Rabbi Ezra Cohen

Rabbi, Was I Yotzei: Common Purim Shailas and Their Answers

LMS 5784 2024

Remember: smile, avoid um, slowly, just be yourself

Introduction

* Welcome
* Purpose of this shiur (to proactively address and learn about some of the most practical purim shailas that come up, so that we will know what to do on purim, and also so that we will not only know what to do but understand why, where it comes from, and the differing opinions on the matter.
* Discuss 4 common shailas
  + Not exhaustive
  + Happy to discuss any other purim shailas after the shiur.

Shailah 1: Missed Words During Megillah Reading.

* Most common shailah involves mistakes during megillah reading. Baal koreh skipped a word. Or mispronounced a word.
  + Two separate issues here: Chazzan makes a mistake or skips a word, or the chazzan says everything right but the listener didn’t hear. Both of those will be addressed
  + Mitzvah to read megillah. Yerushalmi discusses the importance (or lack) of mistakes in the reading.
    - **Yerushalmi**- we are not particular about mistakes in megillah reading.
      * Clear some wiggle room, but vague
        + **Riaz**

**Rabbi Yitzchak of Vienna**

Author of or zarua

1200-1270, rishonim

We are not particular about mistakes or omissions, but only as long as they do not ruin the reading (i.e., change the meaning of the sentence or the story).

* + - * + **Rashba**

Based on two sources we can piece together that rashba held that when it comes to a mistake (mispronunciation), like Riaz as long as meaning intact it is fine. But if a word was omitted, even if meaning remains intact, it is a problem.

Also the opinion of the Ran

* + - * + **Tur**

Seems to quote a position that we are not particular, *even* if it changes the meaning.

Peninei Halacha advances such an understanding of the Tur, says it could be opinion of Rambam

But then seemingly quotes the Riaz that as long as meaning is intact it is fine.

**Summarize: 3 potential positions**: 1, mistakes never ruin the reading, 2, mistakes ruin the reading if the meaning is ruined. And 3. Mistakes ruin the reading of the meaning is ruined, and omissions *always* ruin the reading.

Halacha: SA cites two opinions. One, that we never worry about mistakes. And two, that we worry about mistakes when they change the meaning.

* There are other ways to understand the SA. Peri Chadash has a potentially different understanding of SA, but to keep it simple let’s assume this is the understanding.
  + When SA advances two opinions, which do we follow?
    - Big machloket
      * In this case, some authorities (Peri Chadash) argue that maybe the SA isn’t really bringing two separate opinions. And partially for this reason, the authorities rule as follows:
        + YY for **Sephardim** is clear. Don’t worry about it unless there’s **a** mistake that actually affects the meaning of the words.
        + For **Ashkenazim** a little more difficult. MB in BH is not so conclusive. AHS writes that bedieved even a mispronunciation that changes the meaning of the word is fine, as long as you say the basic word structure.
        + Rav Rimon in his sefer on Purim writes that the halacha follows the Rashba, that any omission invalidates and any mistake invalidats when it messes up the meaning.
        + Peninei halakha paskens like this also, that every omission is invalid, and every mispronunciation is valid as long as it keeps meaning intact.
        + **Therefore practically, one only has to worry about a mistake if it affects the meaning. But an omission one always has to be worried about.**
      * It is worth noting that as a matter of practical halacha, this applies equally to the reader as it does the listener. If reader makes a mistake or omits a word, it is potentially invalid following the above guidelines.
        + If **listener**was not able to hear appropriately and therefore even though reader read correctly but you didn’t hear it well enough, some poskim (Bach cited in MA 690:15) are meikil but general thrust is that it follows the same law as the reader.

Lemaaseh; what do I do if there was a mistake in megillah reading. If the chazzan made a mistake that changes the meaning, say so! We will have gabbais and rabbis but sometimes we don’t notice everything so you can call out.

* But failing that, everyone should have a copy of megillah (or actual megillah) with them, and read the missed or mispronounced words to themselves and catch up with the chazzan.
  + This works bc minority of megillah may be read bedieved from anon-kosher scroll.
  + Do you have to read it loud enough to hear yourself (YY: yes lechatchila, but bedieved even if youd dint hear it its fine).

We can now also answer shailah 2, speaking during reading.

**Shailah #2: speaking during reading.**

* If you have to hear every word, it follows that you can’t speak during megillah reading.
  + Therefore **Levush** writes that if the listener spoke and as a result did not hear the reading, the entire reading is nto valid.
    - **MB** says the same thing, though he notes that subject to the above machloket, if it’s something which doesn’t change the meaning there are those who say you are yotzei
    - **Therefore listeners must be careful not to speak,** if they do speak then should do the same thing, catch up privately in their megillah.

**Shailah 3: What needs to be in mishloach manot**

* There are a lot of different questionst hat come up about mishloach manot
  + I think, if im not mistaken, that one of the most common involves what kind of food in them. So let’s go through some of the lahaclot
    - If you look in gemara, basic instruction is **2 gifts to one person**
      * SA paskens this way
        + Deceptive because many poskim add all sorts of other qulalifications.

Most relevant is fodos. Many people like to give littels ancks. A clementne and a bag of pretzels. Maye a Hershey kiss and a laffy taffy in there. What do these gifts need to be? Does that suffice?

**Yerushalmi**: thigh of meat and pitcher of wine not good enough.

Parallel version in the bavli with some differences, according to many authorities Yerushalmi version is more ccurate text.

Ritva: first option was not kavodik enough. We see from here when giving MM needs to be kavodik. Has to be respectable.

Acc to this, a lafy tafy and a bag of pretzels probably woudlnt work.

MB in BH says therefore lechatchila should give something becoming and respectable. Not everyone mentions this requirement so bdieved probably fine but lechatchila should give.

Therefore I bli neder always give a meal’ of food. I’ll give some nice ravioli or sushi and a bottle of wine etc.

* + Other relevant shailas MM
    - Inedible food
      * Some say must be ready to eat, uncooked raw food does not count.
      * Peri Chadash is lenient even if raw
      * **Should accommodate this**
    - Two drinks
      * Some poskim say it is fine, others disagree
      * Lechatchila should be machmir
    - Size
      * At least 3 egg volumes
    - Husband and wife
      * MA: wife cannot be yotzei with husband has to send her own.
      * RSZA: husband and wife can fulfill obligation with joint MM, but it needs to contain four foods instead of two
      * ROY: husband and wife can fulfill even with wo portions
      * Seeminly the receiptient should know that it is coming from both to fulfill obligation
    - Children sending their own (over BM)
      * AHS; required
      * Kinyan Torah: excempt unless they have their own posessions.

**Last shaulah: Davening Sn bentching Under the Influence**

* Assur to daven after rinking even if not drunk. Bedieved as long as not drunk it is valid
* Drunk is defined as unable to speak respectably before a king
* If not drunk, youshould use your judgment to determine that yoe alcohol has worn off.
* When drunk can stil recie berachos before foods.
* **Birkat hamazon MB** writes that best to say Bentching before you get drunk if youre going to get drunk, and if you didn’t then as long as youre full from meal say bentching.
* **If unsire whether tipsy or drunk,** PH says on Purim can be lenient.