Menachos 54

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

53b

Mishnah: R' Yehudah said to bring started dough from outside (pre-מדידה). R' Meir objected: חסרה או יתרה.

• We measure based on flour, and the outside dough may have a lesser or greater density than normal

(54a) Gemara: Using apples as a starter

- Rabbanan We don't use apples as a starter; ר' חנינא בן גמליאל Yes we do.¹
- Apples are מחמץ re: terumah;² it's just מחמץ.³

Gemara: Do we evaluate a minchah's volume based on original flour (כמות שהיו) or current flour (כמות שהו)?

- Case 1: Adding water to מנחת חוטא
 - Machlokes whether one may add water
 - o Is that a machlokes about this exact issue of שהיו and אהין?
- Case 2: Gauging the size of food for the טומאת אוכלין, when meat bloats or shrivels⁴
 - o Challenge to the view that it's כמות שהיו from braisa re: bloated meat that it's טמא
 - o Challenge to view that it's כמות שהיו from braisa re: shriveled meat that it's טהור
- (54b) Case 3: Take מעשר from fresh figs for dry ones by number; not volume, which cheats מעשר
 - o Approach 1: Permission to use numbers shows we care about כמות שהיו
 - Then we couldn't separate dried figs for fresh by numbers!
 - o Approach 2: This is תרומה, and doing it in the best עין יפה way. כמות שהיו is irrelevant
 - Then why did a third part of the braisa, re: R' Yosi, talk about doing 1/10?
 - o Approach 3: This is כמות שהיו is irrelevant עין יפה 5;תרומת מעשר is irrelevant
- (55a) Case 4: R' Yosi tithed from dried figs for fresh ones by numbers
 - o Is that כמות שהיו?
 - No גרוגרות don't actually have a היו-הן distinction.

¹ Are מי פירות מחמץ? Rashi – Partially. Tosafot – Alone – Not. With water – נוקשה. Rambam – Alone – Not. With water – Yes.

² Is the standard re: מעמיד about חימוץ, specifically? (Sfas Emes)

³ Doesn't the Rambam say they are entirely מחמיץ with water, and otherwise not at all? (זבח תודה)

⁴ What about bloating and the measurement of food regarding a berachah acharonah? (Igrot Moshe Orach Chaim 1:71)

⁵ We don't do "approximation" for תרומת מעשר, in practice (Tosafot)

⁶ Of course, הרומה has no "approximation" on a biblical level. (Tosafot)