lyov, Faith and Loyalty: High Holidays in the Era of COVID

R' Mordechai Torczyner – torczyner@torontotorah.com



Outline of the Book of Iyov

Chapters 1-2 The story begins by putting humanity on trial: Are human beings loyal to Gd, or only to their own perceived best interests?

Chapter 3 lyov suffers, and responds with furious frustration

Chapters 4-26 Three rounds of debates with visitors Eliphaz, Bildad and Tzofar

Chapters 4-14 Round 1: Taking positions

Eliphaz: Gd is benevolent. Return to Gd, and Gd will embrace you

Bildad: Pain is part of growth

Tzofar: Gd has a plan

lyov rejects their approaches

Chapters 15-21 Round 2: The punishment of the wicked

The visitors criticize lyov more harshly, and argue that the wicked are punished

lyov pleads for their empathy, while attacking Gd more strongly

Chapters 22-26 Round 3: Sharpening positions

Eliphaz and Bildad bring specific charges against lyov

lyov maintains inherently contradictory positions

Chapters 27-37 Closing speeches

Chapters 27-31 Iyov summarizes his experiences

Chapters 32-37 Elihu insists that Gd communicates and is benevolent and perfect

Chapters 38-41 Gd speaks: We cannot communicate

Chapter 42 Iyov apologize, and Gd defends and restores/rewards Iyov

Two surprises

1. Iyov 23:10-12

כּי יָדַע דֶּרֶךְ עִמֶּדִי בְּחָנֵנִי כּזָהָב אֵצֵא: בַּאֲשֵׁרוֹ אָחֲזָה רַגְלִי דַּרְכּוֹ שָׁמַרְתִּי וְלֹא אָט: מִצְנַת שְׂפָתִיו וְלֹא אָמִישׁ מֵחֶקִי צָפַנְתִּי אָמְרֵי פִּיו: For He knows my way; He has tested me, and I emerged like gold. On His path my foot has set out; I have guarded His path, I will not stray. The command of His lips, I will not stray; in my path I have guarded the words of His mouth.

2. lyov 13:23-24

ַ כַּמַה לִי עֲוֹנוֹת וָחַטַאוֹת? פָּשָׁעִי וָחַטַאתִי הֹדִיעֲנִי: לַמַה פַנֵיךְ תַסְתִּיר וְתַחְשָׁבֵנִי לָאוֹיֵב לַךְ:

How many sins and transgressions do I have? My rebellions and transgressions, inform me! Why do You hide Your face, and consider me Your enemy?

3. Iyov 16:9

אַפּוֹ טרַף וַיִּשְׂטָמֶנִי חרָק עלֵי בְּשָׁנִיו צרִי יִלְטוֹשׁ עֵינִיו לִי:

His rage struck, and He hated me. He ground His teeth upon me; my Enemy flashes His eyes upon me.

4. Iyov 13:15-16

ָהָן יִקטָלַנִי לוֹ אֲיַחֵל אַךְ דְּרַכִי אֵל פַּנַיו אוֹכִיח: גַּם הוֹא לִי לִישׁוּעַה כִּי לֹא לְפַנַיו חָנֵף יַבוֹא:

Though He will kill me, yet I will trust in Him; still, I will justify my ways before Him. He will also be a source of salvation for me, for flattery will not come before Him.

5. Iyov 13:7-10

ַהַלְקֵל תְּדַבְּרוּ עַוְלָה וְלוֹ תְּדַבְּרוּ רְמִיָּה: הָפָנָיו תִּשָּׂאוּן אִם־לָקֵל תְּרִיבוּן: הַטוֹב כִּי־יַחְקֹר אָתְכֶם אִם־כְּהָתֵל בֶּאֲנוֹשׁ תְּהָתֵלוּ בוֹ: הוֹכֵח יוֹכִיח אתכם...

Will you speak wickedly for Gd, and speak deceitfully for Him? Will you gain His favour, will you fight for Gd? Will it be good should He seek you? Or as one man deceives another, will you deceive Him? He will surely rebuke you...

6. Iyov 42:3-5

מִי זֶה מַעְלִים עֵצָה בְּלִי דָעַת לָכֵן הָגַּדְתִּי וְלֹא אָבִין נִפְּלָאוֹת מִמֶּנִי וְלֹא אָדָע: שְׁמַע נָא וְאָנֹכִי אֲדַבֵּר אֶשְׁאָלְדְּ וְהוֹדִיעֵנִי: לְשֵׁמַע אֹזֶן שְׁמַעְתִּידְּ וְעַתָּה עיני ראתד:

Who is this who hides [Gd's] counsel without knowledge? Therefore I spoke without understanding. It was wondrous beyond me, and I did not know: "Listen now, and I will speak; I will ask of You, and You tell me." My ears had always heard of You, and now my eyes have seen You.

7. Iyov 42:7-8

נִיְהִי אַסֵּר דָּבֶּר ד' אֶת הַדְּבָרִים הָאֵלֶּה אֶל אִיּוֹב וַיּאֹמֶר ד' אֶל אֱלִיפַז הַתִּימָנִי חָרָה אַפִּי בְךּ וּבִשְׁנֵי רֵעֶיךְ כִּי לֹא דְבַּרְתֶּם אֵלִי נְכוֹנָה כְּעַבְדִּי אִיּוֹב וְהַצְלִיתֶם עוֹלָה בַּעַדְכֶם וְאִיּוֹב עַבְדִּי יִתְפַּלֵּל עֲלִיכֶם כִּי אִם פָּנָיו אֶשֶׂא לְבִלְתִּי וְעשׂוֹת עָמַכֵם נָבַלָּה כִּי לֹא דָבַּרְתֵּם אֵלִי נָכוֹנָה כִּעַבִדִּי אִיּוֹב:

And after Gd said these words to Iyov, and Gd said to Eliphaz of Teiman: My anger rages against you, and against your two friends, for you did not speak of Me properly, like My servant Iyov. And now, take for yourselves seven bulls and seven rams, and go to My servant Iyov, and bring for yourselves a burnt offering, and Iyov My servant will pray for you, for him I will favour, so as not to act with *nevalah* upon you. For you did not speak of Me properly, like My servant Iyov.

The Narrative

8. Carol Newsom, *The Book of Job: A Contest of Moral Imaginations*, pp. 118-125 (somewhat out of order)

Whenever I teach the book of Job, I find it almost impossible to get a class to entertain, even as a hypothetical possibility, that these poems might be true. It seems obvious that stories about the fate of the wicked are patently false. After all, the students can all name counterexamples. For myself, I do not know whether I believe the story told by the friends about the fate of the wicked is true. I do, however, think that it is one of the most complex, difficult and provocative claims made in the book, and that it is not adequately refuted in the way my students initially attempt.

Yet if such statements were intended as universal, exceptionless claims, only a deluded fool could believe them, and whatever the friends may be, they are not fools... What is at stake between Job and the friends is making evident the nature of the world, which each attempts to communicate through vivid evocations...

One cannot convince another of the truth of this perception by means of argument, for the issue is fundamentally one of perception itself. Rather, as [Raphael] Demos says, one can only "evoke" a world, a vivid pattern of a whole... The persuasive power of an iconic narrative does not derive from a simple empiricism. Although it cannot be wholly disconfirmed by experience and remain plausible, the story remains surprisingly resilient in the face of a mixture of conforming and nonconforming experience...

An example from contemporary American culture may illustrate. Consider popular business literature in which the story is told, over and over, of the individual who turns a creative idea into a flourishing business. This is the iconic narrative of entrepreneurial capitalism. Everyone knows that the large majority of new businesses fail, yet the story does not lose its power... That story is seen as expressing the nature and essence of an entrepreneurial society with all the static cleared away...

An anecdote about the success of the wicked cannot explain the reality of this world of values, which is experienced as such every day. Such things may happen, but they are perceived as anomalies, lacking explanatory power. But the story of the wicked overtaken by calamity, like the story of the restoration of the good person, rings true because it is consonant with the foundational values of the society.

Application to lyov

9. lyov 5:17-18

Fortunate is the man whom Gd rebukes; do not reject the rebuke of Shakkai! For He causes pain and bandages; He strikes, and His hands heal.

10. lyov 1:1-5

אָישׁ הָיָה בָאֶרֶץ עוּץ אִיּוֹב שְׁמוֹ וְהָיָה הָאִישׁ הַהוּא תָּם וְיָשֶׁר וִירֵא אֱלֹקִים וְסָר מֵרֶע: וַיְּנָּלְדוּ לוֹ שִׁבְעָה בָנִים וְשָׁלוֹשׁ בָּנוֹת: וַיְהִי מִקְנֵהוּ שִׁבְעַת אַלְפֵי צֹאן וּשְׁלֹשֶׁת אַלְפֵי גָמַלִּים וַחֲמֵשׁ מֵאוֹת צֶמֶד בָּקָר וַחֲמֵשׁ מֵאוֹת אֲתוֹנוֹת וַעֲבֻדָּה רַבָּה מְאֹד וַיְהִי הָאִישׁ הַהוּא גָּדוֹל מִכָּל בְּנֵי קָדֶם: וְהָלְכוּ בָנָיו וְעָשׁוּ מִשְׁתֶּה בֵּית אִישׁ יוֹמוֹ וְשָׁלְחוּ וְקָרְאוּ לְשְׁלֹשֶׁת אַחְיֹתִיהֶם לֶאֱכֹל וְלִשְׁתּוֹת עִמְּהֶם: וַיְהִי כִּי הִקִּיפוּ יְמֵי הַמִּשְׁהָה וֹיִשְׁלְחוּ וְקַרְאוּ לְשְׁלֹשֶׁת אַחִיֹם לְאֵלֹים בָּלְבָבָם כָּכָה יַעֲשֶׂה אִיּוֹב כָּל הַיָּמִים: וְהִשְׁכִּים בַּבֹּקֵר וְהָעֲלָה עֹלוֹת מִסְפַּר כֵּלְם כִּי אָמֵר אִיּוֹב אוּלִי חָטְאוּ בָנִי וּבַרָכוּ אֱלֹקִים בִּלְבָבָם כָּכָה יַעֲשֶׂה אִיּוֹב כָּל הַיָּמִים:

There was a man named lyov in Utz. The man was flawless and righteous, he revered Gd and stayed away from evil. And seven sons and three daughters were born to him. And his property included 7,000 sheep and 3,000 camels and 500 yoke of cattle and 500 donkeys and superlatively great production. The man was greater than any of those in the East. And his sons went and made a feast, each on his day in his home, and they called their three sisters to eat and drink with them. And when they completed the circuit of their feast days, lyov sent and dedicated them, and he woke early in the morning and he brought burnt offerings in their number, for lyov said, "Perhaps my children sinned and 'blessed' Gd in their heart." So lyov did regularly.

11. lyov 19:25

וַאָנִי יָדַעִתִּי גֹּאֲלִי חָי וְאַחֲרוֹן עַל עַפָּר יָקוּם:

And I know that my Redeemer lives, and He will remain standing upon the dust at the end.

12. lyov 10:3

ָהָטוֹב לְדָּ כִּי תַעֲשֹׁק כִּי תָמָאַס יָגִיעַ כַּפֵּידָ וְעַל עֲצַת רְשַׁעִים הוֹפַעָתַ:

Is it good to You that You cheat and that You despise the work of Your hand, and You are manifest upon the counsel of the wicked?

13. Rashi to 42:7, based on Talmud, Bava Batra 16b

הוא לא פשע בי כי אם על אשר אמר "תם ורשע הוא מכלה,"... ואם הוסיף לדבר מפני קושי יסורין אשר כבדו וחזקו עליו דבר. He did not sin against Me other than by saying, "He destroys complete and wicked"... And if he added words, he spoke because of the harsh suffering which weighed on him and overpowered him.

14. Rabbi Shabtai Sabato, Rosh Yeshivat Mitzpeh Yericho, להיות תמים Lech Lecha 5773 (www.kiryatmoshe.co.il) להיות תמים Lech Lecha 5773 (www.kiryatmoshe.co.il) מדוע בחר משה רבנו בתואר אַ-ל אֱמוּנָה ולא א-ל נאמן? מכאן שהמילה "אמונה" מכילה הרבה יותר. לא רק נאמנות אלא גם נתינת אמון Why did Moshe Rabbeinu choose the description "Gd of emunah" and not "Gd who is neeman"? We see that the word emunah includes more – not only trustworthiness, but also trusting.