

Chullin 15

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

15a

Gemara: Who says (14a) that שחיטה from Shabbos/Yom Kippur is אסור that day, if it's kosher?

- 1, 2: R' Yehudah's view of Hachanah 3: R' Yehudah's view of Huktzeh miDaato
- 4: R' Yehudah's view of using Shabbos cooking:¹

	For the cooker	For others
Accidental	R' Meir: Permitted R' Yehudah: After Shabbat R' Yochanan haSandlar: Prohibited ²	R' Meir: Permitted R' Yehudah: After Shabbat R' Yochanan haSandlar: After Shabbat
Intentional	R' Meir: After Shabbat R' Yehudah: Prohibited R' Yochanan haSandlar: Prohibited	R' Meir: After Shabbat R' Yehudah: After Shabbat ³ R' Yochanan haSandlar: Prohibited

Gemara (tangent): Bishul on Shabbos

- Why silence the student who said one may eat from accidental בישול?
 - 1: The student followed R' Meir; Rav followed R' Yehudah
 - 2: The student cited R' Meir re: שחיטה, and Rav objected on מוקצה grounds
 - (15b) R' Meir permits use of שחיטה if it's not מוקצה; someone was ill at start of Shabbat⁴
 - And R' Yehudah will prohibit because the cooking was still אסור
 - Rav Pappa reiterates the point, and Rav Dimi rules⁵
 - If there was a patient when Shabbat started, the animal is not muktzeh
 - But if he became ill on Shabbat, we may not cook previously unusable⁶ food⁷

Gemara (tangent): Benefit from melachah which was performed on Shabbos for a choleh

- May benefit from שחיטה, assuming חולה was ill before Shabbos
- May not benefit from בישול, because he may add to the cooking (no way to add to שחיטה)

Mishnah: Rules for shechitah – Any tool; Any creature; Any era

Gemara: Mishnah accepted hand-scythe, rock and reed bedieved; why not lechatchilah?

- Hand-sickle lest he use jagged side
- Rock/Reed
 - #1 - If connected to ground, R' Chiyya accepts bedieved, Rebbe rejects
 - R' Chiyya accepts even lechatchilah. Rav Kahana recorded בדיעבד to show that Rebbe even disagrees there⁸
 - But then who authored our mishnah, which accepts only בדיעבד?
 - #2 –Rebbe accepts bedieved if it was severed from the ground at some point

¹ Note: Concern for benefit, and for a preventive fine; Either permitted, permitted after Shabbat, or prohibited. According to Shulchan Aruch Orach Chaim 318:1 and Magen Avraham 318:2, "after Shabbat" is immediate, against Rashi here. According to them, בכדי שיעשו is only where a non-Jew cooked

² Bava Kama 71a – ושמתם את השבת כי קודש היא לכם – ושמרתם את מלאכה – produced on Shabbos is like הקדש

³ I believe R' Yehudah will say this, since – per Rashi – he wants you to avoid benefit from Shabbat cooking

⁴ Why doesn't it become muktzeh when the patient is healed during Shabbat? (Tosafot)

⁵ Re: The possibility of eating אומצא, see Tosafot Yom Tov to Menachos 99b re: מליחה for the goat of Yom Kippur, when Yom Kippur is Friday and the goat is consumed Friday night

⁶ The gourd was plucked (Rashi) or chopped (Tosafot) today

⁷ In practice – Tosafot sides with R' Meir, Rif sides with R' Yehudah. Shulchan Aruch Orach Chaim 318:1 sides with R' Yehudah

⁸ Don't we show the extreme lenient view normally, because of כזה דהיתירא עדיף?