### Menachos 56

#### R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

#### 56a

## Gemara (tangent) – Why do we say שעיר נשיא in 4:24 for שעיר נשיא?

- Approach 1: אותו teaches that even though שעיר נחשון has סמיכה like חטאת, we don't require צפון.
- Approach 2: אותו teaches that only the animal must be in the north, but שוחט may stand in south
- Approach 3: אותו teaches that only animals require north; birds don't even though they are stricter<sup>1</sup>
- Approach 4: אותו teaches that these require north, but ססה doesn't even though it's stricter
- Back to Approach 2: אותו teaches that only the animal must be in north, but שוחט may stand in south

### Gemara: Rav Pappa: Liable twice for the act of baking

- Once for arranging dough,<sup>2</sup> once for baking
- It's called מעשה יחידי where someone else did the entire עריכה  $^3$

# Gemara: מחמץ אחר מחמץ <sup>4</sup>

- If a bechor has a מום in that it is seriously ill, may you give it another מום as part of healing it?
  - R' Yehudah No.
  - o R' Meir No; bleed it in a non-מום spot
  - o Chachamim May make a מום, but don't שחש on that basis.
  - o R' Shimon May even שחט for that מום.
- (56b) R' Yochanan This permission to aggravate an apparent sin is unique to מום
  - ס Regarding חימוץ you are liable, because of תעשה-תאפה of תעשה-תאפה
  - ס Regarding סירוס you are liable, because of גזה"כ of ומעוך וכתות ונתוק וכרות  $^5$
  - o Regarding מום it's a machlokes R' Meir (פטור) and Chachamim (פטור)
    - מום includes: R' Meir: בעל מום. Chachamim: Indirectly causing a מום.6
    - מים יהיה לרצון excludes: Chachamim: בעל מום. R' Meir: Redeemed פסולי המוקדשים.

# Gemara: גרם חימוץ by placing starter on the dough<sup>7</sup>

- R' Ami Liable, just like for indirectly causing צלייה on Shabbos
- Doesn't Shabbos require direct action? Rava: Yes; liable for indirect הימוץ like liable for direct.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Doesn't Zevachim 58a indicate that top of mizbeiach, as in עולת העוף, is like north? (Eizehu Mekoman)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Final arranging (Rashi), or arranging as part of baking (Tosafot)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Then what was Rav Pappa teaching here?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Are these further actions with a minchah that is chametz (55a-b and Tosafot), or further chimutz of a minchah (56a and Rambam)?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Rashi – נותק severs the כורת Cuts partially, נותק severs but inside כים severs but inside נותק.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See Tosafot regarding extrapolating from כל.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Placing starter atop dough does not normally cause real chimutz of the dough (Tosafot)