

Chullin 31

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

31a

Gemara: "Neck's width" is in addition to the width of whatever is being cut

Gemara: Where does מוליד ומביא not help?

- A knife with a point on the end, since that could be מחליד or it could pierce
- Our three implements
 - Needle – Sharp point, might jab
 - Leather-worker's needle – Thicker than a needle; less concern for jabbing, concern for derasah¹
 - Izemel – Razor-like; least concern for jabbing
- A needle is no good, since that could puncture
- When we said כל שהוא is good for מוליד-מביא, was that to include a leather-worker's needle?
 - Maybe that was only for איזמל

Mishnah: We require human action; a falling knife is not שחיטה

Gemara: What about שחיטה without intent?²

- Mishnah's requirement of human action seems not to require human intent
- Rava – This is like R' Nasan on throwing a knife with intent to stick it in a wall, and that's the law
- Rava also said this regarding חש"ו. In throwing there is no intent to cut; in חש"ו there is no דעת.

Gemara: What about immersion without intent?

- Machlokes
 - Rav – It works for husband, not for terumah; husband is חולין
 - R' Yochanan – It doesn't work
- How do we know that immersing for chullin doesn't require intent?
 - Proof from our acceptance of a wave,³ where one doesn't intend to be immersed.^{4 5}
 - (31b) But maybe that approval is only in a case of intent?
 - Proof from purification of hands when one dips them in water to withdraw fallen produce
 - Two challenges from braisos, but each is defeated.
 - R' Yochanan has another tanna to support him.

Gemara: Merging the two intent issues, regarding חולין

- Rav Simi bar Ashi – R' Yochanan says we follow סתם משנה, and ours for שחיטה said intent is not needed!
 - All agree re: שחיטה that we only need intent for korbanot
 - Even those who disqualified a thrown knife only require intent for cutting, not שחיטה
 - Rava – R' Nasan makes more sense; there is no reason to distinguish between זביחה and cutting⁶
- One last point: How was there immersion באונס?
 - If another forced her, then you have that person's intent!
 - Per R' Nasan (no intent required) - She fell in.
 - Per Chachamim (who require some intent for the action) – She went to cool off partially and fell in

¹ Ran, cited in Zevach Todah to Shulchan Aruch Yoreh Deah 8:1

² This is not tied to the discussions of מצוות צריכות כוונה in general, because these are not true מצוות (R' Akiva Eiger in Drush v'Chidush)

³ Would need a wave with a volume of about two bathtubs

⁴ A rebbe is like a wave; if he comes to you, purification requires that you anticipate his arrival (Kotzker Rebbe, see Margaliyos haShas)

⁵ Note Igrot Moshe Even haEzer 4:14 on the status of the daughter of a niddah who went swimming

⁶ ולא זכיתי שתאמר יציאת מצרים בלילות