



1. Numbers 32:39-42

(לט) וילכו בני מכיר בן־מנשה גלעד וילקדה ויורש את־האמרי אשר־בה: (מ) ויתן משה את־הגלעד למכיר בן־מנשה וישב בה: (מא) ויאיר בן־מנשה הלך וילקד את־חיותיהם ויקרא אתהן חית יאיר: (מב) ונבח הלך וילקד את־קנת ואת־בנתיה ויקרא לה נבח בשמו: (פ)

(39) The descendants of Machir son of Manasseh went to Gilead and captured it, dispossessing the Amorites who were there; (40) so Moses gave Gilead to Machir son of Manasseh, and he settled there. (41) Jair son of Manasseh went and captured their villages, which he renamed Havvoth-jair. (42) And Nobah went and captured Kenath and its dependencies, renaming it Nobah after himself.

2. Tzror HaMor on Torah, Numbers 32:1:3

וא"ת מי הכניס כאן חצי שבט מנשה כי הם לא שאלו דבר. ואולי כי הם גם כן נתחברו עם ראובן וגד לשאול זאת הארץ לנחלה. והכתוב לא הזכירם לפי שהיו המועטים. שאם לא כן לא היה משה מכריחם לשבת בחוצה לארץ.

Who brought the half tribe of Menasheh into this - they didn't ask? It is possible that they were also joined with Reuve and Gad to ask about this land for inheritance, but the Torah didn't mention them because they were few. For if not, Moshe would not have forced them to live outside of Israel.

- This follows the theme of Moshe loving Israel and being reluctant to allow anyone to settle outside of it.

3. Rabbi Nathaniel Helfgot Shall Your Brothers Go Into Battle While You Remain Here? an Analysis of Numbers 32" , Tradition 32:2 – argues that these 3 tribes were all “rejected firstborns (of Leah, Zilpah, Rachel). Thus, there was the fear they would interpret this as rejection. This is strengthened by the parallel to Lot who was rejected by Avraham and went East.

4. Genesis 13

(א) ויעל אברם ממצרים הוא ואשתו וכל־אשר־לו ולוט עמו הנגבה: (ב) ואברם כבד מאד במקנה בכסף ובזהב: (ג) וילך למסעיו מנגב ועד בית־אל עדה־מקום אשר־היה שם אלה בתחלה בין בית־אל ובין העי: (ד) אל־מקום המזבח אשר־עשה שם בראשונה ויקרא שם אברם בשם יקוק: (ה) וגם־ללוט ההלך את־אברם היה צאן־בקר ואהלים: (ו) ולא־נשא אתם הארץ לשבת יחדו כיהיה רכושם רב ולא כלו לשבת יחדו: (ז) ויהי־לבי בין רעי מקנה־אברם ובין רעי מקנה־לוט והכנעני והפרזי אז ישב בארץ: (ח) ויאמר אברם אל־לוט אל־נא תהי מריבה ביני ובינך ובין רעי ובין רעיד כיאנשים אחים אנחנו: (ט) הלא כלה־ארץ לפניך הפרד נא מעלי אם־השמאל ואימנה ואם־הימין ואשמאלה: (י) וישאלוט את־עניו וירא את־כל־כפר הירדן כי כלה משקה לפניו שחת יקוק את־סדם ואת־עמרה כגן־יקוק כארץ מצרים באכה צער: (יא) ויבחרלו לוט את כל־כפר הירדן ויסע לוט מקדם ויפרדו איש מעל אחיו: (יב) אברם ושב בארץ־כנען ולוט ישב בערי הכנען ויאהל עד־סדם: (יג) ואנשי סדם רעים וחטאים ליקוק מאד: (יד) ויקוק אמר אל־אברם אחרי הפרד־לוט מעמו שא נא עיניך וראה מן־המקום אשר־אתה שם צפונה ונגבה וקדמה וימה: (טו) כי את־כל־הארץ אשר־אתה ראה לך אתננה ולזרעך עד־עולם: (טז) ושמתי את־זרעך כעפר הארץ אשרו אם־יוכל איש למנות את־עפר הארץ גם־זרעך ימנה: (יז) קום התהלך בארץ לארצה ולרחבה כי לך אתננה: (יח) ויאהל אברם ויבא וישב באלני ממרא אשר בחברון ויבדשם מזבח ליקוק: פ

(1) From Egypt, Abram went up into the Negeb, with his wife and all that he possessed, together with Lot. (2) Now Abram was very rich in cattle, silver, and gold. (3) And he proceeded by stages from the Negeb as far as Bethel, to the place where his tent had been formerly, between Bethel and Ai, (4) the site of the altar that he had built there at first; and there Abram invoked the LORD by name. (5) Lot, who went with Abram, also had flocks and herds and tents, (6) so that the land could not support them staying together; for their possessions were so great that they could not remain together. (7) And there was quarreling between the herdsmen of Abram's cattle and those of Lot's cattle.—The Canaanites and Perizzites were then dwelling in the land.— (8) Abram said to Lot, “Let there be no strife between you and me, between my herdsmen and yours, for we are kinsmen. (9) Is not the whole land before you? Let us separate: if you go north, I will go south; and if you go south, I will go north.” (10) Lot looked about him and saw how well watered was the whole plain of the Jordan, all of it—this was before the LORD had destroyed Sodom and Gomorrah—all the way to Zoar, like the garden of the LORD, like the land of Egypt. (11) So Lot chose for himself the whole plain of the Jordan, and Lot journeyed eastward. Thus they parted from each other; (12) Abram remained in the land of Canaan, while Lot settled in the cities of the Plain, pitching his tents near Sodom. (13) Now the inhabitants of Sodom were very wicked sinners against the LORD. (14) And the LORD said to Abram, after Lot had parted from him, “Raise your eyes and look out from where you are, to the north and south, to the east and west, (15) for I give all the land that you see to you and your offspring forever. (16) I will make your offspring as the dust of the earth, so that if one can count the dust of the earth, then your offspring too can be counted. (17) Up, walk about the land, through its length and its breadth, for I give it to you.” (18) And Abram moved his tent, and came to dwell at the terebinths of Mamre, which are in Hebron; and he built an altar there to the LORD.

5. Joshua 22

(א) אז יקרא יהושע לראובני ולגדי ולחצי מטה מנשה: (ב) ויאמר אליהם אתם שמרתם את כל־אשר צוה אתכם משה עבד יקוק ותשמעו בקולי לכל אשר־צויתי אתכם: (ג) לא־עזבתם את־אחיהם זה ימים רבים עד היום הזה ושמרתם את־משמרת מצות יקוק אלהיכם: (ד) ועתה הניח יקוק אלהיכם לאחיהם כאשר דבר להם ועתה פנו ולכו לכם לאהליכם אל ארץ אחותכם אשרו נתן לכם משה עבד יקוק בעבר הירדן: (ה) רקו שמרו מאד לעשות את־המצוה ואת־התורה אשר צוה אתכם משה עבד־יקוק לאהבה את־יקוק אלהיכם וללכת בכל־דרכיו ולשמר

מִצֹּתָיו וּלְדַבְּקָהֶם וּלְעִבְדוֹ בְּכָל־לִבְבְּכֶם וּבְכָל־נַפְשְׁכֶם: (ו) וּבְרַכְּם יְהוֹשֻׁעַ וְיִשְׁלַחֶם וְיִלְכוּ אֶל־אֱהֲלֵיהֶם: ס (ז) וּלְחַצְיוֹ שִׁבְטֵי הַמְּנַשֶּׁה נָתַן מִשָּׁהּ בְּבֶשֶׁן וּלְחַצְיוֹ נָתַן יְהוֹשֻׁעַ עִם־אֲחֵיהֶם מֵעֵבֶר בְּעֵבֶר הַיַּרְדֵּן יְמֵה וְגַם כִּי שָׁלַחֶם יְהוֹשֻׁעַ אֶל־אֱהֲלֵיהֶם וַיְבָרְכֶם: (ח) וַיֹּאמֶר אֲלֵיהֶם לֵאמֹר בְּנֹכְסִים רַבִּים שׁוּבוּ אֶל־אֱהֲלֵיכֶם וּבְמִקְנֶה רַב־מֵאֹד בְּכֶסֶף וּבַהֶבֶב וּבַנְּחֻשֶׁת וּבַבְּרֹזֶל וּבַשְּׁלֹמֹת הַרְבֵּה מֵאֹד חֲלְקוּ שְׁלֵל־אֲבִיכֶם עִם־אֲחֵיכֶם: פ (ט) וַיָּשׁוּבוּ וַיֵּלְכוּ בְּנִירְאוּבוֹן וּבִגְיָד וְחֻצְיוֹ שִׁבְטֵי הַמְּנַשֶּׁה מֵאֵת בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל מִשְׁלַח אֲשֶׁר בְּאֶרֶץ כְּנָעַן לִלְכַת אֶל־אֶרֶץ הַגִּלְעָד אֶל־אֶרֶץ אַחֲזַתֶּם אֲשֶׁר נִאֲחַזְרְבָה עַל־פִּי יְקֹנָק בְּיַד־מֹשֶׁה: (י) וַיָּבֹאוּ אֶל־גִּלְגָּלוֹת הַיַּרְדֵּן אֲשֶׁר בְּאֶרֶץ כְּנָעַן וַיָּבֹנוּ בְּנִירְאוּבוֹן וּבִגְיָד וְחֻצְיוֹ שִׁבְטֵי הַמְּנַשֶּׁה שֵׁם מִזְבַּח עַל־הַיַּרְדֵּן מִזְבַּח גְּדוֹל לַמְּרֹאֶה: (יא) וַיִּשְׁמְעוּ בְּנֵי־יִשְׂרָאֵל לֵאמֹר הִנֵּה בָנוּ בְּנִירְאוּבוֹן וּבִגְיָד וְחֻצְיוֹ שִׁבְטֵי הַמְּנַשֶּׁה אֶת־הַמִּזְבֵּחַ אֶל־מִוֶּלֶת אֶרֶץ כְּנָעַן אֶל־גִּלְגָּלוֹת הַיַּרְדֵּן אֶל־עֵבֶר בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל: (יב) וַיִּשְׁמְעוּ בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל וַיִּקְהֲלוּ כָּל־עַדַת בְּנֵי־יִשְׂרָאֵל שְׁלַח לְעֹלוֹת עֲלֵיהֶם לְצַבָּא: פ (יג) וַיִּשְׁלַחוּ בְּנֵי־יִשְׂרָאֵל אֶל־בְּנֵי־רְאוּבוֹן וְאֶל־בְּנֵי־גָד וְאֶל־חֻצְיוֹ שִׁבְטֵי־מְנַשֶּׁה אֶל־אֶרֶץ הַגִּלְעָד אֶת־פִּינְחָס בֶּן־אֱלֵעָזָר הַכֹּהֵן: (יד) וַעֲשֶׂרָה נְשָׂאִים עִמּוֹ נָשִׂיא אֶחָד אֶחָד לְבֵית אָב לְכָל מִטּוֹת יִשְׂרָאֵל וְאִישׁ רֹאשׁ בֵּית אָבוֹתָם הֵמָּה לְאֶלְפֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל: (טו) וַיָּבֹאוּ אֶל־בְּנֵי־רְאוּבוֹן וְאֶל־בְּנֵי־גָד וְאֶל־חֻצְיוֹ שִׁבְטֵי־מְנַשֶּׁה אֶל־אֶרֶץ הַגִּלְעָד וַיְדַבְּרוּ אִתָּם לֵאמֹר: (טז) כֹּה אָמְרוּ כָּלָּא עַדַת יְקֹנָק מֵהַהִמְעַל הִזֵּה אֲשֶׁר מַעַלְתֶּם בְּאֱלֹהֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל לְשׁוֹב הַיּוֹם מֵאַחֲרֵי יְקֹנָק בְּבִנְיוֹתְכֶם לְכֶם מִזְבַּח לַמְּרֹכֶס הַיּוֹם בִּיקְוֹק: (יז) הִמְעַט־לָנוּ אֶת־עֵינֵינוּ פַּעוּר אֲשֶׁר לֹא־הִטְהַרְנוּ מִמֶּנּוּ עַד הַיּוֹם הַזֶּה וַיְהִי הַנֶּגֶף בְּעַדַת יְקֹנָק: (יח) וְאַתֶּם תִּשְׁבוּ הַיּוֹם מֵאַחֲרֵי יְקֹנָק וְהִלָּה אֲתֶם תִּמְרְדוּ הַיּוֹם בִּיקְוֹק וּמַחֲרָ אֶל־כָּל־עַדַת יִשְׂרָאֵל יִקְצֹף: (יט) וְאִךְ אִסְטִמָּאָה אֶרֶץ אַחֲזַתְכֶם עֵבְרוּ לְכֶם אֶל־אֶרֶץ אַחֲזַת יְקֹנָק אֲשֶׁר שָׂכַרְשֶׁם מִשְׁכַּן יְקֹנָק וְהֶאֱחָזוּ בְּתוֹכָנוּ וּבִיקְוֹק אֶל־תִּמְרְדוּ וְאַתֶּנוּ אֶל־תִּמְרְדוּ בְּבִנְיוֹתְכֶם לְכֶם מִזְבַּח מִבְּלַעַד־יְקֹנָק אֱלֹהֵינוּ: (כ) הֲלוֹא עָכָן בְּזָרַח מֵעַל מֵעַל בַּחֲרֹם וְעַל־כָּל־עַדַת יִשְׂרָאֵל הִיָּה קֶצֶף וְהוּא אִישׁ אֶחָד לֹא גוֹעַ בְּעוֹנוֹ: פ (כא) וַיַּעֲנוּ בְּנֵי־רְאוּבוֹן וּבִגְיָד וְחֻצְיוֹ שִׁבְטֵי הַמְּנַשֶּׁה וַיְדַבְּרוּ אֶת־רֵאשֵׁי אֶלְפֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל: (כב) אֵלֹהִים אֱלֹהֵי יְקֹנָק אֵלֹהֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל הוּא יָדַע וְיִשְׂרָאֵל הוּא יָדַע אִם־בְּמֶרֶד וְאִם־בְּמַעַל בִּיקְוֹק אֶת־לוֹשִׁיעֵנוּ הַיּוֹם הַזֶּה: (כג) לְבָנוֹת לָנוּ מִזְבַּח לְשׁוֹב מֵאַחֲרֵי יְקֹנָק וְאִם־לְהַעֲלוֹת עָלָיו עוֹלָה וּמִנְחָה וְאִם־לְעַשׂוֹת עָלָיו זְבָחֵי שְׁלָמִים יְקֹנָק הוּא יִבְקֹשׁ: (כד) וְאִם־לֵאלֹהֵי מִדְבָר עֲשִׂינוּ אֶת־זֹאת לֵאמֹר מַחֲרָ יֵאמְרוּ בְּנֵיכֶם לְבָנֵינוּ לֵאמֹר מֵהַלַּכְּם וְלִיקְוֹק אֱלֹהֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל: (כה) וּגְבוּל נִתְּן־לְיְקֹנָק בִּינָנוּ וּבִינֵיכֶם בְּנִירְאוּבוֹן וּבִגְיָד אֶת־הַיַּרְדֵּן אֵין־לְכֶם חֶלֶק בִּיקְוֹק וְהַשְּׁבִיתוּ בְּנֵיכֶם אֶת־בְּנֵינוּ לְבִלְתִּי יֵלֵךְ אֶת־יְקֹנָק: (כו) וְנֹאמֶר נַעֲשֶׂה־נָא לָנוּ לְבָנוֹת אֶת־הַמִּזְבֵּחַ לֹא לְעוֹלָה וְלֹא לְזָבַח: (כז) כִּי עַד הוּא בִינָנוּ וּבִינֵיכֶם וּבֵין דְּרוֹתֵינוּ אַחֲרֵינוּ לְעַבֵּד אֶת־עַבְדַת יְקֹנָק לְפָנָיו בְּעוֹלוֹתֵינוּ וּבְזָבָחֵינוּ וּבְשַׁלְמֵינוּ וּלְאִי־אֵמְרוּ בְּנֵיכֶם מַחֲרָ לְבָנֵינוּ אֵין־לְכֶם חֶלֶק בִּיקְוֹק: (כח) וְנֹאמֶר וְהִלָּה כִּי־יֵאמְרוּ אֵלֵינוּ וְאֶל־דְּרוֹתֵינוּ מַחֲרָ וְאֵמְרוּ רָאוּ אֶת־תְּבַבְּתֵי מִזְבַּח יְקֹנָק אֲשֶׁר־עָשׂוּ אָבוֹתֵינוּ לֹא לְעוֹלָה וְלֹא לְזָבַח כִּי־עַד הוּא בִינָנוּ וּבִינֵיכֶם: (כט) חָלִילָה לָנוּ מִמֶּנּוּ לְמַרְדֵּ בִיקְוֹק וְלְשׁוֹב הַיּוֹם מֵאַחֲרֵי יְקֹנָק לְבָנוֹת מִזְבַּח לְעֹלָה לְמִנְחָה וּלְזָבַח מִלְּבַד מִזְבַּח יְקֹנָק אֱלֹהֵינוּ אֲשֶׁר לִפְנֵי מִשְׁכָּנוֹ: פ (ל) וַיִּשְׁמַע פִּינְחָס הַכֹּהֵן וְנִשְׂאֵי הַעֲדָה וְרֵאשֵׁי אֶלְפֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל אֲשֶׁר אִתּוֹ אֶת־הַדְּבָרִים אֲשֶׁר דִּבְרוּ בְּנִירְאוּבוֹן וּבִגְיָד וּבֵין מְנַשֶּׁה וַיִּיטֹב בְּעֵינֵיהֶם: (לא) וַיֹּאמֶר פִּינְחָס בֶּן־אֱלֵעָזָר הַכֹּהֵן וְאֶל־בְּנֵי־גָד וְאֶל־בְּנֵי מְנַשֶּׁה הַיּוֹם יְדַעְנוּ כִּי בְּתוֹכָנוּ יְקֹנָק אֲשֶׁר לֹא־מַעַלְתֶּם בִּיקְוֹק הִמְעַל הִזֵּה אִזְ הַצַּלְתֶּם אֶת־בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל מִיַּד יְקֹנָק: (לב) וַיָּשָׁב פִּינְחָס בֶּן־אֱלֵעָזָר הַכֹּהֵן וְהַנְּשִׂאִים מֵאֵת בְּנֵי רְאוּבוֹן וּמֵאֵת בְּנֵי־גָד מֵאֶרֶץ הַגִּלְעָד אֶל־אֶרֶץ כְּנָעַן אֶל־בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל וַיִּשְׁבוּ אוֹתָם דְּבַר: (לג) וַיִּיטֹב הַדְּבָר בְּעֵינֵי בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל וַיְבָרְכוּ אֱלֹהִים בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל וְלֹא אָמְרוּ לְעֹלוֹת עֲלֵיהֶם לְצַבָּא לְשַׁחַת אֶת־הָאֶרֶץ אֲשֶׁר בְּנִירְאוּבוֹן וּבִגְיָד יִשְׁבִּים בָּהּ: (לד) וַיִּקְרְאוּ בְּנִירְאוּבוֹן וּבִגְיָד לְמִזְבַּח כִּי עַד הוּא בִינֵינוּ כִּי יְקֹנָק הָאֱלֹהִים: פ

(1) Then Joshua summoned the Reubenites, the Gadites, and the half-tribe of Manasseh, (2) and said to them, “You have observed all that Moses the servant of the LORD commanded you, and have obeyed me in everything that I commanded you. (3) You have not forsaken your kinsmen through the long years down to this day, but have faithfully observed the Instruction of the LORD your G-d. (4) Now the LORD your G-d has given your kinsmen rest, as He promised them. Therefore turn and go to your homes, to the land of your holdings beyond the Jordan that Moses the servant of the LORD assigned to you. (5) But be very careful to fulfill the Instruction and the Teaching that Moses the servant of the LORD enjoined upon you, to love the LORD your G-d and to walk in all His ways, and to keep His commandments and hold fast to Him, and to serve Him with all your heart and soul.” (6) Then Joshua blessed them and dismissed them, and they went to their homes. (7) To the one half-tribe of Manasseh Moses had assigned territory in Bashan, and to the other Joshua assigned [territory] on the west side of the Jordan, with their kinsmen. Furthermore, when Joshua sent them off to their homes, he blessed them (8) and said to them, “Return to your homes with great wealth—with very much livestock, with silver and gold, with copper and iron, and with a great quantity of clothing. Share the spoil of your enemies with your kinsmen.” (9) So the Reubenites, the Gadites, and the half-tribe of Manasseh left the Israelites at Shiloh, in the land of Canaan, and made their way back to the land of Gilead, the land of their own holding, which they had acquired by the command of the LORD through Moses. (10) When they came to the region of the Jordan in the land of Canaan, the Reubenites and the Gadites and the half-tribe of Manasseh built an altar there by the Jordan, a great conspicuous altar. (11) A report reached the Israelites: “The Reubenites, the Gadites, and the half-tribe of Manasseh have built an altar opposite the land of Canaan, in the region of the Jordan, across from the Israelites.” (12) When the Israelites heard this, the whole community of the Israelites assembled at Shiloh to make war on them. (13) But [first] the Israelites sent the priest Phinehas son of Eleazar to the Reubenites, the Gadites, and the half-tribe of Manasseh in the land of Gilead, (14) accompanied by ten chieftains, one chieftain from each ancestral house of each of the tribes of Israel; they were every one of them heads of ancestral houses of the contingents of Israel. (15) When they came to the Reubenites, the Gadites, and the half-tribe of Manasseh in the land of Gilead, they spoke to them as follows: (16) “Thus said the whole community of the LORD: What is this treachery that you have committed this day against the G-d of Israel, turning away from the LORD, building yourselves an altar and rebelling this day against the LORD! (17) Is the sin of Peor, which brought a plague upon the community of the LORD, such a small thing to us? We have not cleansed ourselves from it to this very day; (18) and now you would turn away from the LORD! If you rebel against the LORD today, tomorrow He will be angry with the whole community of Israel. (19) If it is because the land of your holding is unclean, cross over into the land of the LORD’s own holding, where the Tabernacle of the LORD abides, and acquire holdings among us. But do not rebel against the LORD, and do not rebel against us by building for yourselves an altar other than the altar of the LORD our G-d. (20) When Achan son of Zerach violated the proscription, anger struck the whole community of Israel; he was not the only one who perished for that sin.” (21) The Reubenites, the Gadites, and the half-tribe of Manasseh replied to the heads of the contingents of Israel: They said, (22) “G-d, the LORD G-d! G-d, the LORD G-d! He knows, and Israel too shall know! If we acted in rebellion or in treachery against the LORD, do not vindicate us this day! (23) If we built an altar to turn away from the LORD, if it was to offer burnt offerings or meal offerings upon it, or to present sacrifices of well-being upon it, may the LORD Himself demand

[a reckoning]. (24) We did this thing only out of our concern that, in time to come, your children might say to our children, 'What have you to do with the LORD, the G-d of Israel? (25) The LORD has made the Jordan a boundary between you and us, O Reubenites and Gadites; you have no share in the LORD!' Thus your children might prevent our children from worshipping the LORD. (26) So we decided to provide [a witness] for ourselves by building an altar—not for burnt offerings or [other] sacrifices, (27) but as a witness between you and us, and between the generations to come—that we may perform the service of the LORD before Him with our burnt offerings, our sacrifices, and our offerings of well-being; and that your children should not say to our children in time to come, 'You have no share in the LORD.' (28) We reasoned: should they speak thus to us and to our children in time to come, we would reply, 'See the replica of the LORD's altar, which our fathers made—not for burnt offerings or sacrifices, but as a witness between you and us.' (29) Far be it from us to rebel against the LORD, or to turn away this day from the LORD and build an altar for burnt offerings, meal offerings, and sacrifices other than the altar of the LORD our G-d which stands before His Tabernacle." (30) When the priest Phinehas and the chieftains of the community—the heads of the contingents of Israel—who were with him heard the explanation given by the Reubenites, the Gadites, and the Manassites, they approved. (31) The priest Phinehas son of Eleazar said to the Reubenites, the Gadites, and the Manassites, "Now we know that the LORD is in our midst, since you have not committed such treachery against the LORD. You have indeed saved the Israelites from punishment by the LORD." (32) Then the priest Phinehas son of Eleazar and the chieftains returned from the Reubenites and the Gadites in the land of Gilead to the Israelites in the land of Canaan, and gave them their report. (33) The Israelites were pleased, and the Israelites praised G-d; and they spoke no more of going to war against them, to ravage the land in which the Reubenites and Gadites dwelt. (34) The Reubenites and the Gadites named the altar ["Witness"], meaning, "It is a witness between us and them that the LORD is [our] G-d."

6. Shadal on Numbers 32:33:1

(א) ויתן להם משה: עד כאן לא נזכרו בני מנשה, ונראה כי אחר שהסכים משה עם בני ראובן וגד לתת את שאלתם, הלכו בני מכיר ולכדו הגלעד ואז הסכים משה גם עם חצי מטה מנשה שיתיישבו בעבר הירדן

And Moshe gave them. Until now the children of Menashe had not been mentioned. It seems that after Moshe agreed with the children of Reuven and Gad and gave them their request, the children of Machir when and conquered Gilad. Then Moshe agree with half of Menashe as well to settle the other side of the Jordan.

- Did Moshe's education work? Or were his fears realized?

7. Yerushalmi Bikkurim 1:8

תני (דברים כו) אשר נתתה לי לא שנטלתי לי מעצמי. מה ביניהון אמר רבי אבין חצי שבט מנשה ביניהון.

"Which you gave me" - not which I took for myself. What is the difference the half tribe of Menashe.

8. Alhatorah.org

Why did Moshe want Menashe to join?

- **Demographics** – Ramban claims that after Moshe agreed to Reuven and Gad's request, he realized that the land was too vast for just two tribes and therefore offered a portion to anyone who wished to join.
- **Spiritual aid** – R. Saba and the Netziv assert that Moshe was motivated by religious concerns. R. Saba posits that Moshe worried that the two tribes were spiritually deficient (as proven by how their materialism led them to reject Canaan for the eastern bank), while the Netziv has him concerned about the lower level of Torah inspiration in their chosen lands. Moshe hoped that the presence of the tribe of Menashe, who were Torah scholars, would spiritually fortify the inhabitants.
- **Unity** – Alternatively, Moshe wanted to ensure the unity of the nation and prevent the possible alienation of the tribes of Reuven and Gad. By splitting Menashe and having one half settle on each of the two banks of the Jordan, he hoped to ensure that family and tribal ties would connect the two communities.

Different conditions? Moshe had no need to make Menashe's settlement conditional on joining the conquest since it was not they who asked to live on the eastern bank. They had never suggested that they would forsake their brethren, so Moshe had no need to emphasize that they must fight together with them.

Why did they need to conquer the land? Ralbag offers two explanations:

Extra-conquests post inheritance – After Moshe had them join Reuven and Gad, and gave them their main inheritance, Menashe conquered other outlying cities and surrounding regions and annexed them to their portion.

During the war with Og – Though it is first mentioned now, in actuality Menashe conquered the territories earlier, when the nation as a whole fought against Og ([Bemidbar 21](#)). If so, it is possible that the reason Moshe chose them specifically to live in the region was because they were the ones who had previously conquered these cities.

What if Reuven and Gad had remained silent? According to this position, had it not been for the request of Reuven and Gad, the lands east of the Jordan would not have been settled by the Israelites. It is not clear whether they would have remained a barren buffer zone, be used for commerce, or perhaps be shared by all the tribes equally as grazing land.

9. R. Saadia Gaon (Student) Divrei HaYamim 1, 2:22

וכשמת יוסף ואחיו נתחזקו האומות ויקחו גשור וארם שהיו גוים ותפשו את חוות יאיר, ואת קנת ואת בנותיה שלקח נח בימי מכיר גם אותם תפשו גשור וארם.

10. Alhatorah.org

According to the student of R. Saadia, the cities mentioned in Bemidbar 32 as being conquered by Menashe, had actually been originally conquered centuries before, when Yosef was a vizier in Egypt.¹²

Abarbanel brings a similar opinion that Yosef had bought these lands in the time of the famine. At some point, they were conquered by Ammon, and now that this land was returned to Israel's control, Menashe asked for their rightful inheritance to be returned.

Machir, Yair, and Novach – According to R. Saadia's student, the verses refer not to the descendants of these individuals, but to Menashe's literal sons and grandchildren, as they were the ones who had originally conquered the areas.¹³

Why did Menashe want the territory? Unlike Reuven and Gad, these families did not want the territory because it was good grazing land but rather because the region had been conquered by and belonged to their ancestors.

Why wait? Since Menashe's claim to the land and request of Moshe had nothing in common with that of Reuven and Gad, they did not join with them in their petition.

Disproportionate inheritance – The large portion of Menashe is understandable given that they had conquered their territory on their own.

Different conditions? Moshe did not make Menashe's inheritance on the eastern side conditional on joining the Conquest since their claims to the land were centuries old and they were not trying to benefit from the work of others. In addition, no where did they insinuate that they would not join the nation's campaign, and it might have simply been understood that they were planning to help the nation (and the rest of their tribe) in their conquests regardless.

Between Canaan and Egypt – This position raises fascinating questions regarding the mobility of the tribes when in Egypt. Did they really have the freedom to come and go to Canaan, hold possessions there, and even make conquests? If so, why did they stay in Egypt rather than returning to Canaan earlier?

11. <http://www.daat.ac.il/daat/vl/alatar/alatar18.pdf>

- Why are the children of Menashe already names for cities in their lands?
- Why does Bereishit 14:14 say Avraham ran to Dan in the North? In Yehoshua/Shoftim, they inherit around Tel Aviv?
- Based on this, Prof. Yehuda Elitzur claims that in the time of the Avot and Shevatim, they already knew where people would inherit. There were some changes, and people needed to fight for it, but this was the basic set up. The Goral simply confirmed it.
- Rabbi Yitzchak Etshalom expands on this, suggesting that the Shevatim had already settled their land. Hence Yehuda was a leader in his territory, as is evidenced in the Tamar incident. Similarly, the Shevatim clearly were involved in their own enterprises during Yosef story. Perhaps only during the famine did they return to the house of Yaakov.

12. Genesis 14:14

(יד) וישמע אברם כי נשבה אחיו וירק את־חניכיו וילדי ביתו שמנה עשר ושש מאות וירדף עד־דן:

(14) When Abram heard that his kinsman had been taken captive, he mustered his retainers, born into his household, numbering three hundred and eighteen, and went in pursuit as far as Dan.

13. Deuteronomy 33:22

(כב) וילן אמר דן גור אריה זנק מורהבשן:

(22) And of Dan he said: Dan is a lion's whelp That leaps forth from Bashan.

14. Joshua 19:46-47

(מו) ומי הירקון והרקון עסהגבול מול יפו: (מז) ויצא גבולבגידון מהם ויעלו בגידון וילחמו עם־לשם וילכדו אותה | ויכנו אותה לפיהרוב וירשו אותה וישבו בה ויקראו ללשם דן כשם דן אביהם:

(46) Me-jarkon, and Rakkon, at the border near Joppa. (47) But the territory of the Danites slipped from their grasp. So the Danites migrated and made war on Leshem. They captured it and put it to the sword; they took possession of it and settled in it. And they changed the name of Leshem to Dan, after their ancestor Dan.

15. Judges 18:1-2

(א) בימים ההם אין מלך בישראל ובימים ההם שבט הדני מבקשלו נחלה לשבת כי לאנפלה לו עדהיום ההוא בתוד־שבטי ישראל בנחלה: (ב) וישלחו בגידון | ממשפחתם חמשה אנשים מקצותם אנשים בגיחיל מצרעה ומאשתאל לרגל אתהארץ ולחקרה ויאמרו אלהם לכו חקרו אתהארץ ויבאו הראפרים עד־בית מיכה וילינו שם:

In those days there was no king in Israel, and in those days the tribe of Dan was seeking a territory in which to settle; for to that day no territory had fallen to their lot among the tribes of Israel. The Danites sent out five of their number, from their clan seat at Zorah and Eshtaol—valiant men—to spy out the land and explore it. “Go,” they told them, “and explore the land.” When they had advanced into the hill country of Ephraim as far as the house of Micah, they stopped there for the night.