



Questions

1. How did Michal marry Palti in Shemuel I 25 and return to Dovid in Shemuel II 3?
 - Approach 1: The marriage to Palti was wrong (Rabbi Yosi, Sanhedrin 19b)
 - Approach 2: Shaul thought that Dovid and Michal were not married now
 - The marriage was based on an error (Sanhedrin 19b)
 - Dovid was a rebel against the throne (Bereishit Rabbah 32:1)
 - Dovid was forced to divorce Michal (Radak to Shemuel I 25:43)
 - Approach 3: Michal never married Palti (Vayikra Rabbah 23:10, Sanhedrin 19b, Ralbag/Abarbanel)
2. The proliferation of death in Shemuel II
 - Uzza (Perek 6)
 - Shaul's family (Perek 21), Dovid's census (Perek 24)
 - Wars
 - Avner and Yoav (Perek 2)
 - Avshalom's revolt (Perek 18)
 - Sheva ben Bichri's revolt (Perek 20)

3. Rabbi Yehudah heChasid (12th century Germany), Sefer Chasidim 500

המוליד ממזר לא קיים מצות פריה ורביה, אדם הראשון היה מסוף העולם ועד סופו ובקשו מלאכי השרת לומר לפניו "קדוש קדוש", כי היה "מלא כל הארץ", בא הקב"ה ומעטו... אמר לו אני אחזיר לך "פרו ורבו ומלאו את הארץ".

One who produces a *mamzer* has not fulfilled the mitzvah of procreation. Adam the First was from one end of the world to the other, and the ministering malachim sought to recite Kedushah before him for he filled the world. Hashem reduced him... Hashem said to him, "I will restore you: Bear fruit and multiply and fill the world."

4. Sefer haChinuch, Mitzvah 34: Not to kill an innocent person

שורש מצוה זו, ידוע ונגלה לכל רואי השמש, כי ד' יתברך בנה העולם וצונו לפרות ולרבות כדי ליישבו לפניו, ומנענו שלא נחריבהו בדינו להרוג ולאבד הבריות שהן המיישבות העולם. ואולם הרשעים הגמורים כגון המינין והמלשינים אינן מיישבי עולם, ועליהם אמר הכתוב [משלי י"א, ו] ובאבוד רשעים רנה, לפי שהן לא יושיבו העולם אבל יחריבוהו בכל כוחם...

The root of this mitzvah is known and evident to all who see the sun, for Hashem built the world and instructed us to bear fruit and multiply in order to settle it before Him, and He instructed us not to destroy it with our hands, killing and destroying the creatures who populate the world. But fully wicked people, like *minim* and *malshinim*, are not among those who settle the world. Regarding them Mishlei 11:10 says, "And when the wicked are destroyed, there is joyous song." For they do not settle the world; they destroy it with all of their might...

5. Life After Death, the mini-series

<https://www.yutorah.org/search/?teacher=81072&collection=8519>

Outline of Sefer Shemuel (fleshing out the Daat Mikra outline of Prof. Yehuda Kil)

I 28:3 – II 1 The End of Shaul

- Shaul in war with the Plishtim
- Dovid pretends to be loyal to the Plishtim
- Dovid and Amalek in Tziklag (Divrei haYamim I 12)
- The Plishtim defeat and kill Shaul (Divrei haYamim I 10)
- Dovid's grief upon the death of Shaul

II 2-4 The House of Shaul and the House of Dovid

- Dovid is in Chevron (Divrei haYamim I 11)
- Dovid's forces battle Ishboshet's forces
- Ishboshet's Avner kills Asahel, brother of Dovid's Yoav

- Ishboshet alienates Avner, who defects to Dovid
- Yoav kills Avner; Dovid grieves
- Ishboshet is killed; Dovid kills the assassins

II 5-8 Dovid Melech Yisrael

- Dovid conquers Yevus, moves to Yerushalayim
- Dovid brings the Aron to Yerushalayim (Divrei haYamim I 13, 15-16)
- Dovid vs. Michal
- Dovid can't build the Beit haMikdash; Natan says his son will do it (Divrei haYamim I 17, 22)
- Dovid's military victories against various nations (Divrei haYamim I 14, 18, 20)

II 9-20 Sin, Punishment, Repentance

- Dovid pledges support for Yehonatan's son Mefiboshet
- Dovid conquers Aram (Divrei haYamim I 19)
- Dovid and Batsheva, rebuke and punishment
- Amnon rapes Tamar; Avshalom kills Amnon
- Avshalom revolts, and is killed; Dovid grieves
- Aftermath of the revolt: Mefiboshet, Barzilai, Unity
- Revolt of Sheva ben Bichri

II 21-24 The Deeds of King Dovid

- Revenge of the Givonim
- Closing accounts of wars
- Dovid's song of thanks
- Dovid's warriors (Divrei haYamim I 11-12)
- The fallout of Dovid's military census (Divrei haYamim I 21)
- Dovid's mizbeiach in the granary of Aravnah of Yevus (Divrei haYamim I 21)

31:1-10 How did Shaul actually die?

6. Shemuel I 31:1-10 vs. Shemuel II 1:1-10

7. Radak to Shemuel I 31:5

כי מת שאול - קרוב למיתה כמו "בצאת נפשה כי מתה" כי לא מת עדיין עד שהמיתו העמלקי... ואפשר כי כזב העמלקי... ולמצוא חן בעיני דוד לפי מחשבתו אמר כן.

"That Shaul had died" – Close to death, like "when her soul departed, for she had died." He was not dead yet, until the Amalekite killed him... Or perhaps the Amalekite lied... And he thought he would say this to find favour in David's eyes.

8. Abarbanel to Shemuel II 4:10

ומדברי דוד בזה יראה שלא הרג העמלקי את שאול.

And from David's words in this it appears that the Amalekite did not kill Shaul.

9. Ralbag to Shemuel II 1:6

ידמה שאחר שנפל על חניתו וראה שלא דקרהו היה שאול נשען עליו בכח להשלים הדקירה וכאשר ראה כי לא יכול על זה אמר לנער העמלקי שימותהו:

It appears that after he fell on his spear and he saw that it had not run him through, Shaul leaned on it forcefully to finish the stabbing. And when he saw he could not do it, he told the Amalekite youth to kill him.

10. Ralbag to Shemuel II 1:9

הרצון בזה לפי מה שאחשוב שהלבוש שהיה לבוש היה משובץ להוסיף לו חוזק באופן שלא יוכל החרב לחתכו בקלות ואמר שאול שהחנית שנפל עליו אחז לו השבץ ולזה לא היה יכול לעבור לדקרו.

Meaning, as I understand it, that the garb was *meshubatz*, reinforcing it, such that the sword could not cut it easily. And Shaul said that the spear on which he had fallen was stuck in the *shebetz*, and therefore it could not cross it and stab him.

11. Rabbi Yaakov Tzvi Mecklenburg (19th century Germany), HaKtav v'haKabbalah Noach 9:5

ומיד האדם. כפל לשון אדם ואיש, גם חבר אליו מלת אחיו. נ"ל כי יש שני אופני רציחה. אם לרעת הנרצח לנקום נקמתו ממנו, או לקחת ממנו וכדומה, אם לטובת הנרצח כשהוא משוקע בצער גדול ויבחר מות מחיים

"From the hand of *adam* [and from the hand of *ish*, his brother]" – The Torah doubled the term *adam* and *ish*, and also joined the word "brother". Apparently, there are two forms of murder: Harming the victim by avenging one's self upon him, taking his property and the like, or benefiting the victim when he is immersed in great pain and he would choose death over life.

12. Rabbi Moshe Feinstein (20th century Russia/USA), Igrot Moshe Choshen Mishpat 2:74:2

וגם אפשר שבן נח אינו אסור ברציחה שהוא לטובת הנרצח ושאינו בזה האיסור לישראל מהאיסור לבן נח
It is also possible that a Noachide is not prohibited from performing such a murder, for it benefits the victim. In this regard, the prohibition for a Noachide may be different from that of a Jew.

13. Wasn't the "son of an Amalekite *ger*" Jewish?

- Yes, his father converted to Judaism (Radak, Metzudat Dovid)
- No, his father was a stranger (Radak, Ralbag)
- No, he was lying about his father's conversion (Abarbanel)

14. Rambam, Mishneh Torah, Hilchot Melachim 6:4, with Raavad

שבעה עממין ועמלק שלא השלימו אין מניחין מהם נשמה...

השגת הראב"ד: א"א זה שבוש אלא שיכול לומר השלימו לקבל המצות.

The seven nations and Amalek who do not make peace – you shall not leave any soul...

Raavad: This is incorrect, but one could say "make peace" to accept the mitzvot.

15. Abarbanel to Shemuel II 1:13

חשב דוד שהנער הזה עם היותו עמלקי היה משרת איש מזרע אחר, כמו שהיה הנער אשר הביאו אל גדוד עמלק שהיה איש מצרי ומשרת איש עמלקי (שמואל א' ל'), וזהו אמרו אי מזה אתה? ר"ל מאיזה אדם אתה, כי ראהו נער וחשב שהיה משרת ומשמש לאדם אחר. והוא השיבו בן איש גר עמלקי אנכי, ר"ל שלא היה משרת אדם אחר, ולא היה לו אדון כי היה עם אביו ועמו הלך למלחמה, ולזה נתיחס אל אביו ואמר בן איש גר עמלק אנכי, ר"ל עמלקי שנתגייר. והנה בראשונה לא אמר שהוא גר אבל אמר "עמלקי אנכי", אולי מאשר ראה את דוד חוקר מאד בדבר שינה האמת ואמר שהוא גר עם היותו כזב:

David thought that this youth, an Amalekite, served someone from another tribe, like the youth who had brought him to the Amalekite forces, who was an Egyptian who served an Amalekite (see Shemuel I 30). Thus he said, "From where are you?" Meaning, "From which person are you?" He saw that this was a youth, and he thought he was a servant of someone else. And the youth answered, "I am the son of an Amalekite *ger*," meaning that he did not serve someone else, and he had no master other than his father, with whom he had gone to war. Therefore he gave his lineage from his father, saying, "I am the son of an Amalekite *ger*," meaning an Amalekite who had converted. Now – at first (1:8) he did not say he was a *ger*, but he said, "I am an Amalekite". Perhaps, when he saw that David was asking many questions about the matter, he deviated from the truth, saying that he was a *ger*, which was a lie.

1:13-16 Dovid shoots the messenger?

16. Abarbanel to Shemuel II 1:14-16

והנה צוה דוד להרוג את הנער העמלקי הזה, לפי שעל פי התורה האומר לחבירו חבול לא יחבול ואם חבל חייב, כמו שהתבאר בתלמוד, כל שכן בענין המיתה, וכ"ש על המתת המלך, ואין מצות שאול אליו ממה שתנצל אותו מהעונש כן, דברי הרב ודברי התלמיד דברי מי שומעין? Dovid ordered the execution of this Amalekite youth, because by Torah law if one tells another to wound him, he may not wound him, and one who does wound him is liable, as per Bava Kama 92a. Certainly regarding killing, and certainly for killing the king! And Shaul's command is not sufficient to exempt him from this punishment; when given instructions by the Master and the student, to whom does one listen?

17. Malbim to Shemuel II 4:10

הרגתיו יען היה "כמבשר בעיניו" ושמח על מיתתו:

I killed him because he was "like one who heralds [good news] in his own eyes," rejoicing over [Shaul's] death.

18. Similar cases Shemuel II 3:28-37, Shemuel II 4:8-12

19. Abarbanel to Shemuel II 1:14-16

ובראותו הנזר והצעדה על ידו שהיה מאמת דבריו, וגם לדעתו שהיה עמלקי וחשב שלהיותו ממשפח' עמלק השתדל להנקם משאול בעבור מה שעשה לעמו

And when he saw the crown and the bracelet on his arm, which verified his words, and also within his thought that this was an Amalekite, he thought that being from an Amalekite family, he would try to take revenge upon Shaul for what he had done to his nation.

20. Rashi to Shemuel II 1:2

יש בפסיקתא שזה דואג ואינו מיושב על לבי:

A Pesikta (to Parshat Beshalach) says that this was Doeg, but that doesn't sit right with me.