

## Chullin 16

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

16a

Gemara: Continues discussion about shechitah with rooted items

- We accept a potter's wheel because it's human-propelled, reject a water wheel after the first turn<sup>1</sup>
- Rebbe requires an un-rooted blade
  - Rebbe – ויקח את המאכלת<sup>2</sup>
  - R' Chiyya rejected this approach;<sup>3</sup> the pasuk is emphasizing Avraham's alacrity
- Status of re-rooted items for various laws
  - For avodah zarah, we treat it as separate, like a house
  - For hechsher zeraim, where planned to use the rainwater and then it hit produce
    - Competing braisos on "rooted" status of a wall – Different authors, or different walls
  - (16b) For shechitah<sup>4</sup> – Brings 3 braisos, none of which are conclusive
    - 1 - Disqualification of a protruding rock may be regarding a natural wall
    - 2 – Acceptance of knife may be because we don't nullify it<sup>5</sup>
    - 3 – Braisa accepting re-rooted items could be explaining the knife case, which is unique

Gemara (tangent): Shechitah with a knife stuck in a wall

- Need the knife above; if he moved the head across the blade, he might press down<sup>6</sup>
- The braisa that accepts even if the head is above is re: an unrooted blade, or a bird

Gemara (tangent): Concern for a reed splintering

- Therefore: No shechitah, no milah, no cutting meat, no flossing, no wiping<sup>7</sup> with a reed

Gemara: HaKol Shochtin – Means the shechted creatures, to include birds

Gemara: "We always shecht" – What is this?

- Approach 1 – It's R' Yishmael that non-korban meat became permitted with entry into the land
  - Shechitah became permitted when they entered Israel,<sup>8</sup> and remains permitted in exile
  - Rav Yosef objects to this read, from language and logic
- (17a) Approach 2 – It's R' Akiva that נחירה was disqualified with entry into the land
  - נחירה was prohibited when they entered Israel, and remains prohibited in exile

---

<sup>1</sup> First or second? (Rashi, Rashash)

<sup>2</sup> See Tosafot and Rashash on what, exactly, the derashah is.

<sup>3</sup> Like a ך across a block of wood, or like the grooves in a block of wood (Rashi)

<sup>4</sup> Haven't we discussed this already? (Tosafot)

<sup>5</sup> This indicates that all acceptances are only where the item wasn't nullified (Rosh 1:22)

<sup>6</sup> Note the future language; this is a קנס for future error even if he does it right this time (Rosh 1:23)

<sup>7</sup> Re: The washroom concern, that was in a time of sorcery (Chatam Sofer, Magen Avraham 3:11) or שומר פתאים ד' (Darchei Moshe)

<sup>8</sup> From a stated pasuk (Rashi), or by default from the need to permit it when they entered (Tosafot)