

## Menachos 12

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

11b

Mishnah: Effectiveness of מחשבת חוץ למקומו (פוסל) וחוץ לזמנו (מפגל)

12a

- Pigul happens during הקטרה, הולכה, נתינה, קמיצה, if the מתיר was brought כמצוותו
- What if there were thoughts of חוץ למקומו and חוץ לזמנו during the same avodah?

Gemara: Is הקטרה a real הקטרה if the שירים are lacking?

- Practical application: Creating פיגול and removing מעילה
- Possible comparison with יוצא
  - Rav Huna: But יוצא may be better, because the psul is external
  - Rava: Or יוצא may be worse, because they are not inside
- Proofs
  - Rava: Proof the הקטרה is effective – R' Chiyya talks about where only a כזית remains

12b

- Rava: Proof the הקטרה is not effective – הקטרה doesn't work if one of the loaves breaks

Mishnah: Thoughts of ½ הקטרה and ½ אכילה are not mitztaref

- Two approaches to what this mishnah is teaching us
  - R' Yirmiyah – ½ ראוי, ½ non-ראוי are mitztaref, like R' Eliezer
  - Abbaye – ½ חוץ לזמנו, ½ חוץ למקומו are mitztaref, like Rabbanan
- Rejections
  - We know the view of the rabbanan already!

13a

- We've rejected the view of R' Eliezer already!
- And the mishnah itself – non-combination of אכילה-הקטרה – is obvious!
- It's teaching us the mishnah's own lesson: אכילה and הקטרה are fundamentally different