

Menachos 64

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

64a

Gemara: Is it better to have one melachah with much strain, or many melachos with less strain?

Additional Factor	Less strain, More melachot	Fewer melachot	The mitzvah that overrides Shabbat	The Tanna
-	5 Seah	3 Seah	Minchat Omer	ר' ישמעאל בן אלישע
Degrading korban	Total skinning	Skin to the חזה	Korban Pesach	ר' ישמעאל בנו של ר' יוחנן בן ברוקה
Publicity	3 harvesters	1 harvester	Minchat Omer	ר' חנינא סגן הכהנים
Future testimony	Go	Don't go	Moon Testimony	ר' יוסי

Gemara (tangent): Performing justified melachah with improper intent

- שחט an extra communal חטאת¹ on Shabbos - Rabbah says חייב even if the first ended up un-usable
 - If the first turns out to be weak, one may שחט a second one
- What if you intended to שחט unnecessarily, but it was necessary because the first was weak?
 - Possible analogy – Child is drowning, he tries to catch fish but ends up saving the child?

Gemara (back to reducing melachos): Is it better to cut 2 figs on 2 stems, or 3 figs on 1 stem, for a חולה?

- (64b) Not analogous – Omer: Reduce grain → Reduce cutting. חולה: Reduce figs → Increase cutting

Mishnah (Not about Shabbos): Best to bring omer from close to Yerushalayim

Gemara: Why do we prefer grain close to Yerushalayim? **כרמל** and **אין מעבירין על המצוות**²

Gemara: On bringing from **גגות צריפין**

- That was from siege of Yerushalayim in war of Hurkinus and Aristobulus³
- Subsequent decrees against raising pigs and against יונת חכמת^{4 5}
- The soldiers destroyed the fields, so they needed to go afield for עומר and שתי הלחם
 - Mordechai⁶ interpreted חרש's⁷ signal of גגות צריפין⁸
 - Mordechai interpreted חרש's signal of עין סוכר
 - (65a) Mordechai interpreted the women's intentions for their קינים, and so was called פתחיה
 - Not because he knew 70 languages – all the judges know that!⁹
 - Yes, but Mordechai knew how to mix languages to decipher them¹⁰

¹ Specifically חטאת (Shitah Mekubetzet)

² When do we invoke **אין מעבירין על המצוות**? (Tosafot, Shitah Mekubetzet)

³ Other versions of the **גגות צריפין** case exist (Tosafot)

⁴ Wasn't this decreed later, during the Roman invasion? (Tosafot)

⁵ What about the apparent permission of Menachos 99b? (Tosafot)

⁶ Was this the original Mordechai? (Rashi, Tosafot)

⁷ This is not a true חרש, but an אלם (Rashash)

⁸ Why was it a חרש who knew this? (Maharsha)

⁹ How many judges needed to know the languages? (Tosafot)

¹⁰ Why did judges need expertise in sorcery? (Tosafot)