

Chullin 19

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

19a

Gemara: Continuing the discussion of defining hagramah

- This is the hierarchy of views on the מקום שחיטה:
 - Rabbanan – All below cricoid cartilage
 - R' Yosi b'R' Yehudah – Majority below cricoid cartilage
 - R' Chanina ben Antigonus – Below thyroid cartilage. Rav Nachman agrees; this is law.¹
- Within R'Yosi b'R' Yehudah's view, what if he cut from the outside into the מקום שחיטה?
 - Version I
 - Rav Huna/Rav Asi² - It must first die via shechitah
 - Rav Chisda objects: But we accept where the trachea was already flawed! Maybe:
 - R' Yosi b"R' Yehudah accepts even where hagramah was first, and
 - Chachamim at least accept where shechitah was first?
 - Might Rav Chisda support his position from 27a that majority is like the whole?
 - Version II
 - Rav Huna/Rav Asi
 - R' Yosi b"R' Yehudah accepts a pre-flawed trachea
 - Chachamim at least accept where shechitah was first
 - Support from 27a that majority is like the whole
 - Rav Chisda – But maybe 27a was only R' Yosi b'R' Yehudah?
- Outside, inside, then outside
 - Rav Huna/Rav – Kosher; neshamah leaves with שחיטה
 - Rav Yehudah/Rav – Not kosher; when neshamah leaves, majority wasn't shechitah
- Inside, outside, then inside
 - Rav Yehudah/Rav – Kosher
 - Rav Huna – Non-kosher
 - (19b) Rav Chisda justifies Rav Huna – The neshamah leaves with hagramah
 - In Sura, Rav Nachman said שחט-הגרים-שחט was the kosher "comb" case
 - But perhaps the "comb" is kosher only within מקום שחיטה?
- Rav Kahana asked Rav Yehudah a series of questions, and received answers³
 - שחט-הגרים-שחט Kosher
 - הגרים-שחט-הגרים Not kosher
 - שחט במקום נקב (the first half is pre-severed) Kosher
 - שחט ופגע בו נקב (the second half was pre-severed) Not kosher
 - R' Yochanan objected to this ruling
 - Rava explains the objection: In the latter case he cut all that kept the animal alive

Mishnah: Parts of the neck – Throat and Side⁴ are for shechitah, Back is for melikah

Gemara: What עורף is kosher for melikah?

- We must be talking about מול עורף regarding melikah
- How do we know that ממול ערפו refers to this site? מול is nearby, and עורף is back of face
- Sons of R' Chiyya said that for מליקה we move the סימנים to the back of the neck, so they are still cut first

¹ Don't we know this is the law because R' Chanina ben Antigonus was introduced with "העיד"? (Maharsha, Rashash)

² Not "Rabbi Asi" (Tosafot)

³ Rosh 1:24 explains: Veering out of the מקום שחיטה means it's not an act of שחיטה at all. As opposed to דרסה, where it's a bad שחיטה.

⁴ Is this lechatchilah or bedieved? (Rashi, Tosafot)