

Menachos 5

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com

5a

Kemitzah shelo lishmah

קמץ העומר שלא לשמה		
טעמא	הלכה	
לא עשה הכשירו ¹	פסול	רב
כשר, אף שלא עשה הכשירו	שיריין אסורין עד העומר החדש	ריש לקיש
הוי מצוה, לא קרבן	כשר לגמרי	רבא

Rav: Pasul, like the asham metzora or asham nazir that underwent **שחיטה שלא לשמה**

- Challenge to Rav: That korban still goes on the mizbeiach! *Tiyuvta d'Rav*.

Reish Lakish: Kosher, don't eat shirayim before the new omer²

- Challenge to Reish Lakish: But ממשקה ישראל requires korbanos from that which is mutar for eating!³
 - Answer 1: New concept: It's not called mechusar zman, since it will become permitted that day.
 - Challenge to law: The minchah is mutar for the mizbeiach while assur for people!
 - Challenge to concept: By מצורע we care about the order of same-day שמן/דם!
 - Challenge to concept: By מצורע we care about the order of שחיטה of same-day אשם/חטאת!
 - Answer 2: Reish Lakish says that chadash was already mutar at sunrise⁴

5b

- We deduce this from his position that a minchah of chadash on 16th is kosher bedieved.⁵

Rava: Kosher entirely, may eat shirayim, no new omer needed; this is not a korban, only a mitzvah rite.⁶

- Pigul occurs only with that which is suitable for עבודה.⁷

Gemara continues on the topic of "kosher for the mizbeiach, assur for people."

- Braisa seeks to argue logically that if בעל מום is kosher for us and assur for mizbeiach, certainly a טריפה, which is assur for us, is assur for mizbeiach.
- Then brings challenges, resulting in needing a גזירת הכתוב to prohibit tereifah as a korban:
 - חלב ודם
 - מליקה
 - (Post-braisa) מנחת עומר comes from חדש
 - קטרת
 - קרבנות בשבת
 - כלאים בבגדי כהונה
 - *More to come on סא*

¹ Rav's philosophical question: The nature of a korban which is also part of a mitzvah. Think of the dual roles of a chatas.

² And yet we may put this omer on the mizbeiach first! (Sfas Emes)

³ Note Pesachim 47b-48a, which learns bitul arlah in 1-201 from this pasuk

⁴ Then why don't they eat shirayim before the second omer? (Rashi, Tosafot)

⁵ This is an unusual use of מכללא איתמר (Sfas Emes)

⁶ Like Ibn Ezra on the שעיר לעזאזל, against Rav Saadia Gaon and Rambam

⁷ This is not fit because it's barley (Rashi), or chadash (Tosafot), or if it is brought with another minchah in mind (Sfas Emes)