to rebuke me, as he saw that I would not experience the pain of others. This is what he always told me: "This is a person's entire purpose. A person is not created for himself. A person is created only to benefit others, with whatever power is in his possession."

28. Rabbi Yerucham Levovitz. Daat Chochmah uMussar III 295

גדול כ"כ ענין של נושא בעול עם חבירו, מפני שזה כל התורה כולה, היינו איחוד הנפשות להרגיש זא"ז, וכל לימוד התורה, הלימוד והמעשה, הנה סוף המטרה שיתאחדו הנפשות להיות מרגישים זא"ז שיהיו אחד ממש.

The issue of bearing the yoke with others is so great, because this is the entire Torah, meaning the joining of souls to feel each others' feelings. All of Torah study, all of the learning and all of the deeds, the final goal is that all souls should be joined, to feel each others' feelings, to truly be one.