

Talmud in South Korea - <http://www.ynet.co.il/articles/0,7340,L-4046985,00.html> (<http://bit.ly/gwYs9l>)

19b

Rav said that aspects of מנחה which are mentioned twice are עיכוב. We challenged this from הגשה. Now we bring a second challenge, from מלח, which we believe is מעכב.<sup>1</sup>

- Rav Huna<sup>2</sup> – מלח is an עיכוב, although it isn't mentioned twice!
  - (20a) Source: ברית אמורה במלח – ר' יהודה
  - Answer 1: Rav Yosef – Rav says it's not an עיכוב, like mishnah 18b
  - Answer 2: Rav agrees it's not מעכב, but because of "ברית"
  - Answer 3: Salt is doubled – מעל מנחתך על כל קרבנך תקריב מלח<sup>3</sup> – וכל קרבן מנחתך במלח תמלח ולא תשבית...<sup>4</sup>

That "doubled" pasuk may not be for this lesson; rather, it's for a different purpose

- וכל קרבן מנחתך במלח תמלח ולא תשבית מלח ברית אלקיך מעל מנחתך על כל קרבנך תקריב מלח
- Braisa
  - A: קרבן – Any קרבן
  - B: I'd have assumed this included דם and עצים; מנחתך – Something with accessories
  - C: I'd have assumed this included מתירין like דם; מעל מנחתך – Not דם
  - D: I'd have assumed this included שיריים; קרבנך (קרבן per Rashi) – Not שיריים, yes לבונה in the kli
  - E: I'd have assumed this included that which has קמיצה כל – Those that are entirely burned
- Challenges
  - To D: Why do I need כל to include לבונה in כלי, it's already in from B!
    - כל – מנחתך – קרבן is a klal-prat-klal
  - To B: Blood has accessories, too - נסכים!
    - Answer 1: The נסכים are a function of the אימורים
    - Answer 2: The נסכים are not in the same receptacle
  - To B: Why not require two similarities to קומץ – Accessories and Matir?
    - Then we wouldn't have needed C to exclude דם
  - To C: Why not use this to exclude אברים?
    - אברים are too similar to קומץ
    - קומץ<sup>4</sup> has fewer similarities to דם (20b)
  - To A-B: This sounds like Rebbe, who says wood is called קרבן – but Rebbe says it needs salt!
    - Erase wood.
    - דם is unnecessary, thanks to C.
    - (21a) Insert wine, as we know wine does not need salt

<sup>1</sup> Why salt? Anti-idolatry (Rambam), Not bland (Ramban), Like suffering (Netziv); Bris with lower waters (Rashi, Toras haOlah 2:27); Gematria: מלח + קרבן = 430 = 5 \* אלקים = עולם יסוד (Ben Yehoyada)

<sup>2</sup> See Shitah Mekubetzet and Yaavetz

<sup>3</sup> See Rashash on which part of the pasuk constitutes the "double"

<sup>4</sup> See Tosafot on משתקע החמה vs. בשקיעת החמה