

Chullin 17

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

17a

Gemara (tangent): R' Yishmael vs R' Akiva re: **בשר תאווה & בשר נחירה**

- The debate
 - R' Yishmael – שחיטה was always required,¹ בשר תאווה became permitted when they entered Israel
 - 1 – Supporting R' Yishmael - ושחט את בן הבקר was instructed in midbar!
 - 2 – Supporting R' Yishmael – Moshe's challenge to Gd re: the slav² was "ישחט להם"!
 - 3 – Supporting R' Yishmael – One doesn't cover blood from נחירה!
 - R' Akiva – תאווה always permitted, שחיטה became obligatory when they entered Israel³
 - 4 – Supporting R' Akiva – Torah tells you to eat shelamim like you eat deer and hart!
- Per R' Akiva, what about meat that underwent נחירה in the midbar and was brought into Israel?⁴
 - Why is this a question? All food was permitted during the seven years of conquest!
 - This is for after those seven years⁵
 - Or, that was for the meat which the Canaanim prepared, not what we brought in⁶

Gemara: Rava overturns everything we've done with the mishnah, so that it will be about the act of שחיטה

Gemara: Flawed knives

- A flaw is a problem if it has hooks on each end
- (17b) Braisa has two kinds of flawed knives:
 - Many flaws – Like a saw, pasul even if hook is only on one edge
 - One flaw – Kosher if the hook is only on one edge (מסוכסכת)
- Acceptance of מסוכסכת is only if the flaw is on the beginning of the blade, and one cut unidirectionally
- Rava – Two-hooked flaw is no good; One-hooked & one way is kosher בדיעבד, Sloped is kosher לכתחילה

Gemara: Knife-checking

- How do we know to check the knife?
 - #1 - Shemuel I 14:34⁷ – Shaul gives them a knife to use, and says to use that
 - #2 – Actually, it's rabbinic,⁸ to honour the sage, and the pasuk is אסמכתא
- How do you check?
 - Israel: Sun (Rashi: Blade or Shadow) Neherdaa: Water (Rashi: Flow or Drop)
 - Rav Sheshes⁹ – Tongue Rav Acha bar Yaakov – Hair
 - Sura – Piece of meat, since that has the thickness of the material that will be cut
 - Rav Pappa – Finger and fingernail, along edge and along the sides of the edge¹⁰
- We check for a minimal פגימה regarding: Bone of Pesach, Bechor, Kodashim, Knife
 - (18a) All have same shiur as mizbeiach stone¹¹ – enough to catch a nail in it¹²

¹ Then why does וזבחת teach me about shechitah? (Rashi)

² How did they eat the slav at all? (Maharsha here and Yoma 75b)

³ R' Akiva can't agree with R' Yishmael (Tosafot)

⁴ Why do I care now? (Rashi, Rosh 1:23, Bnei Yissaschar Tammuz 1:10)

⁵ This seems to oppose Ramban Devarim 12:20 (Rashash)

⁶ This fits Hilchos Melachim 8:1, linking this law and אשת יפת תואר (Maharitz Chiyus)

⁷ Note that the gemara calls this מן התורה (Yaavetz)

⁸ Although showing honor is, itself, biblical; the instance if rabbinic (R' Yosef Weiss)

⁹ Who was blind (Margaliyos haYam); but do not try this with steel (Sichas Chullin)

¹⁰ Esophagus is soft like finger, trachea is tough like nail (Tosafot, Rosh 1:24)

¹¹ Why not use the shamir? (Tosafot, Shitah Mekubetzet)

¹² This isn't against the methods mentioned earlier (Rosh 1:24)