

37a

Mishnah: How can you tell whether a **מסוכנת** was killed by shechitah or it died on its own?¹

- What are the signs?
 - Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel / Rabban Gamliel – Jerk of foreleg and rearleg
 - R' Eliezer – Spray suffices
 - R' Shimon – Can tell if there is blood on walls (of the neck – gemara)
 - Chachamim – Shaking foreleg, rearleg or tail
- "Shaking" for a light animal is forward and backward
- All of this is only where the animal is known to be ill

Gemara: What source permits **מסוכנת**?²

- I'd have assumed it was off-limits because the Torah permits only "חיה" for eating
- #1 – Because the Torah only prohibits neveilah
 - And don't equate neveilah with **מסוכנת**, since the Torah needs to mention neveilah
 - But maybe neveilah is lo taaseh, and the exclusive permission for חיה adds an aseah?
- #2 – Because we need a special source to prohibit tereifah
 - But maybe tereifah is **מסוכנת**, and the exclusive permission for חיה adds an aseah?
 - Then we wouldn't need a pasuk to prohibit neveilah
 - But maybe טריפה = **מסוכנת** = נבלה, 2 lav and 1 aseah for a tereifah that died?
- #3 – Because of וחלב נבלה וחלב טרפה יעשה לכל מלאכה ואכל לא תאכלוהו
 - The pasuk stresses that fat becomes neveilah, with a double-issur³
 - The pasuk doesn't rely on טריפה=**מסוכנת** to deduce that fat from a neveilah is prohibited.
 - So **מסוכנת** is not tereifah, so the special source prohibiting tereifah shows **מסוכנת** is fine
 - (37b) But maybe the pasuk was for a נבלה that was killed violently and never was a **מסוכנת**?
 - Answer: Any animal that dies goes through a **מסוכנת** stage
- #4 – Torah said וחלב נבלה וחלב טריפה to teach that in these cases the meat and fat are both אסור
 - As opposed to **מסוכנת**, where only one is אסור
- #5 – Yechezkel praised himself for not eating **מסוכנת** – If it were prohibited, this would not be great praise⁴
 - Yechezkel did not have improper thoughts⁵
 - Yechezkel also didn't eat before portions were given to kohanim⁶ or if a shailah was asked^{7 8}

Gemara: A **מסוכנת** cannot stand, even if it can still chew tough wood

¹ If it died on its own, it is mutar lechatchilah, despite the mishnah's language (Tosafot)

² Some explain that we permit because it may heal (Rashbash 300); others because it's not dead (Or Sameach Hilchos Shechitah 8:17)

³ Issur kollel

⁴ Then why didn't he eat it? (Rashi; Shulchan Aruch Yoreh Deah 17:3)

⁵ This is prohibited in any case, but violation is rampant, and so Yechezkel was praiseworthy (Tosafot)

⁶ Other than according to the view that such an animal is like טבל (Tosafot)

⁷ The key is "הורה", puffed up like pregnancy (Margaliyos haShas)

⁸ Why are these compared to פיגול? (Maharsha)