

Melo Ashan Outline

1. Connection between Biya Reykanit and Ketoret Chesera in Kodesh Kodashim
 - a. **Rashi**: ketoret chesera chiyuv is same as biya reykanit. Avudraham agrees. Mori of Tosfot Yeshanim 53a.
 - b. **Q**: Beer Sheva, Gilyon Hashas, Pri Chadash ask isn't that against yoma 53a.
 - c. **Proof**: Yerushalmi seems to be proof for Rashi
 - i. Rejection: Ritva - yerushalmi meant biya reykanit besides chesera. Peni moshe and beer sheva agree. See Tosfot Yeshanim.
 - d. **A**: Answers for Rashi:
 - i. Even Haazel - Rashi meant biya besides chesera. Radvaz.
 - ii. Shalmei Yosef - Chesera is because of biya reykanit
 - iii. Netsiv & Eliya Rabba - machloket hasugyot. Nekudat Machloket: R' Kook.
2. **Rambam** kli mikdash 2:8 missing one of 11 chayav but avodat yom kipur 2:25 says missing one of 11 or mala ashan chayav. Other diyukim in Rambam.
 - a. **Bet Yosef** - biya reykanit in kodesh kodashim
 - i. Does Rambam agree with Rashi?
 1. Yes: kli hamikdash 2:8 according to bet yosef might be like rashi.
 2. No: Pri chadash and mishna lmelech argue
 - ii. **Chazon Yechezkel** - biya reykanit on yom kipur. Bad pitum. Tosfot al chumash like this but Reem not.
 - b. **Radvaz** - chesera in kodesh kodashim, melo ashan is like other simanim
 - i. **Grid** -mela ashan is integral. Why did rambam leave it out of rest of year? ingredient all year; kiyum on yom kipur
 - ii. **Shoshanim LDavid** - in avodat yom kipur he means leaving out min, biyat mikdash leaving out from the shiur
 - c. **Bet Yosef** Part 1- chesera in heichal chayav like nadav and avihu. **Sfat Emet**.
 - i. **Chazon Ish** - we learn heichal from kodesh kodashim that chesera is chayav. Ms"l says chayav in heichal.
 - ii. Proof: Tosfot Yeshanim - chesera is in heichal (R' Elchanan)
 - iii. Tosfot Harosh - chesera in heichal is chayav only for mala ashan
 - d. **Bet Yosef** Part 2 - mala ashan isn't chiyuv mita.
 - i. Pri Chadash and mishna lmelech - it isn't a chiyuv mita all year
 - ii. Q1: What about Rav Sheshet?
 1. Pri Chadash - Rava is last. (problem for azharah)
 2. Ms"l - Rav Sheshet was outvoted
 - a. Tosfot - Rava agreed with Rav Sheshet
 - b. Ms"l - tosfot is wrong. **Tosfot Yeshanim** - chuka doesn't go on mala ashan. Nedukat Machloket: external hechsher
 3. Shalmei Yosef - he meant it is a mitzvah and not chiyuv mita. EH"E - rambam brings wrong pasuk for that! Ben Yadid - ki banan means on yom kipur you need it and it is chayav mitah, but the rest of the year do you need it? Yes vkiseh.
 4. **Griv** - He's talking about heter entry not yom kipur.
 - iii. Q2: What about Nadav and Avihu? Tosfot yeshanim
 1. Pri Chadash - Hava aminah

2. **Ms"l** - miluyim is like yom kipur
 - a. What about the fact that it was in the wrong spot?
 - b. Where was it? Tosfot yeshanim 47a, tosfot 45b, tosfot eruvin 63a, ramban achrei mot - chison// Seforno and rashbam - penimi // Rabbenu bchay - kodesh kodashim
 - c. A: Ketoret nedava is more serious. Based on Chazon Ish
 - d. A: **Meshech Chachma** - chison is like penimi today
- iv. Q3: Why does it apply lechatchila all year? Lekutei Halachot, Sh"l
 1. Fnt of otzer - external heter kenisa.
 2. **R' Rosensweig** - Impacting rest of year, achat bshana bketoret
- v. Proof1: yerushalmi - chayav for missing melo ashan and salt. Beer sheva - opposite girsa. Ms"l - salt is derabbanan. Suka 3a.
- vi. Proof2: Rabbenu Chananel and Rabbenu Menachem
- vii. Proof3: Bet Avtinas
 1. Rejection: Ms"l - that fixed it that day. R' Elyashiv - why negotiate?
 2. Rejection: **Tosfot Yeshanim** - similar species. Shoshim IDovid.
 3. Rejection: Lechem Shamayim it isn't meekev if you don't have it
- e. **Beer Sheva** - chiyuv of biya and chesera in heichal. (Ms"l - Menachot 27b?)
 - i. Is there azhara for chesera? Rambam sanhedrin 19:2. Avodat yom kipur 25 quotes lo yamut ki b'anan wrong pasuk. Lechem mishna asks that.
 1. **Dvar Avraham** - there's only aseh and we don't follow rava. Radvaz, Mahari Kurkus, Chazon Ish
 - a. Ben Yedid and Keter Harosh - ki banan is yom kipur with mela ashan, kishah isn't. r' ashi agrees w rava and is batra. Even Haazel agrees. If so, why are there two pesukim of mita for chesera? Ben yedid - diff of mela ashan. E"n - hava aminah unique to yom kipur
 - b. Maaseh Roke'ach - rambam isn't meduyak with pesukim
 2. **Rav Yerucham Fishel Perlow** - al yavo is for both. Not heichal. Mshupash. R' Rosensweig - it is all about heter biya.
 - ii. Avodat Yom Kipur 2:26 - kosher in heichal chayav bkezayit
 1. **Radvaz** - you took kezayit of it then the rest is chesera
 2. Kesef Mishna - shechutei chutz. Why mita and not karet?
 - a. Chok Natan - we learn chutz from panim for shechutei chutz
 - b. **Or Same'ach** - Yerushalmi says lo yamut goes back to lifnei Hashem. Even haazel - mbet lparochet
 - c. Rabbenu Chananel zev 109 - we learn chutz from penim that it is like shechutei chutz.
 3. **Chazon Ish** - chutz from panim for keteret zara. Keren Orah - ketoret zara like chesera so too in wrong place.
 4. Rav Chaim - mitah of tzedukim.
 - a. Q: why kezayit? why just in heichal?
 - b. Grid - implied from mashan ashan