



A man's (lack of) credibility to cost his kallah her ketubah of a betulah

- Rav Yehudah/Shemuel: Saying there were no betulim is sufficient to cost her the ketubah of a betulah^{1 2}
- ...
- 1: Rav Nachman had a fellow whipped with spiky palm branches when he claimed there were no betulim³
 - Q: But Rav Nachman said he is believed!
 - A1: Yes – believe him, but whip him for how he learned to tell whether there are betulim
 - A2 from Rav Achai: We believe a man who has been married before.
- 2: A man claimed before Rabban Gamliel that he had not found betulim
 - Rabban Gamliel raised the possibility of relations that shift the betulim aside,⁴ accidentally or intentionally
- 3: A man claimed before Rabban Gamliel bar Rebbe⁵ that there had been no blood
 - Rabban Gamliel bar Rebbe found blood by laundering the sheet
 - Huna Mar breih d'Rava MiPrizkiya asked Rav Ashi about laundering, but Rav Ashi said their laundering wouldn't be strong enough to do this, and their stonewashing would eliminate the blood
 - (10b) Rabban Gamliel responded to a claim of no blood with the barrel test⁶
 - He first tested it on maids who were known to be betulah and non-betulah, as he was not confident in its implementation⁷
 - And he did not want to degrade *bnot Yisrae⁸*
- 4: A man claimed before Rabban Gamliel the Elder (I) that there had been no blood
 - She claimed that this was a hereditary condition called *dorkiti*
 - Rabban Gamliel investigated, confirmed it, and praised the chatan's good fortune
 - View 1: It's unfortunate, as this signals poor fertility⁹
 - View 2: It's fortunate, as there is less chance of a doubtful niddah
- 5: A man claimed before Rebbe that there had been no blood¹⁰
 - She insisted she was a betulah
 - Rebbe realized it was a function of malnutrition; bathing and feeding them cured the problem
 - Rebbe associated this with Eichah 4:8-9 on the "shriveling" associated with malnutrition¹¹
- Tosafot 10a אמר - Oh, and by the way – we don't actually believe the man, ever.

¹ As well as to prohibit them to each other (Tosafot)

² But why, if there is no evidence? (Rashi, based on Rava 10a; and Tosafot אי למיתב)

³ He must have been with zonot (Rashi); He is lying (Tosafot)

⁴ This is consistent with observed biology – see <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6547601/>

⁵ This is the great-grandson of the usual Rabban Gamliel (II). For good sources on this, see R' Aharon Heiman's תולדות תנאים ואמוראים at <https://www.hebrewbooks.org/pdfpager.aspx?req=43956>

⁶ I saw a fascinating explanation for the biology of this test: <https://www.toraland.org.il/%d7%a9%d7%90%d7%9c%d7%95%d7%aa-%d7%95%d7%aa%d7%a9%d7%95%d7%91%d7%95%d7%aa/%d7%a8%d7%a4%d7%95%d7%90%d7%94-%d7%95%d7%94%d7%9c%d7%9b%d7%94/%d7%9c%d7%a4%d7%a0%d7%99-%d7%9e%d7%99%d7%95%d7%9f/%d7%a8%d7%a4%d7%95%d7%90%d7%94-%d7%95%d7%94%d7%9c%d7%9b%d7%94/%d7%91%d7%93%d7%99%d7%a7%d7%aa-%d7%91%d7%aa%d7%95%d7%9c%d7%99%d7%9d-%d7%a9%d7%9c-%d7%a8%d7%91%d7%9f-%d7%92%d7%9e%d7%9c%d7%99%d7%90%d7%9c-%d7%9c%d7%90%d7%95%d7%a8-%d7%94%d7%99%d7%93%d7%a2-%d7%94%d7%a8%d7%a4%d7%95%d7%90%d7%99/>

⁷ This makes sense; as per Ketuvot 36b, the test could not be run on a בוגרת, as the betulim deteriorate naturally over time.

⁸ In the initial trial run (Talmidei Rabbeinu Yonah); In running the actual test on the kallah without a trial run (Chavruta)

⁹ This could be true, if the lack of blood signals polycystic ovarian syndrome (<https://www.womenshealth.gov/a-z-topics/polycystic-ovary-syndrome/>)

¹⁰ Note the line of the Nasi – all three Rabban Gamliel's, and Rebbe. And Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel said ketubah is biblical

¹¹ It is well-established that stress and malnutrition can affect ovulation cycles