

## נשים בקריאת הלל

### I. שומע כעונה:

- A. מתני' סוכה לה. - if a person can't say הלל himself and he has an עבד, קטן or woman saying it on his behalf, he should repeat everything after them. But if a גדול says הלל on his behalf, he just has to say "הללוקה".
1. It would seem from here that a woman is not obligated in הלל and therefore, a person cannot be יוצא with the recitation of הלל through שומע כעונה b/c the מתני' ר"ה כת requires that you need have who's a מחוייב בדבר for שומע כעונה to work.<sup>1</sup>
  2. דין דרבנן or דין דאורייתא discuss whether this is a דין דאורייתא or a דין דרבנן...
    - a) The בדפי הרי"ף (בדפי הרי"ף) בעה"מ ברכות יב seems to say that the fact that a person needs to be a מחוייב בדבר in order for שומע כעונה to work is a דין דרבנן.
    - b) But the רמב"ן (מלחמת ה' ברכות יב) (בדפי הרי"ף) says that this is not a דין דרבנן and is a דין דאורייתא.
      - (1) It's clear from the משנה that woman are פטורות from הלל.
      - (2) We know that this is true, but we have to figure out why this is true. In order to do that, we first must figure out why we say הלל in the first place...

### II. המחייב של הלל - יו"ט ונס<sup>2</sup>

- A. ר' יוחנן - גמ' ערכין י-י: says that there are 18 days that we say הלל שלם in א"י and 21 days when we say in חו"ל.<sup>4</sup> There are 2 reasons to say הלל:
1. We say הלל on יו"ט b/c יו"ט itself is מחייב us to recite הלל. Therefore, we should say הלל on ר"ה and יו"ט, but we don't b/c they are days of פחד and דין.
  2. We also say הלל on חנוכה, which is not a יו"ט. We say הלל on חנוכה b/c of a נס and so, we should have said הלל on פורים, but we don't b/c we have the המגילה in its place.
    - a) Q: Why is יו"ט a מחייב of הלל?
    - b) A: 2 Answers:
      - (1) The רמב"ם הל' חנוכה ג' says that הלל on חנוכה is דרבנן and so is every other הלל of חנוכה - הלל - יו"ט is a דרבנן.
      - (2) The רמב"ן השגות לסה"מ שרש ב writes that הלל on יו"ט is not דרבנן, it's דין דאורייתא, which is part of the מצוה of "ושמחת בחגך". We see this from the גמ' ערכין יא...
- B. גמ' ערכין יא. - we know that the קרבנות require שירת הלויים b/c the פסוק says, לא "תחת אשר לא", we express our grandiose joy of doing מצות is through שירה.

<sup>1</sup> We try not to be יוצא מצות through שומע כעונה, however, there are certain scenarios where we have no choice.

<sup>2</sup> See קונטרס השיר והשבה עמ' פז-פח (מובא בסוף ספר ראשית כה).

<sup>3</sup> 1 day of פסח, 1 day of שבועות, 8 days of סוכות and 8 days of חנוכה.

<sup>4</sup> They added a day for each of the שלש רגלים.

1. We see from here that שירה is an expression of שמחה.
  2. The רמב"ן says that just as the קרבנות require שמחה, which is expressed through שירה, since יו"ט also requires שמחה, it must be expressed through שירה as well.
    - a) The רמב"ן assumes that שמחת יו"ט is expressed through שירה.
    - b) But the רמב"ן makes a big assumption b/c there is a מח' ראשונים regarding what שמחת יו"ט is...
- C. גמ' פסחים קט. at the time of the מקדש, there is only שמחת יו"ט through שלמים and אכילת בשר שלמים, אין שמחה אלא בין בזה. בזמן הזה, it's בין.
1. תוס' מ"ק יד: ד"ה עשה says that שמחת יו"ט is only מדאורייתא b/c מדרבנן. אכילת בשר קרבנות is only שמחת יו"ט.
  2. However, the רמב"ם הל' יו"ט ו:יז writes that even though real שמחה is included in that שמחה is שאר שמחות, like being משמח a person's family, which is also שמחה מדאורייתא.
    - a) According to the רמב"ן, מדאורייתא you have to sing שירה on יו"ט. This is only in line with the רמב"ם's שיטה that שירה could be included in שמחת יו"ט b/c שמחת יו"ט is more than just אכילת בשר שלמים. However, the רמב"ן cannot hold like תוס', b/c according to תוס', all that שמחה is מדאורייתא is אכילת בשר שלמים.
    - b) The שאג"א ס' סט says that if the רמב"ן is correct that הלל is part of שמחת יו"ט, then in order to figure out who is חייב in הלל, we have to figure out who is חייב in שמחת יו"ט.
      - (1) It would seem that women are not obligated in שמחת יו"ט b/c it's a מצות עשה שזהזמן גרמא.
      - (2) However, there is a פסוק that tells us that women are obligated in שמחת יו"ט.
- D. גמ' ר"ה ו. according to one opinion, the פסוק tells us that women are obligated in שמחת יו"ט, but according to the another opinion, they are פטורות and the פסוק is coming to tell the man to make sure that his family is happy.
1. Q: The שאג"א asks, if women are obligated in שמחת יו"ט, then they should be obligated in הלל, which is against the מתני' סוכה לה. which says that a woman can't be מוציא a man in הלל! If women are obligated in שמחת יו"ט and הלל is a part of שמחת יו"ט according to the רמב"ן, then why can't a woman be מוציא a man in הלל?
  2. A: The משנת יעב"ץ או"ח כ:ד says that women are not פטורות from הלל on יו"ט. The מתני' סוכה לה. just says that women cannot be מוציא men in הלל and the הלל that it's talking about is the הלל on סוכות. It could be that a woman can't be מוציא a man in the הלל of סוכות, but they could be מוציא a man in the הלל of other יו"ט's. There is another מחייב of הלל, which just applies to סוכות, which is the reason women can't be מוציא men in הלל of סוכות even though they are obligated in הלל in general...

### III. הלל בסוכות - הלל של מצוה:

- A. גמ' פסחים צה: how do we know that we say הלל when bringing the פסח שני? We say הלל when bringing the פסח שני b/c it can't be that a Jew will be שוחט his פסח and take his לולב without saying הלל.
1. The גמ' here is saying that there is another מחייב of הלל - this מצוה is מחייב. We don't say הלל every time we do a מצוה, but there are certain מצות that are more related to הלל than others.

2. The גמ' here also talks about נטילת לולב, which tells us that the מצוה of נטילת לולב is מהחייב הלל. So, the הלל that we do on the first day of סוכות is a הלל of יו"ט and a הלל של הלל of נטילת לולב מצוה.
  - a) The משנת יעב"ץ says that when a woman says הלל on פסח, שבועות or עצרת, she might be obligated in הלל b/c it's a הלל of יו"ט שמחת יו"ט and they might be obligated in שמחת יו"ט. In such a case, a woman would be obligated in הלל just like a man.
  - b) But when it comes to הלל on סוכות, it's not just a הלל of יו"ט שמחת יו"ט, but also a הלל of נטילת לולב, which women are פטורות from. Therefore, the משנת יעב"ץ says that when the מתני' סוכה לה. says that women can't be מוציא men in הלל, it's talking about הלל of סוכות b/c it's also a הלל of נטילת לולב, which they are פטורות from, however, they would be able to be מוציא a man in another הלל that does not have this added dimension.<sup>5</sup>

#### IV. הלל בליל פסח:

- A. if a person can't say הלל himself and he has an עבד, קטן or woman saying it on his behalf, he should repeat everything after them. But if a גדול says הלל on his behalf, he just has to say "הללוקה".
  1. תוס' ד"ה מי שהיה says that women are פטורות from הלל on סוכות b/c it's a מצוה עשה שהזמן גרמא.
    2. But תוס' says that woman are obligated in הלל on פסח night b/c they are obligated in ד' כוסות and one of the חיובים of כוסות ד' is הלל.
      - a) It could be that women are obligated in ד' כוסות even though they are not obligated in הלל.
      - b) The גר"ז ה"י חו"מ ז:ט says that there are 2 ways to understand the מצוה הלילה on פסח and their relationship to the כוסות ד':
        - (1) It could be that the עיקר is מצוה שבדיבור and we just make you drink ד' כוסות in order to give more חשיבות to those מצוה.
        - (2) Or it could be that the כוסות ד' are independently important on פסח night and we link the מצוה שבדיבור to the כוסות b/c we are drinking anyway.
          - (a) What תוס' says only make sense if you hold that the חיוב הלל is what is the עיקר and the כוסות ד' are secondary. If that's the case, then the fact that women are obligated in ד' כוסות is b/c they are obligated in the מצוה שבדיבור, like הלל.
          - (b) But if the drinking the כוסות ד' is the עיקר, then the fact that women are obligated in ד' כוסות doesn't tell us anything about their חיוב in הלל.
    3. תוס' says that the הלל of פסח night is different than other types of הלל b/c it's a הלל על הנס and הנס היו באותו הנס.
      - a) תוס' assumes that the הלל on the night of פסח is a הלל על הנס.
      - b) However, the רמב"ן פסחים קיח. ד"ה עוד מצאתי says that the הלל on פסח ליל is a הלל של מצוה.

<sup>5</sup> It would come out according to this that if a person didn't have a לולב in the morning and said הלל and then got a לולב later on, then he should recite הלל again.

- (1) A מ"מ whether this הלל is a הנס על הלל or a הלל של מצוה is whether we make a ברכה on it or not...
- (a) Some ראשונים say that you should make a ברכה on this הלל.
- (b) But the ר"ן פסחים כו: (בדפי הרי"ף) quotes רב האי גאון who says that it's not a קריאה של הלל but rather a שירה של הלל and therefore, we don't make a ברכה on it.
- i) הר"ם (ראשית כח הקדמה) explained that רב האי גאון meant that הלל בליל הסדר is supposed to be spontaneous. Therefore, to say a ברכה will detract from the spontaneity and so when it comes to ליל הסדר, it would be inappropriate to make a ברכה.<sup>6,7</sup>
- ii) This idea is only true according to תוס' that the הלל on פסח night is הלל בשעת הנס.
- (2) It comes out from תוס' that women should be obligated in the הלל of חנוכה, but we don't assume that way להלכה.
- (a) We would think that women should be obligated in הלל on חנוכה like they are obligated in נרות חנוכה b/c of הנס היו באותו הנס.
- (b) But the שו"ת חת"ס או"ח סי' קפה says that we only say הנס היו באותו הנס by אף הן היו באותו הנס b/c those are מצות where we publicize a נס. Therefore, one could argue that even though הלל on חנוכה is הנס, it's not a פירסום and therefore, women aren't obligated in it.
- i) There are 2 problems with with say this:
- (1) ר"ת (ספר הישר תשובות סי' ע) says that women are obligated in סעודת חנוכה b/c of הנס היו באותו הנס and that's not a פירסום.
- (2) The גמ' ברכות יד. refers to הלל on חנוכה as פירסומי ניסא.
- ii) So it seems difficult why women are not obligated in הלל on חנוכה if they are obligated in נרות חנוכה and הלל on פסח night.

<sup>6</sup> The (העמק שאלה כו:א) נצי"ב says that this is הלל דאורייתא. That is why the תורה gave us the ישיר אז פרשת א, in order to show us that there is a הנס בשעת הלל. The הלל on the ליל סדר is הלל בשעת הנס b/c we say חייב חייב אדם לראות את עצמו and then say אנחנו חייבים - the idea is the same, we have to see ourselves as being and then b/c of that, have a שירה של הלל בשעת הנס.

<sup>7</sup> See הגדה של פסח מבית לוי [בריסק] עמ' קפד, קפו-קפז.