



Messiah son of Joseph?

1. Talmud, Succah 52a

What is this eulogy (in Zechariah 12:12)? Rabbi Dosa and the Sages disagreed: One said, "For the Messiah son of Joseph, who has been executed." The other said, "For the *yetzer hara*, which has been executed."

2. Kings II 17:5-6

And the Assyrian king ascended throughout the land, and he ascended to Shomron and besieged it for three years. In the ninth year of Hosheia, the Assyrian king conquered Shomron and exiled Yisrael to Assyria, and he settled them in Chalach, Chavor, Nehar Gozan and the cities of Medea.

3. Talmud, Arachin 33a

Rabbi Yochanan said: Jeremiah returned them, and Josiah son of Amon reigned over them.

How do we know that they returned? Ezekiel said, "For the seller will not return to the sold item." Could Yovel have been nullified already, when the prophet testified that it would eventually be nullified? Rather, this teaches that Jeremiah brought them back...

4. Isaiah 11:11-12

And on that day Gd will again send forth His hand to acquire the remnant of His nation from Assyria, from Egypt, from Patros, from Ethiopia, from Elam, from Shinar, from Chamat and from the islands of the sea. And He will raise a banner for the nations and gather the scattered Israelites, and the dispersed of Judea He shall collect from the four corners of the land.

5. Rabbi Abraham ibn Ezra, Commentary to Zechariah 12:1

This portion continues from before, "his sword upon his arm (11:17)", telling when this would happen, and where. Now it explains that this will be when Yisrael returns to Jerusalem with Mashiach ben Yosef. This prophecy is about Yisrael.

6. Rabbi Meir Leibush Weiser, Malbim commentary to Joshua 18:2

For Judah and Joseph, because the shoot of monarchy would grow from them, and so the two anointed ones received their portion first. The rest of the tribes did not receive their portions by [the initial] lot.

7. Rabbi Elijah Cramer (The Vilna Gaon), Aderet Eliyahu to Joshua 16:1

Because Judah and Ephraim are the heads of the tribes everywhere, in the order of the flags, and they were the first kings. And therefore, in the future – may it come speedily – Mashiach ben David and Mashiach ben Yosef will be the redeemers and leaders. Therefore the Jewish nation is called Judah and Ephraim. And therefore, they also took first in the division of the land.

8. Zechariah 12:2, 12:8-14, 13:7

Behold, I will make Jerusalem a cup of poison for all of the surrounding nations and also upon Judah will be in siege upon Jerusalem...

And on that day, Gd will guard the dwellers of Jerusalem, the stumbling among them will be like David, and David like a Divine being, like an angel of Gd before them. And on that day, I will seek to destroy all of the nations who attack Jerusalem. And I will pour out upon the house of David and the dwellers of Jerusalem a spirit of favour and supplication, and they will look to Me regarding the one who has been stabbed, and they will eulogize him like a eulogy for an only child, and they will be bitter about him like the bitterness for a firstborn. On that day, the eulogy

in Jerusalem will be great, like the eulogy of Haddad Rimmon in the valley of Megiddo. And the land will eulogize, each family separately, the family of the house of David separately and their wives separately, the family of the house of Natan separately and their wives separately. The family of Levi separately and their wives separately, the family of Shimi separately, and their wives separately. All of the remaining families, each family separately and their wives separately...

Arouse My sword for My shepherd, for the man who was My ally, this is the word of Gd!...

9. Malachi 3:1, with a comment by Rabbi Abraham Ibn Ezra

Behold, I will My *malach* and he will clear a path before Me, and suddenly, the master you seek will enter his place, and the *malach* of the covenant whom you desire will arrive. So declares Gd.

Rabbi Avraham Ibn Ezra on "My *malach*": This could be Mashiach ben Yosef.

10. Rabbi Tzvi Hirsch Kalischer, Derishat Zion, appendix to Part 2 (explaining Hosea Chapter 6)

He will first make Judea a harvest for you, preparing for you a settled land, and then the ingathering will be great, and afterward, without a doubt, Mashiach ben Yosef will arrive and reign in Jerusalem, and then will arrive Gog, via whom the great Name of Gd will be sanctified, and Gd will be One and His Name will be One...

11. Rabbi Abraham Isaac Kook, The Eulogy in Jerusalem (20 Tammuz 5664)

Just as Gd created in a person the body and the soul, and parallel to them the forces which serve to strengthen the existence of the body in its form, to strengthen and develop it, and the forces which strengthen the spiritual soul and strengthen it – and the height of perfection is to have a strong and properly developed body and a healthy, strong and developed soul, drawing after it with its mighty force all of the strong forces of the body to serve the good and pure mind, the Divine will in His world – so Gd prepared in Israel, specifically, these two forces. The force which is parallel to the human body, desiring the good of the nation in its position and material strengthening, which is the proper foundation for all of the greater and holy traits with which Israel is identified, to be a holy nation for Hashem, Gd of Israel, and to be one nation in the land, a light for the nations. And the second side, the force of strengthening spirituality itself...

Sitting at the gates of Rome?

12. Talmud, Sanhedrin 98a

Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi met Elijah, standing at the entrance to the cave of Rabbi Shimon bar Yochai... He asked him: When will the Messiah come? He said: Go ask him yourself! And where is he? At the entrance to Rome... He went to him.. He said to him, "When will his honour come?" He replied, "Today." [Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi] came to Elijah... he said to him, "He lied to me, saying 'I will come today' and he didn't come!" [Elijah] replied: This is what he said to you: "Today, if you will heed His voice. (Psalms 95:7)"

13. Jerusalem Talmud, Berachot 2:4

Rabbi Yudin, son of Rabbi Eivo, said: There was a Jew who was plowing, and his ox lowed before him. An Arab passerby heard the sound, and he said, "Jew, Jew! Release your ox and release your plow, for the Temple is destroyed." It lowed again, and he said, "Jew, Jew! Tie your ox and tie your plow, for the king, Messiah is born!"... Rabbi Bun said: Why do we need to learn from this Arab? It is an explicit verse: Isaiah 10:34 says, "And the Lebanon will fall to the mighty," and then what does it say? The next verse says, "And a shoot will emerge from the stump of Jesse."

14. Midrash cited by Rabbi Shemuel Eidels, Maharsha commentary to Sanhedrin 98a

The Messiah was born already at the time of the destruction of the Temple, and taken away from humanity to the Garden of Eden.

15. Rabbi Moses Maimonides, Mishneh Torah, Laws of Kings 11:4

And if a king arises from the house of David... If he acts and is successful and he defeats all of the nations around him and he builds the Temple in its place and he gathers the scattered of Israel, then he definitely is the Messiah.

16. Rabbi Moses Nachmanides, Record of the 1263 Disputation, Day 2

We have Sages who have written that the Messiah will not be born until close to the time of the end, when he comes to take us from the exile. Therefore, I do not believe this text's statement that he was born on the day of the destruction...

A generation that is entirely good/bad?

17. Talmud, Sanhedrin 98a

And Rabbi Yochanan said: The son of David will come only in a generation that is entirely meritorious or entirely guilty. In a generation that is entirely meritorious as Isaiah 60:21 says, "And your nation will be entirely righteous, they will take the land forever." In a generation that is entirely guilty as Isaiah 59:16 says, "And He saw that there was no one, and He was desolate for there was none to intercede [for them], and Isaiah 48:11 says, "For Myself, for Myself I will act."

18. Rabbi David Kimchi, Commentary to Isaiah 59:16

...And so, too, when our sages said, "A generation which is entirely guilty," it means most. There has never been in Israel a generation which was entirely liable, without any righteous and good people. Also, "guilty" does not mean liable for destruction, Gd forbid, just that they are not worthy of redemption.

When Israel bears fruit

19. Talmud, Sanhedrin 98a

And Rabbi Abba said: There is no end more revealed than Ezekiel 36:8, "And you, mountains of Israel, your branches will give forth and you will bear fruit for My nation, Israel, etc."

20. Isaiah 49:14, 62:4

And Zion said: Gd has abandoned me, and Gd has forgotten me.

You shall no longer be called 'Abandoned,' and your land will no longer be called 'Desolate,' for you will be called 'My desire is in her.'

21. Rabbi Abraham Isaac Kook, Orot, Eretz Yisrael 1

The Land of Israel is not an external thing, an external prize acquired by the nation, a means toward the end of national unification and reinforcement of the nation's physical or even spiritual survival. The Land of Israel is an independent entity, bound to the nation in the bond of life...

22. Midrash, Pesikta Rabti 26

Jeremiah said: When I ascended to Jerusalem, I raised my eyes and saw a woman sitting atop a mountain, wearing black clothing and with her hair undone, crying out, seeking one who would console her. I cried out as well, and sought one who would comfort me. I drew close to her and spoke with her, and told her, "If you are a woman, speak with me. If you are a spirit, leave me." She replied, "Do you not recognize me? I am the one who had seven sons whose father left to go overseas. While I was yet crying for him, it was prophesied to me, 'The house has collapsed upon your seven sons and killed them.' I don't know for whom to cry, and for whom to release my hair!" I replied and told her, "You are no greater than my mother, Zion, who has been turned into grazing for the wild animals of the field." To which she replied and said to me, "I am your mother, Zion."

23. Rabbi Yissachar Teichtel, Eim haBanim Semeichah, First Prologue

I have learned this from the Torah of our master Moses himself. It is written, 'And I will remember My covenant with Jacob, and also My covenant with Isaac, and also My covenant with Abraham I will remember, and the land I will remember.'... Rashi there wrote, 'Why are they listed in reverse? As if to say: Jacob the youngest is worthy of this, and if he is not worthy then Isaac is with him, and if he is not worthy then Abraham is with him.'

Based on this, one may add that even if all of them are unworthy, meaning that the merit of our ancestors has ended, still, 'The land I will remember,' for the merit of the Land of Israel itself will save them from trouble... She will protect us, to free us whenever we are placed in trouble, Heaven forbid.

24. Talmud, Gittin 57a

"The land of the deer [lit. desire]" is written of her [in Jeremiah 3:19]. A deer's hide cannot hold its flesh [after being removed], and this is also true for Israel: when they live upon it the land expands, and when they do not live upon it the land shrivels.