

Menachos 15

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

Mishnah: If part of the **להם** or **ב' הלהם** becomes **טמא**: **ר' יהודה** – Destroy both; **הכמים** – Eat the **טהור**
15a

Gemara: R' Elazar: The machlokes is if the tumah occurred before zerikah. Otherwise, the tahor may be eaten

Gemara: What's the source for the machlokes between R' Yehudah and the Chachamim?

- Rav Pappa – It's whether the **ציץ** works for **אוכלין**, as it works for **עולין**
- Challenges to Rav Pappa
 - Then why doesn't R' Yehudah agree to keep the **טהור** as **טהור** re: **בזיכין**, which are **עולין**?
 - Then why does R' Yehudah say the **ציץ** works for **פסה**, which is **אוכלין**?¹
 - Then why did R' Yehudah offer a different reason for rejecting **טמא** loaves, which are **אוכלין**?

15b

- R' Yochanan – It's whether we divide a communal korban – **בזיכין**, **פסה** and loaves are communal

Mishnah: Bread is adjunct of the korban with which it is associated, and is influenced by it

- Pigul thought for korban todah affects its loaves, but not vice versa
- Pigul thought for **כבשי עצרת** affects their loaves, but not vice versa²

Gemara: How do we understand this one-way korban/bread relationship?

- Approach 1: Bread is called **תודה**
- Approach 2: The bread is **טפל** to the animal
 - I'd have thought **כבשי עצרת** were more connected than **תודה** because of joint **תנופה**

Gemara: R' Elazar asks Rav a question about the meat/bread combination

- Version 1
 - Question - Does thought of **כזית** from todah meat and bread combined affect the bread?
 - Rav – Yes
 - Challenge to Rav: Meat's pigul connection is strong, and yet $\frac{1}{2}$ - $\frac{1}{2}$ doesn't affect meat. Bread's pigul connection is weak, so $\frac{1}{2}$ - $\frac{1}{2}$ shouldn't affect bread!
 - Why not? Grapes are strongly connected but kilayim doesn't affect grapes, seeds are weakly connected and yet kilayim prohibits them!
 - That's different; it's a d'rabbanan, and the **קנס** is only for the invader.
- Version 2
 - Question – Does thought of **כזית** from **כבשים** meat and bread combined affect the bread?
 - Same cycle of Rav's answer and challenge
- Version 3 – Question – If he is **שוחט** the **כבש** while having **חבירו** in mind for tomorrow, what is **חבירו**?

Mishnah: Nesachim are adjunct of the korban with which they are associated, and are influenced by it

- Nesachim are up for **פיגול** from the time of **כבלי**
- Pigul thought re **זבה** affects **נסכים**, but not vice versa

Gemara: Pigul of nesachim

- But nesachim can come later, and can be switched to another korban!
- Same Q and A with metzora's oil

¹ Why not mention **הותרה בציבור** as the logic? (Tosafot)

² Note: The korban is still **פסול**, since it is lacking kosher loaves