

Menachos 14

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

13b

Gemara: R' Yosi says 1 loaf can be pigul, independent of the other.

- Approach 1 to R' Yosi (Rav Huna): Part of any korban can become pigul independent of the rest
 - Reason 1: Logic – Compare to tumah
 - Reason 2: Pasuk – ממנו עונה תשא – ממנו ולא מחבירו
- Challenges to this understanding of R' Yosi
 - Challenge 1: Braisa says bread is pigul only with a זית from both [loaves] combined
 - Unlike Rabbanan, who say it's pigul from even 1
 - Unlike R' Yosi, who says one can't combine with the other

14a

- And if it's Rebbe that they are mitztaref, why does he only accept a combination of both?
- Braisa means: Bread is pigul only with pigul from both lambs, like Rabbanan
 - But then what is the chiddush?!
 - Teaching אין מפגלין בחצי במתיר is insufficient!¹
- Challenge 2: Re: פרים הנשרפים R' Yosi says that a pigul thought on אימורין affects the meat!
- Challenge 3: Re: מנחה R' Yosi says that a pigul thought on קומץ affects the shirayim!

14b

- Approach 2 to R' Yosi (R' Yochanan): R' Yosi's position is unique to הלוח, from a גזירת הכתוב²

Gemara: Do we combine זית-1/2 pigul thoughts from separate avodos?

- Generic braisa: שחיתה & זריקה combine; a) both are matirin or b) both are avodos (despite gap)
- Levi's braisa: No avodos combine
- Rebbe says that a thought with one כבש doesn't combine with a thought from the other כבש
 - Could be like Levi's braisa
 - Or could be like the generic braisa, and by כבשים they don't combine because each is half-matir
 - And we won't make a gezeirah for a worse case,³ because that's unnecessary

Mishnah: If one of the שתי הלהם or להם הפנים becomes טמא, what happens to the other?

- R' Yehudah – Destroy both
- Chachamim – Eat the טהור

¹ And if we say אין מפגלין בחצי מתיר, what do we do with פיגול בהקטרת קומץ המנחה and פיגול בקמיצת מנחה (Rashi)

² Tosafot brings the pesukim

³ Yevamos 90a may provide justification for such גזירות in general, even though they cause קדשים to be brought לבית הפסול