**Fasting vs. Shul**

*Rabbi Jonathan Ziring: jziring@torontotorah.com*

1. [**Jonah 3:10**](https://www.sefaria.org/Jonah.3.10)

(י) וַיַּ֤רְא הָֽאֱלֹקִים֙ אֶֽת־מַ֣עֲשֵׂיהֶ֔ם כִּי־שָׁ֖בוּ מִדַּרְכָּ֣ם הָרָעָ֑ה וַיִּנָּ֣חֶם הָאֱלֹקִ֗ים עַל־הָרָעָ֛ה אֲשֶׁר־דִּבֶּ֥ר לַעֲשׂוֹת־לָהֶ֖ם וְלֹ֥א עָשָֽׂה׃

(10) God saw what they did, how they were turning back from their evil ways. And God renounced the punishment He had planned to bring upon them, and did not carry it out.

1. [**Taanit 15a:5**](https://www.sefaria.org/Taanit.15a.5)

הזקן שבהן אומר לפניהן דברי כבושין אחינו לא נאמר באנשי נינוה וירא אלקים את שקם ואת תעניתם אלא (יונה ג, י) וירא אלקים את מעשיהם כי שבו מדרכם הרעה ובקבלה הוא אומר (יואל ב, יג) וקרעו לבבכם ואל בגדיכם

**The eldest** member **of the** community **says to** the congregation **statements of reproof,** for example: **Our brothers, it is not stated with regard to the people of Nineveh: And God saw their sackcloth and their fasting. Rather,** the verse says: **“And God saw their deeds, that they had turned from their evil way”** (Jonah 3:10). **And in the Prophets it says: “And rend your hearts and not your garments,** and return to the Lord your God” (Joel 2:13). This teaches that prayer and fasting are insufficient, as one must also repent and amend his ways in practice.

1. [**Isaiah 58:5-6**](https://www.sefaria.org/Isaiah.58.5-6) **(Haftara of Yom Kippur)**

(ה) הֲכָזֶ֗ה יִֽהְיֶה֙ צ֣וֹם אֶבְחָרֵ֔הוּ י֛וֹם עַנּ֥וֹת אָדָ֖ם נַפְשׁ֑וֹ הֲלָכֹ֨ף כְּאַגְמֹ֜ן רֹאשׁ֗וֹ וְשַׂ֤ק וָאֵ֙פֶר֙ יַצִּ֔יעַ הֲלָזֶה֙ תִּקְרָא־צ֔וֹם וְי֥וֹם רָצ֖וֹן לַיקוק (ו) הֲל֣וֹא זֶה֮ צ֣וֹם אֶבְחָרֵהוּ֒ פַּתֵּ֙חַ֙ חַרְצֻבּ֣וֹת רֶ֔שַׁע הַתֵּ֖ר אֲגֻדּ֣וֹת מוֹטָ֑ה וְשַׁלַּ֤ח רְצוּצִים֙ חָפְשִׁ֔ים וְכָל־מוֹטָ֖ה תְּנַתֵּֽקוּ׃

(5) Is such the fast I desire, A day for men to starve their bodies? Is it bowing the head like a bulrush And lying in sackcloth and ashes? Do you call that a fast, A day when the LORD is favorable? (6) No, this is the fast I desire: To unlock fetters of wickedness, And untie the cords of the yoke To let the oppressed go free; To break off every yoke.

1. [**Vaikra 23:26-32**](https://www.sefaria.org/Leviticus.23.26-33)

(כו) וַיְדַבֵּ֥ר יקוק אֶל־מֹשֶׁ֥ה לֵּאמֹֽר׃ (כז) אַ֡ךְ בֶּעָשׂ֣וֹר לַחֹדֶשׁ֩ הַשְּׁבִיעִ֨י הַזֶּ֜ה י֧וֹם הַכִּפֻּרִ֣ים ה֗וּא מִֽקְרָא־קֹ֙דֶשׁ֙ יִהְיֶ֣ה לָכֶ֔ם וְעִנִּיתֶ֖ם אֶת־נַפְשֹׁתֵיכֶ֑ם וְהִקְרַבְתֶּ֥ם אִשֶּׁ֖ה לַיקוק (כח) וְכָל־מְלָאכָה֙ לֹ֣א תַעֲשׂ֔וּ בְּעֶ֖צֶם הַיּ֣וֹם הַזֶּ֑ה כִּ֣י י֤וֹם כִּפֻּרִים֙ ה֔וּא לְכַפֵּ֣ר עֲלֵיכֶ֔ם לִפְנֵ֖י יקוק אֱלֹהֵיכֶֽם׃ (כט) כִּ֤י כָל־הַנֶּ֙פֶשׁ֙ אֲשֶׁ֣ר לֹֽא־תְעֻנֶּ֔ה בְּעֶ֖צֶם הַיּ֣וֹם הַזֶּ֑ה וְנִכְרְתָ֖ה מֵֽעַמֶּֽיהָ׃ (ל) וְכָל־הַנֶּ֗פֶשׁ אֲשֶׁ֤ר תַּעֲשֶׂה֙ כָּל־מְלָאכָ֔ה בְּעֶ֖צֶם הַיּ֣וֹם הַזֶּ֑ה וְהַֽאֲבַדְתִּ֛י אֶת־הַנֶּ֥פֶשׁ הַהִ֖וא מִקֶּ֥רֶב עַמָּֽהּ׃ (לא) כָּל־מְלָאכָ֖ה לֹ֣א תַעֲשׂ֑וּ חֻקַּ֤ת עוֹלָם֙ לְדֹרֹ֣תֵיכֶ֔ם בְּכֹ֖ל מֹֽשְׁבֹֽתֵיכֶֽם׃ (לב) שַׁבַּ֨ת שַׁבָּת֥וֹן הוּא֙ לָכֶ֔ם וְעִנִּיתֶ֖ם אֶת־נַפְשֹׁתֵיכֶ֑ם בְּתִשְׁעָ֤ה לַחֹ֙דֶשׁ֙ בָּעֶ֔רֶב מֵעֶ֣רֶב עַד־עֶ֔רֶב תִּשְׁבְּת֖וּ שַׁבַּתְּכֶֽם׃ (פ)

(26) The LORD spoke to Moses, saying: (27) Mark, the tenth day of this seventh month is the Day of Atonement. It shall be a sacred occasion for you: you shall practice self-denial, and you shall bring an offering by fire to the LORD; (28) you shall do no work throughout that day. For it is a Day of Atonement, on which expiation is made on your behalf before the LORD your God. (29) Indeed, any person who does not practice self-denial throughout that day shall be cut off from his kin; (30) and whoever does any work throughout that day, I will cause that person to perish from among his people. (31) Do no work whatever; it is a law for all time, throughout the ages in all your settlements. (32) It shall be a sabbath of complete rest for you, and you shall practice self-denial; on the ninth day of the month at evening, from evening to evening, you shall observe this your sabbath.

**Halachic Issues**

1. **שו"ת חתם סופר חלק ו - ליקוטים סימן כג**

אמנם לפי לשון השאלה שהרופאים הזהירו מצאת פתח ביתו בתענית משמע כשהם סגורין בביתם אין התענית מזיק להם א"כ יתענו ויהיה סגורים ויתפללו ביחידות ולא יקראו בתורה כי אין זה כדאי לדחות אי' כרת דאורי'

1. **שמירת שבת כהלכתה (א) / פרק לט: דיני חולה, מעוברת, יולדת ומינקת ביום-הכיפורים / דינים כלליים בענין יום-הכיפורים**

אדם חלש שקשה לו לצום וללכת לבית-הכנסת, מוטב שיצום וישכב במיטה, ואין לו כל היתר לאכול ולשתות, אפילו בשיעורים כדי שיהיה לו כח ללכת לבית-הכנסת. ומצוה הוא עושה כאשר הוא נשאר בביתו ושוכב במיטה, כדי שיוכל לצום כדין.

**הערה:** ושמעתי מהגרש"ז אויערבך זצ"ל, דגם מי שמותר לו לשתות פחות מכשיעור, מ"מ אף כדי להימנע רק פעם אחת בלבד משתיה של פחות מכשיעור, עדיף טפי לשכב בבית ולא להתפלל בציבור.

1. **הליכות שלמה (יו"כ פרק ד)**

והרוה רבנו בענין זה שאם ע"י הטפול בילדים בבית יש לחוש שתזדקק האשה לשתות, על הבעל להשאר בבית ולעזור בטפולם אם אין אחר שיעשה כן

1. **Rabbi Ari Zivitofsky:**https://www.ou.org/torah/machshava/tzarich-iyun/tzarich\_iyun\_leather\_and\_fasting\_on\_yom\_kippur/

**Misconception:** It is preferable to eat a little and then spend Yom Kippur day in shul davening rather than stay at home in bed fasting.

**Fact:** Fasting is unquestionably the preferred option.

**Background:**Fasting on Yom Kippur is a Biblical requirement, while praying the entire day is, at most, a long-standing custom, albeit one with a lot of significance…

In contemporary society, Yom Kippur is equated in many people’s minds with an all-day (or a nearly all-day) synagogue service. However, it was not always that way. In ancient times, the central Yom Kippur rite was the service performed in the Temple by the high priest.… It was only post-Churban that the prayer service took on greater significance.

Throughout the ages and the changing methods of worship on Yom Kippur, the one thing that has always remained constant is the Biblical injunction “to afflict oneself” by abstaining from the five specific sources of comfort, including the most significant, not eating or drinking. This hierarchy of priorities is reflected in an observation by Rabbi Avigdor Nebenzahl,former chief rabbi of the Old City in Jerusalem, that despite the importance of the final climactic prayer service of Neilah, one should not exert oneself (to stand, for example) to the degree that he will then have to break the fast early, or worse, have to go to the hospital. There is no point in expending extra effort during Neilah if it undermines the Biblical fast.

Similarly, Rabbi Yehoshua Neuwirth (Shemirat Shabbat Kehilchata 39:28, cited in Nishmat Avraham, vol. 1, p. 306) states that someone who is weak, such that the fast will be difficult for him if he goes to shul, is obligated to fast and should stay in bed and not eat or drink even small amounts that are less than the punishable quantities (the size of a large date for food and a cheekful of liquid). In a footnote, he cites this in the name of the Chatam Sofer (Shu”t 6:23), who notes that even a small amount of food or drink, termed chatzi shiur, is a Biblical prohibition (for a healthy person). Rabbi Neuwirth also quotes what he heard from Rabbi Auerbach regarding one who is already permitted to drink small quantities throughout Yom Kippur because of illness: If remaining in bed will reduce the number of instances of drinking, even by one, then it is preferable to stay in bed rather than daven with a minyan. This was reprinted in the subsequently published Halichot Shlomo (Moadim: Tishrei-Adar, 4:6), where it is stressed (ibid., note tet) that this is true according to all opinions because fasting is the “mitzvah of the day,” and in comparison, the mitzvah of communal prayer is relatively insignificant. Furthermore, (ibid., note 23, cited from Nishmat Avraham, vol. 5, p. 50) in practice Rabbi Auerbach instructed pregnant women to remain at home if the effort of attending shul would cause them to eat or drink, or even increase the amount they would drink if they were already drinking.

Rabbi Auerbach (ibid., note 24, cited from Nishmat Avraham, ibid.) expanded this idea and stated that if caring for the children would cause a woman to eat, then her husband is obligated to remain at home and assist with the children. He explained that this is because the husband shares his wife’s obligations. This would apparently not apply to others. Thus, if a single mother (or a woman whose husband is out of town[4]) will have to break her fast because of the effort involved in caring for her children, a neighbor would not be obligated to forgo shul attendance to help with the children so that she does not break her fast (although it would probably not be prohibited for him or her to do so)….

None of this is meant to minimize the all-day communal prayer service in shul. The praying in shul, the service in the Beit Hamikdash, and the fasting, all have one goal –to bring one closer to God and lead one to teshuvah. It is not just about abstaining from food; it is about repentance (I Samuel 7:6) and experiencing a spiritual awakening (Yoel 2:12). This message is included in the haftarah of Yom Kippur itself (Isaiah 58:5-6; cf. Mishnah Ta’anit 2:1, based on Yonah 3:6). Thus, while the fast must be observed in all its technical details, we must bear in mind that the fast is the means, not the goal. It is a tool that serves the ultimate purpose of repentance. May we all have a healthy fast and may our prayers be answered, whether they are recited in the synagogue or at home.

Notes  
2. There is no halachic authority who rules otherwise, but it is worth noting that it is not as simple as I have presented it. Dr. Avraham Avraham (Nishmat Avraham, vol. 4, pp. 81-83), for example, questions this halachah based on the ruling regarding setting sail on erev Shabbat for the purpose of a mitzvah (OC 248:1; MB, ibid:2).

1. [**Mishneh Torah, Shevitat Asor of Tishrei 1:1**](https://www.sefaria.org/Mishneh_Torah,_Rest_on_the_Tenth_of_Tishrei.1.1)**, 4-6**

(א) מִצְוַת עֲשֵׂה לִשְׁבֹּת מִמְּלָאכָה בֶּעָשׂוֹר לַחֹדֶשׁ הַשְּׁבִיעִי שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר (ויקרא כג לב) "שַׁבַּת שַׁבָּתוֹן הוּא לָכֶם". …

(ד) מִצְוַת עֲשֵׂה אַחֶרֶת יֵשׁ בְּיוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים וְהִיא לִשְׁבֹּת בּוֹ מֵאֲכִילָה וּשְׁתִיָּה שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר (ויקרא טז כט) "תְּעַנּוּ אֶת נַפְשֹׁתֵיכֶם". מִפִּי הַשְּׁמוּעָה לָמְדוּ אֵי זֶה הוּא עִנּוּי שֶׁהוּא לַנֶּפֶשׁ זֶה הַצּוֹם. וְכָל הַצָּם בּוֹ קִיֵּם מִצְוַת עֲשֵׂה. וְכָל הָאוֹכֵל וְשׁוֹתֶה בּוֹ בִּטֵּל מִצְוַת עֲשֵׂה וְעָבַר עַל לֹא תַּעֲשֶׂה שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר (ויקרא כג כט) "כִּי כָל הַנֶּפֶשׁ אֲשֶׁר לֹא תְעֻנֶּה בְּעֶצֶם הַיּוֹם הַזֶּה וְנִכְרְתָה". מֵאַחַר שֶׁעָנַשׁ הַכָּתוּב כָּרֵת לְמִי שֶׁלֹּא נִתְעַנָּה לָמַדְנוּ שֶׁמֻּזְהָרִין אָנוּ בּוֹ עַל אֲכִילָה וּשְׁתִיָּה. וְכָל הָאוֹכֵל אוֹ הַשּׁוֹתֶה בּוֹ בְּשׁוֹגֵג חַיָּב קָרְבַּן חַטָּאת קְבוּעָה:

(ה) וְכֵן לָמַדְנוּ מִפִּי הַשְּׁמוּעָה שֶׁאָסוּר לִרְחֹץ בּוֹ אוֹ לָסוּךְ אוֹ לִנְעל אֶת הַסַּנְדָּל אוֹ לִבְעל. וּמִצְוָה לִשְׁבֹּת מִכָּל אֵלּוּ כְּדֶרֶךְ שֶׁשּׁוֹבֵת מַאֲכִילָה וּשְׁתִיָּה שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר (ויקרא טז לא) (ויקרא כג לב) שַׁבַּת שַׁבָּתוֹן שַׁבָּת לְעִנְיַן (אֲכִילָה) וְשַׁבָּתוֹן לְעִנְיָנִים אֵלּוּ. וְאֵין חַיָּבִין כָּרֵת אוֹ קָרְבָּן אֶלָּא עַל אֲכִילָה וּשְׁתִיָּה. אֲבָל אִם רָחַץ אוֹ סָךְ אוֹ נָעַל אוֹ בָּעַל מַכִּין אוֹתוֹ מַכַּת מַרְדּוּת:

(ו) כְּשֵׁם שֶׁשְּׁבוּת מְלָאכָה בּוֹ בֵּין בַּיּוֹם וּבֵין בַּלַּיְלָה כָּךְ שְׁבוּת לְעִנּוּי בֵּין בַּיּוֹם בֵּין בַּלַּיְלָה. וְצָרִיךְ לְהוֹסִיף מֵחל עַל הַקֹּדֶשׁ בִּכְנִיסָתוֹ וּבִיצִיאָתוֹ שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר (ויקרא כג לב) "וְעִנִּיתֶם אֶת נַפְשֹׁתֵיכֶם בְּתִשְׁעָה לַחֹדֶשׁ בָּעֶרֶב". כְּלוֹמַר הַתְחֵיל לָצוּם וּלְהִתְעַנּוֹת מֵעֶרֶב תִּשְׁעָה הַסָּמוּךְ לַעֲשִׂירִי. וְכֵן בַּיְצִיאָה שׁוֹהָה בְּעִנּוּיוֹ מְעַט מִלֵּיל אַחַד עָשָׂר סָמוּךְ לַעֲשִׂירִי שֶׁנֶּאֱמַר מֵעֶרֶב וְעַד עֶרֶב (ויקרא כג לב) "תִּשְׁבְּתוּ שַׁבַּתְּכֶם":

(1) There is a positive commandment to rest from labor on the 10th of the seventh month [Tishrei], as it says, "it shall be a Sabbath of rest for you."…

(4) There is another positive commandment on the Day of Atonement, namely to rest [i.e. refrain] from eating and drinking, as it says, "you shall afflict your souls [i.e. yourselves]." From the oral tradition, they [the rabbis] have learned: what is an affliction to the soul? Fasting. Anyone who fasts on it fulfilled a positive commandment. Anyone who eats and drinks on it failed to perform a positive commandment and violated a negative commandment, as it says "for any soul who is not afflicted on this very day will be cut off." From the fact that the verse gave one who did not fast the punishment of excision, we have learned that we are forbidden to eat and drink on it. And anyone who eats or drinks on it unintentionally must bring a set sin-offering.

(5) We have also learned from the oral tradition that it is forbidden to wash [one's body], anoint oneself, wear shoes, or have sexual relations on it. And it is a commandment to refrain from all of these [activities] in the same manner that one refrains from eating and drinking, as it says "a Sabbath of rest," a Sabbath for the matter of eating, rest for these [other] matters. One is not liable to excision or an offering except for eating and drinking. But if one washed, anointed, put on shoes, or had relations, he is given rabbinic lashes.

(6) In the same manner that resting from labor applies during the day and at night, so too refraining for the other prohibitions of affliction applies during the day and at night. One must add from the profane to the holy by starting the Day of Atonement while it is still day and ending it later than nightfall, as it says "and you shall afflict your souls on the 9th of the month, in the evening." Meaning to say, begin to fast and afflict oneself from the evening of the 9th which is close to the 10th [i.e. the evening before the 10th]. So too, at its departure, delay in his affliction a short while in the night of the 11th that is close to the 10th [i.e. the night after the 10th], as it says "from evening to evening, you shall rest your Sabbath."

1. [**Mishneh Torah, Service on the Day of Atonement 3:7**](https://www.sefaria.org/Mishneh_Torah,_Service_on_the_Day_of_Atonement.3.7)

וְסֻכּוֹת הָיוּ עוֹשִׂין מִירוּשָׁלַיִם עַד תְּחִלַּת הַמִּדְבָּר. וְשׁוֹבֵת אִישׁ אֶחָד אוֹ אֲנָשִׁים הַרְבֵּה בְּכָל סֻכָּה וְסֻכָּה מֵהֶן כְּדֵי שֶׁיִּהְיוּ מְלַוִּין אוֹתוֹ מִסֻּכָּה לְסֻכָּה. עַל כָּל סֻכָּה וְסֻכָּה אוֹמְרִין לוֹ הֲרֵי מָזוֹן וַהֲרֵי מַיִם. אִם כָּשַׁל כֹּחוֹ וְצָרִיךְ לֶאֱכל אוֹכֵל. וּמֵעוֹלָם לֹא הֻצְרַךְ אָדָם לְכָךְ

[Re: sending the Sair L’Azazel]… and they would make sukkos from yerushalayim until the beginning of the desert, and one man or many men would rest in each sukkah, so that they would be accompanying him from sukkah to sukkah. At every sukkah they would say to him, here is food and here is water and if his strength weakened and he needed to eat, he would eat--but never did any man need that.

1. [**Yoma 85b**](https://www.sefaria.org/Yoma.85b.7-8)

**מתני׳** … מיתה ויוה"כ מכפרין עם התשובה תשובה מכפרת על עבירות קלות על עשה ועל לא תעשה ועל החמורות הוא תולה עד שיבא יוה"כ ויכפר האומר אחטא ואשוב אחטא ואשוב אין מספיקין בידו לעשות תשובה אחטא ויוה"כ מכפר אין יוה"כ מכפר עבירות שבין אדם למקום יוה"כ מכפר עבירות שבין אדם לחבירו אין יוה"כ מכפר עד שירצה את חבירו דרש ר' אלעזר בן עזריה (ויקרא טז, ל) מכל חטאתיכם לפני יקוק תטהרו עבירות שבין אדם למקום יוה"כ מכפר עבירות שבין אדם לחבירו אין יוה"כ מכפר עד שירצה את חבירו אמר רבי עקיבא אשריכם ישראל לפני מי אתם מטהרין מי מטהר אתכם אביכם שבשמים שנאמר (יחזקאל לו, כה) וזרקתי עליכם מים טהורים וטהרתם ואומר (ירמיהו יז, יג) מקוה ישראל (ה') מה מקוה מטהר את הטמאים אף הקב"ה מטהר את ישראל

**MISHNA:** **Death and Yom Kippur atone** for sins when accompanied **by repentance. Repentance** itself **atones for minor transgressions, for** both **positive** mitzvot **and negative** mitzvot. **And** repentance places punishment **for severe** transgressions **in abeyance until Yom Kippur comes and** completely **atones** for the transgression. With regard to **one who says: I will sin and** then **I will repent, I will sin and I will repent,** Heaven **does not provide him the opportunity to repent,** and he will remain a sinner all his days. With regard to one who says: **I will sin and Yom Kippur** will **atone** for my sins, **Yom Kippur does not atone** for his sins. Furthermore, for **transgressions between a person and God, Yom Kippur atones;** however, for **transgressions between a person and another, Yom Kippur does not atone until he appeases** the **other** person. Similarly, **Rabbi Elazar ben Azarya taught** that point from the verse: **“From all your sins you shall be cleansed before the Lord”** (Leviticus 16:30). For **transgressions between a person and God, Yom Kippur atones;** however, for **transgressions between a person and another, Yom Kippur does not atone until he appeases** the **other** person. In conclusion, **Rabbi Akiva said: How fortunate are you, Israel; before Whom are you purified, and Who purifies you?** It is **your Father in Heaven, as it is stated: “And I will sprinkle purifying water upon you, and you shall be purified”** (Ezekiel 36:25). **And it says: “The ritual bath of Israel is God”** (Jeremiah 17:13). **Just as a ritual bath purifies the impure, so too, the Holy One, Blessed be He, purifies Israel.**

מיתה ויוה"כ מכפרין עם התשוב: עם התשובה אין בפני עצמן לא נימא דלא כרבי דתניא רבי אומר על כל עבירות שבתורה בין עשה תשובה בין לא עשה תשובה יום הכפורים מכפר חוץ (מפורק עול) ומגלה פנים בתורה ומיפר ברית בשר שאם עשה תשובה יוה"כ מכפר ואם לא עשה תשובה אין יוה"כ מכפר אפילו תימא רבי תשובה בעיא יוה"כ יוה"כ לא בעיא תשובה

§ It was taught in the mishna that **death and Yom Kippur atone** for sins when accompanied **by repentance.** The Gemara analyzes this: **With repentance, yes,** they do atone for sins; **but by themselves,** without repentance, **they do not. Let us say** that the mishna is **not in accordance with** the opinion of **Rabbi** Yehuda HaNasi, **as it was taught** in a *baraita*: **Rabbi** Yehuda HaNasi **says** that **for all transgressions in the Torah, whether one repented or did not repent, Yom Kippur atones,** with the **exception** of **rejecting the yoke** of Torah and mitzvot; and denying the Holy One, Blessed be He; **and interpreting the Torah falsely; and violating the covenant of the flesh,** i.e., circumcision. In these cases, **if one repents Yom Kippur atones** for his sin, **and if one does not repent Yom Kippur does not atone** for his sin. The Gemara rejects this: This is no proof; **even** if **you say** that the mishna is in accordance with the opinion of **Rabbi** Yehuda HaNasi, the mishna can be understood as follows: **Repentance** still **requires Yom Kippur** in order to complete the atonement, whereas **Yom Kippur does not require repentance** but atones even without it.

1. **Yoma 87a**

אחטא ויום הכפורים מכפר אין יום הכפורים מכפר לימא מתני' דלא כרבי דתניא רבי אומר על כל עבירות שבתורה בין עשה תשובה בין לא עשה תשובה יוה"כ מכפר אפילו תימא רבי אגב שאני

It is stated in the mishna that if one says: **I will sin and Yom Kippur** will **atone** for my sins, **Yom Kippur does not atone** for his sins. The Gemara comments: **Let us say that the mishna is not in accordance with** the opinion of **Rabbi** Yehuda HaNasi, **as it was taught** in a *baraita* that **Rabbi** Yehuda HaNasi **says: Yom Kippur atones for all transgressions of the Torah, whether one repented or did not repent.** The Gemara answers: **Even** if **you say** that the mishna is in accordance with the opinion of **Rabbi** Yehuda HaNasi, **it is different** when it is **on the basis** of being permitted to sin. Even Rabbi Yehuda HaNasi agrees that Yom Kippur does not atone for the transgressions one commits only because he knows that Yom Kippur will atone for them.

1. **Rama to Orach Chaim 607 6**

יוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים אֵינוֹ מְכַפֵּר אֶלָּא עַל הַשָּׁבִים הַמַּאֲמִינִים בְּכַפָּרָתוֹ, אֲבָל הַמְּבַעֵט בּוֹ וּמְחַשֵּׁב בְּלִבּוֹ: מַה מּוֹעִיל לִי יוֹם כִּפּוּר זֶה, אֵינוֹ מְכַפֵּר לוֹ

Yom Kippur only atones for penitents who believe in its atonement. However, one who rejects it and thinks “what help will this Yom Kippur be for me” it does not atone.

* R. Eliezer Melamed assumes this is even for Rebbe, based on above.

1. [**Ibn Ezra on Leviticus 23:29:1**](https://www.sefaria.org/Ibn_Ezra_on_Leviticus.23.29.1)

זה מהבנין שלא נקרא שם פועלו וזה אות כי מי שנדע שאינו שומר זו המצוה כאשר נשמרנו נכריחנו להתענות וטעם שלא יעשו מלאכה. שלא תהיינה הנפשות מתעסקות חוץ מבקשת כפור העונות:

The verb is in the passive mood, and this teaches us that someone who is known not to observe this commandment properly must be compelled to fast. We may not labor, so that we will involve ourselves exclusively with repentance.

* Rabbi Michael Rosensweig suggests these laws are meant to make people pull back from the day-to-day.

1. **Yerushalmi Makkot 2:6**

*שאלו לחכמה חוטא מהו עונשו אמרו להם [משלי יג כא] חטאים תרדף רעה שאלו לנבואה חוטא מהו עונשו אמרה להן [יחזקאל יח ד] הנפש החוטאת היא תמות שאלו לקודשא בריך הוא חוטא מהו עונשו אמר להן יעשו תשובה ויתכפר לו.*

It was inquired of Wisdom, "What is the punishment of a sinner?" Wisdom said "Evil pursues the wicked." It was asked of prophecy, "What is the punishment of a sinner?" Prophecy said to them, "The sinful soul shall perish." It was asked of the Holy One, "What is the punishment of a sinner?", and He said, "Let him repent and he will be forgiven."

1. <http://bit.ly/2w8DjCM>: Rabbi Naftali Halperin – if one is weak and can’t daven everything, he should try to say Vidui as that is the main part of the day.