

## Chullin 80

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

80a

Gemara: Continuing discussion of identity of a species

- Three mitzvot: מתנות כהונה דבהמה, אותו ואת בנו דבהמה, כיסוי דם דחיה
- One is obligated if:

| #  | Mother | Father | We care about father | Partial identity suffices |
|----|--------|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|
| 1  | YES    | YES    |                      |                           |
| 2  | NO     | YES    | YES                  | YES                       |
| 3a | YES    | NO     | NO                   |                           |
| 3b | YES    | NO     |                      | YES                       |

- Rav Pappa's stance
  - Rabbi Eliezer: We might care about the father; partial identity is insignificant – 1; Maybe 3
  - Rabbanan: We might care about the father; partial identity is significant – 1; Maybe 2 & 3a; 3b
- Therefore:
  - We said not to שחט a כוי on Yom Tov, because we are in doubt about כיסוי
    - Must be Row #2, and the view of Rabbanan
  - Rabbanan said to give to kohanim from כוי and R' Eliezer said not to give
    - Must be Row #3
  - Rabbanan said אותו ואת בנו applies to כוי and R' Eliezer said it does not
    - If it's Row #2, Rabbanan say Maybe and R' Eliezer says No
    - If it's Row #3, Rabbanan say Assur and R' Eliezer says Maybe

Gemara: Views on the genetics of a koy<sup>1</sup>

Gemara: Status of wild goats and שור הבר<sup>2</sup>

(80b) Gemara: שחיטה שאינה ראויה and אותו ואת בנו<sup>3</sup>

|                       | Rabbanan  |  | R' Shimon                           |                  |
|-----------------------|---|--|-------------------------------------|------------------|
|                       | 1   | 2  | 1                                   | 2                |
| Both kodashim outside | Kareis for chutz<br>Pasul as chutz<br>Malkos as chutz | No kareis<br>Pasul as chutz<br>Malkos אותו ואת בנו | Kareis for chutz<br>Malkos as chutz | Kareis for chutz |
| Both chullin inside   | Pasul as pnim   | Pasul as pnim<br>Malkos אותו ואת בנו               |                                     |                  |
| Both kodashim inside  |   | Pasul אותו ואת בנו<br>Malkos as pasul              |                                     |                  |

Why don't we list malkos for second as מחוסר זמן?

- Correct, but it's extraneous
- R' Zeira – It's lav hanitak la'aseh from the aseh of bringing it on time<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> What does בריה בפני עצמו mean? (Tosafot ולא vs Ramban Yevamos 83a)

<sup>2</sup> Do we know what תאו and זמר are? (Rashi, Maharsha)

<sup>3</sup> Note: Even according to R' Shimon, it really is shechitah as far as issues like impurity

<sup>4</sup> Is that really a lav hanitak la'aseh? (Rashi, Tosafot)